

## Reviews

---

*The Cambridge history of Scandinavia, I: Prehistory to 1520.* Edited by Knut Helle. Pp. xx+872 incl. 7 figs, 15 maps and 8 tables+63 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £110. 0 521 47299 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905213283

The latest of CUP's gargantuan *Cambridge Histories* deals with Scandinavia and for once the first volume to appear is also the first volume in the sequence. The definition of Scandinavia reflects the vernacular usage *Norden* rather than *Skandinavia* and the volume covers the history not only of Norway, Sweden and Denmark but also Finland and the Atlantic colonies of Iceland, Greenland, the Faeroes and the Scottish islands although the degree to which the more marginal parts of this vast area are covered varies considerably from contribution to contribution. As with all such collaborative volumes, and this volume comprises twenty-five chapters by twenty-eight contributors, the quality of the work varies considerably from essay to essay. It is particularly regrettable that some contributors, such as Magnús Stefánsson chose to use very few references, leaving the reader to wonder about the evidential base of many of his statements. Other contributors, such as Eljas Orrman, provide plenty of footnotes that will keep the inter-library loan department of this reviewer's university busy for some time to come. Overall one might note the high average age of the contributors: three were dead and a further eight emeritus at the time of publication. To some extent the length of time the volume has been in production accounts for this yet one cannot but wonder to what extent we are really being presented with a cutting edge vision of medieval Scandinavia. One of the most intriguing aspects of reading this volume at a single sitting was the constant awareness that the differences in the history of the three kingdoms, Norway, Denmark and Sweden, might be as much a product of dominant national historiographies as medieval experience. Some of the contributors are aware of this and, for example, a number of them seem somewhat to suspect that the far greater impact that the Black Death seems to have had upon Norway may be historiographical. The narrative of this volume, insofar as it has one, is the tale of the failed unification of Scandinavia. In the Late Iron Age Scandinavians shared a common language and many cultural traits and, in the course of the medieval period, the Danish kingdom came to dominate the whole region in much the same way that first Wessex and then England came to dominate the British Isles. The volume ends, however, with the Stockholm massacre, the act of punitive oath-breaking by which Christian II threw away for ever the hope of enforcing Danish sovereignty in Sweden. In many ways modern Scandinavia is a failed state which has much in common with pre-Viking Age England, early medieval Ireland or Germany before the rise of the second *Reich*.

This volume charts the movement towards unification and the century and a half in which Swedish consensual government prevented the union of the crowns progressing towards a united state. One comes away convinced that Sweden was different and the stumbling block to unification but I am not sure that this book explains why.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

ALEX WOOLF

*Imagination in the late pagan and early Christian world. The first nine centuries A.D.* By Peter Dronke. (Millennio Medievale, 42. Strumenti e studi n.s. 4.) Pp. xiii + 261 + 22 plates. Florence: SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2003. €62. 88 8450 046 X *JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690522328X

This is a quite remarkable book, rich in insight, and broad in its scope. It is not quite what one might expect from the title, but that is probably more indicative of current scholarship on late antiquity and the early Middle Ages than anything else. For it is not so much a book *on* the imagination, as a book that explores how the imagination functioned, what images were felt to be significant and what symbolic value was found in them. Peter Dronke begins with a brilliant survey of how the imagination was understood from Plato to Eriugena, among pagans and Christians. Thereafter he discusses particular images and how they functioned in the world of the imagination. This discussion is arranged in chapters entitled 'Dance', 'The sea', 'Earthly paradises', 'Creatures of heaven and earth', 'Light and fire'. Dronke makes it clear that he does not intend to be exhaustive, but rather to explore the way images have been used in a number of poems (mostly) that have attracted him. One thing that comes through this book is the sheer joy Dronke has found in reading these poems, mostly Latin, but also Greek, and occasionally Anglo-Saxon, Syriac and Coptic (for these latter two relying on translations). One figure to whom Dronke constantly returns is Eriugena, not especially his explicit poetry, but the often rather greater poetry found in his prose works, especially in his commentary on the Arcopagite and his *Periphyseon*. This brings out the strength of Dronke's approach, for he draws attention to aspects of Eriugena missed by a more conceptual approach. The ninth century, with Eriugena and Notker, is the terminus of this work, but this does not prevent Dronke straying into later centuries, especially to Dante, and also to St Francis. Dronke's approach makes his book difficult to review briefly, as the interest lies in the detail, not in any general conclusions. One general conclusion does emerge, to which Dronke draws attention in his epilogue. Both pagan and Christian authors are discussed, and there has been a tendency in scholarship to keep this dichotomy in the forefront of the mind. It is often maintained that Christians had first to confront and defeat the ancient gods before they could make use of the myths about them; that makes sense conceptually, and leads to a conviction that the Christian use of such myths was decorative. But Dronke's attention to the use of images shows that the situation is much more complex, and he demonstrates that Christians, almost from the beginning, made imaginative use of myths and their symbolism. Indeed, Dronke goes so far as to assert that pagan and Christian writers 'inhabited essentially the same imaginative world' (p. 231). By his originality of approach and sensitivity to the ways of the imagination, Dronke has opened up new

methods of exploring the complex way in which Christianity inherited and made its own the classical heritage.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ANDREW LOUTH

*Shifting sands. The rise and fall of biblical archaeology.* By Thomas W. Davis. Pp. xi + 174 incl. 19 figs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £17.99. 0 19 516710 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905233286

Davis's thesis is clear enough: 'Biblical archaeology' in America became so enmeshed with confessional presuppositions that it progressively failed to become a reputable academic discipline in its own right. Its rise began in the 1920s with the orientalist, William Albright, who used archaeological methods to demonstrate the historicity of, for example, the stories of the patriarchs and conquest. Its demise started in the 1940s with Albright's student, George Wright, who used archaeology to illustrate the theological uniqueness of biblical history, being a witness to God's intervention in the world. By the 1970s William Dever, one of Wright's students, argued that biblical archaeology was really another form of biblical studies, and that a different approach with a different term, namely 'Syro-Palestinian Archaeology' was required. Davis's book derives from his PhD dissertation undertaken with Dever. However, if the thesis is clear, its development is confusing. The account of the 'rise' takes up some two-thirds of the book, but the American interest is so interwoven with other archaeological schools – French, German, English – that it is unclear whether their presence is to enhance the Albright/Wright story or undermine it. Only when one reaches the final four pages does the rest make sense. Davis is working on a New Kingdom project in Egypt with J. K. Hoffmeier, author of *Israel in Egypt: the evidence for the authenticity of the Exodus tradition* (Oxford 1996). This explains why Davis earlier affirmed the rigour of Albright's archaeological methods (for example, his use of ceramic typology alongside the Reisner-Fisher method of covering large areas using a grid formation) and why he commended Wright for his use of Albright's methods alongside Kenyon's stratigraphical approach: these methods are important to Davis too. It also explains why he affirmed their need to root the Old Testament in history, whilst criticising their overtly apologetic agenda: it makes Davis's more open-ended, non-confessional, 'maximalist' approach more credible. This in turn explains why Davis accuses (European) minimalists of having their own ideologies, and why minimalist scholars such as I. Finkelstein and T.L. (not T.W.) Thompson receive only two pages, whilst other minimalists such as P. R. Davies and L. L. Grabbe are not mentioned, and why N.-P. Lemche ends up twice as 'Lemache'. The book is really an *Apologia pro vita sua*. All this is fine: confessional theology may well produce important historical observations, as is illustrated by Albright's work at Gibeah and Bethel and Wright's dig at Shechem, and can also create plausible biblical reconstructions, for many scholars still accept both Albright's and Wright's archaeological methods and their proposed dating for the patriarchal narratives in MBI (or, today, EBIV) as well as a thirteenth-century date for the Exodus. The issue is whether the end justifies the means. What Davis advocates is a break with the 'confessional means' whilst still advocating the 'maximalist end'; but such an open-ended, non-biased approach might well place him amongst the minimalist bedfellows he so

mistrusts. I just wish the book had been written with his own agenda revealed first: the development of his argument would have been less confusing.

WORCESTER COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

SUSAN GILLINGHAM

*The Didache. Text, translation, analysis, and commentary.* By Aaron Milavec. (A Michael Glazier Book.) Pp. xxi + 112. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2003. £9.95 (paper). 0 8146 5831 8  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905243282

Milavec's small book on the *Didache*, a brief summary version of a much longer study also recently published, represents the fruit of many years work. The Greek text with English translation is offered here, together with a brief commentary on the different sections, mostly in fairly broad form. For Milavec, the *Didache* is a very early manual of early Christian instruction for Gentile converts. It is independent of, and probably earlier than, the Gospels. It is too a product of oral communication – to be read aloud and heard. Despite theories of different layers in the text, Milavec maintains that the present text (i.e. in the one manuscript we have of the whole text) shows a clear rhetorical unity and cohesion. Some of Milavec's interpretations are rather fanciful (for example his claims to know exactly what went on in early Christian liturgies, with responses and emotional outpourings of joy). And it is not really clear just why the oral nature of the 'text' really matters for its interpretation. Inevitably, the small format of the book allows a number of debated claims only to be stated here: for more discussion, the reader will have to go to Milavec's other writings.

PEMBROKE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

CHRISTOPHER TUCKETT

*What is Gnosticism?* By Karen L. King. Pp. xiv + 343. Cambridge, MA–London: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2003. £19.95. 0 674 01071 X  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905253289

'Gnosticism' as a historiographical concept or category has been under critical scrutiny for some time now, and Karen King's book is the latest instalment of an ongoing debate which has already seen distinguished contributions, such as, for example, M. A. Williams, *Rethinking 'Gnosticism'* (Princeton 1996). Whereas Williams has shown why and how the 'dubious category' of Gnosticism should be replaced by something more adequate, King claims that Gnosticism is 'a rhetorical term' which modern scholarship (her selective narrative privileges the work of German and US scholars) has invested with historical reality (pp. 1ff). After an introduction that sets out some of the difficulties of defining 'Gnosticism' (pp. 5–19), King moves in four chapters from antiquity to the modern age (pp. 20–148). Modern scholarship, she argues, has by and large been unable to escape the spell of ancient hereseology and its viciously persuasive rhetoric. The obsession of hereseologists like Tertullian with the question of origins and connected notions like 'unity, purity, essence, and truth' (p. 36) must be understood as part of the early Christian rhetoric of self definition;

taken as descriptive categories, these stereotypes were to haunt the interpretation of both Christianity and Gnosticism time and again. Adolf von Harnack rehearses the dichotomies of antique hereseology in order to vindicate his neo-Protestant concept of a pure essence of Christianity (pp. 55–70). The ‘History of Religions School’ (R. Reitzenstein, W. Bousset, R. Bultmann) contributed its share of scholarly constructs (for example the myth of the Gnostic redeemer), updated the defence of normative Christianity and succumbed to an orientalist/colonialist discourse which contrasted western universalist rationality with eastern irrational mythopoesis (pp. 71–109). Even the novel approach of H. Jonas’s impressive *Gnosis und spätantiker Geist*, was, despite its innovative ‘methodological shift’ from genealogy to typology (p. 115), still beholden to the heresiological rhetoric of its predecessors (pp. 115–37). King emphasises the importance of the Nag Hammadi finds and is yet aware that the injection of new source material into the discussion significantly failed to change its terms (p. 150). After having demonstrated how the Nag Hammadi writings confound some of the preconceived typologies of Gnosticism (pp. 191–217), King ends with a fiercely programmatic chapter (pp. 218–36) which advocates a historiography of early Christianity that is attuned to our multicultural and postcolonial predicament: the antisyncretistic focus on origins, genealogy, essence shall be abandoned in favour of a historiography that is alive to ‘the ethics of identity construction’, that eschews historical teleology and renounces the narratives of decadence and decline. It should not privilege any one perspective, but should try to represent in a multiplicity of narratives the sheer diversity of early Christianity by focusing on ‘practice’, i.e. on how individuals and groups produce texts, rituals, moral codes that are variously in agreement, in conflict or in whatever complex relation can be perceived (pp. 235f). On p. 115 King writes: ‘In 1934 the German Jewish philosopher Hans Jonas published the first volume of *Gnosis und spätantiker Geist* .... Soon after, matters of world significance would lead Jonas to leave Europe and eventually to take an academic position at the New School of Social Research in New York City. For the remainder of his career he wrote in English.’ The curious euphemism in the second sentence apart, it should be noted that Jonas did write in German after leaving Germany, for example volume ii of *Gnosis und spätantiker Geist* (Göttingen 1954), with its poignant preface, or the *magnum opus* of his old age, *Das Prinzip Verantwortung* (Frankfurt-am-Main 1979).

HAMBURG

WINRICH LÖHR

*An ecstasy of folly. Prophecy and authority in early Christianity.* By Laura Nasrallah. (Harvard Theological Studies, 52.) Pp. xii + 231. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004. £16.95 (paper). 0 674 01228 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905263285

Rupture and negotiation, not linear progress. That is how Laura Nasrallah views her subject matter. She reads Tertullian’s *De anima* and the anti-Phrygian source not as last witnesses of active *charismata* in Christianity, swept aside by ‘modernisation’ and professionalisation, but as powerful contributions to an ongoing debate about the relationship between ecstatic prophecy and philosophy. That debate was a genuinely ancient debate (not exclusively Christian, or even Jewish). Ancient philosophy arose from prophetic ecstasy, as every student of the pre-Socratic movement knows. But in

sharing its roots with western culture itself it is also a genuinely modern debate. The boundaries of rationality are still controversially discussed, in cultural anthropology, in psychology, in politics and in the study of religion. Nasrallah's book is a powerful wake-up call for church historians who might still cherish the idea that prophecy found its ignominious end in the synodal and episcopal condemnations of an increasingly officialised Church. In fact, Nasrallah concludes, prophecy is still with us, not as a charismatic fringe movement, but as a human condition. Of course, all this is not without irony. The much maligned Epiphanius, introduced as a veritable 'malleus prophetarum', shares to a great extent his 'victim's' fate. Superseded by the slick, 'modern', rationalism of the Platonist Cappadocians his own work sticks out like a last prophetic rock in an ocean of a changing Church increasingly in danger of forgetting its archaic roots. This, and a lot more can be learnt from Nasrallah's book. It is highly inspiring, well indexed, kitted out with a useful, slim, bibliography and far less influenced by feminist theory and post-colonial criticism than the dust cover in its inane sales pitch would have us believe.

UNIVERSITY OF CARDIFF

JOSEF LÖSSL

*A history of women in Christian worship.* By Susan J. White. Pp. xvi + 351 + 30 figs.

London: SPCK, 2003. £27.50. 0 281 05647 1

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905273281

Regardless of the historic dominance of Christian men in official leadership roles, including the definition of orthodox belief and the design of liturgy, women's spiritual lives have been shaped by approved practice (as was intended), and they have influenced practice over time (as was often not). White has searched out the activities of women across two millennia and the reaches of Christendom, from Perpetua to P. D. James. She assumes a comparability across time and space that will occasionally jar the specialist. It may be that in the late nineteenth century, for example, American laywoman Charlotte McDowell was uninterested in baptism, but in early modern Europe women were among the godparents of boy babies as well as girls, transmitted their names *via* this rite to the next generation, lifted little ones out of the font in Catholic and Lutheran services, and believed that by baptismal oath and deed they guarded their charges against the slings of Satan. Much more could be said about the retention or abolition, and the ceremony of emergency baptism. Women were interested in baptism. Over-generalisation is thus a recurring fault in this otherwise admirable portrayal of liturgically-related aspects of women's devotion. 'Women, worship, and the Christian household' (pp. 201–41) should not be missed. Women brought ecclesiastical ceremonial into the home, their sphere. Here they and not clergymen inculcated children and servants. They prayed, sang hymns and taught and exemplified proper dying. Literacy was not only a help but lent them added status. Sectarian groups admitted women to more public functions, while the mission fields of all denominations afforded female participants more scope than did the settled home congregations. But in nearly all Churches, both at home and abroad, women found outlets for their musical and artistic talents. Contrary to White's assertion (p. 270), the art of ecclesiastical embroidery has not been completely lost in Catholic lands. Why the treatment of churching, patronage and dissent should be tacked on as appendices is a

mystery. Equally unclear is why women's 'liturgical formation', 'liturgical piety' and 'liturgical needs' should be even rhetorically separated from women's underlying spiritual life. White does not ask anthropological questions concerning the relation of ritual symbol to belief and spirituality. Admittedly, some readers may be relieved that the words discourse, negotiation, transaction and appropriation do not appear. This study is richest in late medieval and early modern English documentation. It is most credible in its assertions concerning that area. Attention to foreign-language literature is minimal. Yet examples drawn from other-than-English contexts are often persuasive and sometimes riveting.

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

SUSAN C. KARANT-NUNN

*Tod und Ritual in den christlichen Gemeinden der Antike.* By Ulrich Volp. (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 65.) Pp. xii + 340 incl. 18 ills. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2002. €85. 90 04 12671 6; 0920 623X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905283288

In 1941 Alfred Rush published his important and much cited monograph *Death and burial in Christian antiquity*. This is a general survey which has its merits and weaknesses as does every work written on a very wide topic. More than sixty years after the publication of this study, the time has come to take a fresh look at the early Christian rituals of death, burial and commemoration of the departed. This has been done by Ulrich Volp. In his dissertation *Tod und Ritual in der christlichen Gemeinden der Antike* (Friedrich-Wilhelms Universität Bonn) he shares common ground with Rush. Volp updates the study of Christian ritual in this area and fills some gaps in previous research. In general, he opens up new perspectives on the rites of death and sorrow in Christian antiquity. The last chapter of the book, in which Volp discusses questions dealing with ritual purity, is an important addition to the themes discussed earlier by Rush.

Volp does not consider the concepts of death and afterlife. As the title of the work suggests he concentrates on the rituals of death. The primary sources for the work are writings of Christian authors from the third to the fifth centuries, although some epigraphic and archaeological sources are used to supplement literary sources. From the viewpoint of research economy there are good grounds for Volp's limitation. Material is abundant and Volp's bibliography (literary sources, secondary works, archaeological sources, inscriptions) runs for thirty-seven pages in small print. However, in the face of the rituals of death one cannot avoid the question of the relationship between beliefs and ritual practices. Although much of the ritual can be understood by concentrating on cultural, historical, social and psychological factors, is it truly possible to understand fully the nature and development of religious rituals if their actual religious content is omitted? Therefore, together with the questions discussed by Volp, one must keep in mind the concepts of death and afterlife, both the teaching of the Christian authors and contemporary popular ideas.

At many points Volp reminds his readers that one must be very careful when describing the early Christian rituals of death and burial. In most cases this theme was not central in the sources. Therefore, one must not read too much into the

spare and often accidental sources. It is not possible to reconstruct 'normal' or 'normative' Christian rituals. On the contrary, the student of the early Church is faced with a ritual pluriformity. However, within the period studied can be seen the emergence of a distinctively Christian ritual based on inherited local customs and traditions. This development of ritual was accompanied by disputes and conflicts.

Volp's dissertation offers a major contribution to the study of Christian rituals in connection with death, burial and commemoration of the departed in the first centuries. The sources collected by the author and the general picture given in the study of the emergence of early Christian practices give the reader an outline of this broad area. The book contains some few photographs and drawings. Data derived from archaeological and artistic sources is in principle an excellent illustration of the building of graves and the cult of the dead. However, the quality of the pictures in the book is unfortunately very poor.

UNIVERSITY OF HELSINKI

HEIKKI KOTILA

*On the communion of Damasus and Meletius. Fourth-century synodal formulae in the Codex Veronensis LX. Critical edition and translation.* By Lester L. Field, Jr. (Studies and Texts, 145.) Pp. xii + 304. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2004. \$69.95. 0 88844 145 2; 0082 5328

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905293284

Lester Field deals here with a text important enough for most of it to be included in Denzinger-Schönmetzer (144–147). It voices the *magisterium* of Rome in doctrine *de Trinitate* as affirmed at Nicaea and on the more recently raised question of the humanity of Christ. The doctrine of God affected the legitimate occupancy of the see of Antioch disputed by Meletius and Paulinus. The upshot of the church-political issue was a temporary compromise giving the throne to Meletius and some right of succession to the equally orthodox Paulinus. There are difficulties about the text: the original Latin survives in Veronensis LX and what is in many respects a very similar, if not the same, text appears in Greek in Theodoret's *History*; the Latin is corrupt in places. The item as it stands in the manuscript is signalled as extracts from an imperial rescript not further specified containing (portions of?) a synodical letter from Rome 'authenticated' by Sabinus the deacon; extracts from the same source of what is variously called a *decretum* and an *expositio vel epistola synodi Romanae habitae sub Damaso papa* as sent *ad orientem* to a synod at Antioch. Annexed are the signatures of Meletius and other bishops ending with the note: 'Similarly the other 146 Eastern bishops subscribed whose subscription to the original is today retained in the archives of the Roman church. Here ends the Roman and Antiochene synod.' So there are many issues raised about the scope and provenance of a text whose genuineness is not in real dispute. Field's view, as I understand it, is that the whole belongs to a rescript from perhaps Arcadius, but more probably Theodosius in connexion with the new polity which affirmed the Nicene standard, the authority of the great sees and the legitimacy of Meletius. In which case the original rescript must have been an odd document containing at least one enclosure if not two enclosures: *acta* from Antioch, plus perhaps from Rome as verified by Sabinus. I find that difficult to believe but it might, I suppose, be so. How did this dossier come to be collected and included in the



manuscript? Probably not, according to Field, through connection with the affair of Apiarius (against Schwartz) and the need for the Africans to know about the canons of Sardica whose presence in the manuscript can be explained differently. Field writes with authority about the manuscript which he has personally examined. Otherwise his book is disappointing. The text is agreed to be corrupt and Field has either not understood or not seen fit to explain why Schwartz and others have tried to emend it. (A crucial point is where, as it stands, Damasus denies that the Word was begotten. Schwartz, followed by Denzinger-Schönmetzer, emends *demus* to *demamus*.) The translation is unreliable. The book deals with much beside the text: with the *Tomus Damasi*, with canonical and conciliar matters. There may well be good stuff here but the book is so cluttered with annotations and is so generally unclear that even if the variegated information that Field re-cycles were correct (as it sometimes is not) and even if the conclusions he reaches were unexceptionable (which they are not) it would be found unusable. The opportunity to increase our knowledge has, regrettably, been missed.

SKELMANTHORPE

LIONEL R. WICKHAM

*The appropriation of divine life in Cyril of Alexandria.* By Daniel A. Keating. (Oxford Theological Monographs.) Pp. x + 315. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.

£55. 0 19 926713 8

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905303289

Keating provides a well-rounded account of Cyril's theology, moving beyond his Christology to focus on the topic of the 'appropriation of the divine life' as it is expressed in Cyril's New Testament commentaries. Keating prefers the term 'appropriation' to 'divinisation', partly because of Cyril's own cautious use of divinisation language, and partly because it better reflects the interplay of divine gift and human action in salvation. In his first chapter Keating examines the recreation of human nature in Christ through his reception of the Holy Spirit, focusing on Cyril's exegesis of Gospel accounts of Christ's baptism, resurrection and enthronement. Chapter ii discusses how the Incarnate Word passes his own divine life to humanity, through the Spirit, in baptism and the eucharist. The question of human agency in the appropriation of divine life is dealt with in chapter iii, with an emphasis on the importance of faith. Keating explains how Cyril balances divine grace and human free will (whilst stressing that Cyril developed no formal theology of grace). This chapter also has a very interesting section asking how the ontological realism of the incarnation and Cyril's claims about human participation in Christ through baptism and eucharist are related to human imitation of Christ as moral exemplar. Keating claims convincingly that a fuller emphasis on Christ's humanity is to be found in these commentaries than in Cyril's 'Christological' writings. In a final section of this chapter he deals with the idea of human progress in the divine life. In chapter iv, following an excellent summary of previous uses of the concept, Keating examines Cyril's notion of participation, drawing the carefully-nuanced conclusion that human participation in Christ means that human likeness to him is significantly qualified. In his conclusions Keating draws together all these themes in a theological analysis and the book concludes with a further chapter comparing Cyril with Theodore of Mopsuestia, Augustine and Leo. The book is very detailed, but written

with a clarity of structure and style which belies its meticulousness. Keating's emphasis on the role of the Spirit in Cyril's theology is particularly valuable. He usually avoids over-systematisation, noting tensions in Cyril's thought (for example over the relation of Christ's individual and representative humanity; and over how God's gift of salvation is transmitted both 'spiritually' and 'somatically'). He resists easy conclusions (for example he denies that Cyril's use of the term 'divinisation' changed merely due to the Nestorian Controversy). However, there is a slight tendency in the conclusions to weave into a seamless whole some threads which Keating earlier argued should be left hanging. In particular, I am slightly unclear what Cyril (or Keating) means by *progressive* sanctification of humanity, and what relation it has to the narrative of sanctification of Christ's human nature. However, these are small questions to ask of a scholarly book which will be a welcome and valuable addition to research on Cyril.

THEOLOGY FACULTY CENTRE,  
OXFORD

MORWENNA LUDLOW

*Renouncing the world yet leading the Church. The monk-bishop in late antiquity.* By Andrea Sterk. Pp. viii + 360. Cambridge, MA–London: Harvard University Press, 2005.

£29.95. 0 674 01189 9

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905313285

Andrea Sterk explains how the choice of monks as bishops for the Eastern Church became first a preference and then in the eleventh century the rule. Successive sections of the book deal with Basil the Great and the emergence, through his influence, of an ideal; with the two Gregories and John Chrysostom who developed the ideal; with its basis in Justinian's legislation and the popularity given it in the Church by historians and biographers; and finally, in an epilogue, which takes us rather rapidly from the sixth to the eleventh century, with the Palamite establishment of the rule. This is a well researched book with useful references to the primary and secondary literature. It is plainly written and reports accurately, and with sound judgement, on persons and principles. The chapter on civil and ecclesiastical legislation is good. The book offers nothing new but picks out and orders clearly what is most worth knowing. The alleged paradox signalled in the title (*'yet leading the Church'*), seemingly one of Peter Brown's less happy suggestions, fortunately plays only a cameo role in the book. In the absence of seminaries and university faculties of theology where could future bishops learn either their religion or the rational basis of their pastoral skills save in monasteries? Renouncing the world at baptism, being in it but not of it was, and is, the basis of Christian life. There is no special paradox about monks being bishops. Sterk is, too, a shade casual with the concept of 'asceticism'. Without *askesis* of some sort there is no Christian life at all, and she does not clearly distinguish the different levels of meaning. These, though, are small cavils about a useful book.

SKELMANSTHORPE

LIONEL R. WICKHAM

*Culte et pèlerinages à saint Michel en occident. Les trois monts dédiés à l'archange.* Edited by Pierre Bouet, Giorgio Otranto and André Vauchez. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 316.) Pp. viii + 608 incl. 38 figs and 4 maps + 66 plates. Rome: École française de Rome, 2003. 2 7283 0670 2; 0223 5099

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905323281

In spite of considerable interest, both scholarly and popular, in the cult of St Michael in the west, it remains less well documented than the cult of St James. The volume now produced by the École française de Rome contains twenty-five papers from the *colloque*, held in 2000 at Cerisy-la-Salle, on three important centres of the cult: Le Mont-Saint-Michel in Normandy, Monte Sant'Angelo in the Gargano and S. Michele della Chiusa in Piedmont, midway between the two. Essentially it is a study of work in progress, well-edited and indexed, and there is no attempt to provide a general framework. Nevertheless the contributions, which make use of new as well as old techniques to examine a wide range of literary, archaeological and epigraphic sources, make possible a more precise dating of the written records and their relation to architectural changes. Both Giorgio Otranto, in a critical re-dating of the two parts of the *Liber de apparitione sancti Michaelis in monte Gargano*, and Pierre Bouet, now preparing a new edition of the *Relatio* describing the origins of the cult of St Michael on the Norman Mont Tombe, point to a close association of the two centres. Bouet and Marco Trotta both conclude that Aubert, bishop of Avranches, sent to the Gargano to obtain relics of the archangel, and emphasise the probable imitation of the crypt of the Gargano by the double nave of Notre-Dame-sous-Terre in Mont-Saint-Michel. Maylis Baylé touches the same theme in a wider examination of the architectural forms associated with the archangel. Chronologically subjects under discussion extend from the late fifth century to the present day. Mural inscriptions on the walls at Monte Sant'Angelo, described by Carlo Carletti, are witness to the widening of the cult as pilgrims from the Frankish and Anglo-Saxon kingdoms came to Italy, even before the crusades drew greater numbers. The tenth century saw the emergence of the great sanctuary church of S. Michele della Chiusa, an abbey of Cluniac observance founded between 983 and 987 with the support of the local ruling family. It stood midway between Normandy and the Gargano and was also on the pilgrim routes from eastern Europe through Aquitaine to Compostella; chapters by Gianpietro Casiraghi and Germano Gandino explain its rise and decline. The Norman settlements in southern Italy encouraged pilgrimages, but Jean-Marie Martin shows that there was no special devotion to St Michael among the Norman nobles there. The strength of his cult was indeed far more general and his place in the liturgy was assured. Many chapters are concerned with the different aspects of the cult; in the early shrines he was particularly venerated as a healer, whereas his other roles as leader of the heavenly hosts, messenger of God, psychopomp and guardian angel were all to become important. Altogether the book provides a useful updating of current research on the cult and pilgrimage of the archangel through some fifteen centuries.

CLARE HALL,  
CAMBRIDGE

MARJORIE CHIBNALL

*Exegesis and empire in the early Byzantine Mediterranean. Junillus Africanus and the Instituta regularia divinae legis.* By Michael Maas (with Edward G. Mathews, Jr, and Heinrich Kihn). (Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity, 17.) Pp. xii + 282 incl. map. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €49 (paper). 3 16 148108 9; 1436 3003

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905333288

This extremely interesting book presents and expounds a hitherto little-known minor work of the sixth century in such a way as to shed light on ideology, religious education and culture in the reign of Justinian and, through Cassiodorus, the medieval west. Junillus, known as Africanus, held the important legal office of *quaestor* to Justinian in the 540s, at the height of the emperor's attempts to force through religious unity between east and west. He composed the pedagogical treatise translated and discussed here with the encouragement of Primasius of Hadrumetum in North Africa, whom he met when the latter visited Constantinople in connection with this doctrinal crisis. The Latin handbook which Junillus produced, reproduced here in the 1880 edition of H. Kihn with translation and extensive introduction by Michael Maas and (for some sections) Edward G. Mathews, Jr, is cast in the question and answer format used in a variety of late antique Christian texts. The first of its two books sets out biblical teachings on divine law, while the second deals with the world and with issues concerning human life. Sent from Constantinople to Primasius in North Africa, only recently reconquered from the Vandals, and the locus of lively opposition to Justinian's policies, the *Instituta* is evidence of the complex religious and political interconnections between the parts of the empire during the first phase of the wars of reconquest. Also part of this nexus was Cassiodorus, who left Italy for Constantinople in the 540s but who later returned, using Junillus' handbook when setting up his own institution of Christian learning at his monastery of Vivarium. Junillus claims to have taken as his model a certain Paul the Persian, who had learned his techniques of exegesis at the School of Nisibis on the eastern frontier of the empire. However the view of Kihn that Junillus' handbook also expresses the teachings of Theodore of Mopsuestia, who was closely associated with the School of Nisibis but whose teaching were condemned by Justinian in the 'Three Chapters' controversy in 543, is here rejected. Edward G. Mathews, Jr, points out that the *Instituta* is in fact 'a simple primer to biblical exegesis', whose interest is pedagogical rather than doctrinal. As such it does indeed by its reference to the practices of the School of Nisibis draw attention to the strange lack of any such provision for Christian higher education in Byzantium itself. Maas's rich introduction puts this unassuming little handbook into a broad context and makes it yield more insights into sixth-century official life and Christian education than its author could possibly have imagined.

KEBLE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

AVERIL CAMERON

*Verleiblichung und Synergie. Grundzüge der Bibelhermeneutik bei Maximus Confessor.* By Assaad E. Kattan. (Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 63.) Pp. lxxv + 326. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2003. €109.90 04 12669 4; 0920 623X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905343284

In this impressive and substantial work, a lightly revised version of his Marburg doctoral dissertation, Kattan presents a very illuminating reading of the hermeneutical method and system of Maximus the Confessor. The book displays considerable erudition and a meticulous reading of the sources: the bibliography, for example, is exemplary as a guide to Maximian studies in general (notwithstanding the minor fault of its rendering of [Jaroslav] Pelikan as Pelican). Kattan builds on the work of scholars such as Blowers and Berthold in emphasising the coherence and systematic nature of Maximus' approach to Scripture. He goes on to demonstrate in very convincing fashion the Christological foundations of Maximus' hermeneutics. Having built up a picture of Maximus' teaching on the triple incarnation of the *Logos* (in the created world, in Scripture and in the person of Jesus Christ) and explored his teaching on the mystical ascent, Kattan shows how these themes come together in the context of a resolutely Chalcedonian Christology. In this perspective, the literal sense of Scripture equates to the body of the *Logos*. As such, it has integrity and irreducibility of meaning. This level of meaning is, however, united at the deepest level with the spiritual or allegorical level. At this deeper level the hidden things of Scripture are revealed anagogically through a process of *synergeia* between man and God – a process founded on the unconfused union of created and uncreated natures affirmed at Chalcedon. What is most helpful about this reading of Maximus is that the two levels of interpretation are presented not in opposition or even in contrast but as aspects of the same self-revelation of the same *Logos*. Allegory in this perspective is not a more or less random phenomenon but rather an approach to Scripture that recognises and proclaims the two natures of the one Christ. Speaking more generally, Kattan argues that Maximus' whole theological enterprise can be summed up as a rooting of Origenian biblical interpretation, Evagrius' ascetic theory and Dionysian mystical ascent in a profoundly Christocentric and Chalcedonian foundation – a foundation lacking in each of the said authors. Overall, this book offers a very valuable set of insights into the dynamic and profoundly Christological character of Maximus' hermeneutics and demonstrates once again that Maximus' work of synthesis was not one of mere compilation but rather an innovative but faithful reappropriation of tradition. As such, this book is certainly to be recommended.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,  
CAMBRIDGE

MARCUS PLESTED

*Titulus: identifying medieval Latin texts. An evidence-based approach.* By Richard Sharpe. (Brepols Essays in European Culture, 3.) Pp. 301. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003. €35 (paper). 2 503 51258 5

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905353280

*Titulus* is an important book, and will benefit a wider range of scholars than the title might suggest. Of its two main achievements, one is subject-specific and the other,

I think, broadly beneficial. Primarily it is a cataloguer's tool, intended to guide compilers of reference works by establishing an 'evidence-based' method for the identification of Latin texts which will preclude many of the deficiencies found in existing catalogues, handbooks, *incipitaria* and repertories. The methodology is not hard to understand, although it may be difficult for some to apply. It is rooted in thorough investigation of the data provided by the manuscript(s) and, where relevant, printed edition(s) of a given text in attempting to fix that text's identity and authorship. Secondary sources relating to the text should always be scrutinised as well. This may seem like common sense, but, as the author shows, bibliographers and compilers of electronic databases have often relied largely or wholly on the work of predecessors, an approach that has inevitably led to the repetition and perpetuation of mistakes (some of the examples cited are quite alarming). Another critical component of Sharpe's method is standardisation of the data provided in reference works. Thus, chapter xiv sets out model entries informed by the evidence-based method (using for exemplars texts problematically catalogued in the past). While these are not advanced as definitive models, in fact they are all that scholars seeking to establish the identity, authorship and status of texts could wish for: structurally clear and plenary in terms of known essential information. The need for such a model presses more firmly with the launch of each new web-based bibliographical tool. This fact, and an undisguised concern for and frustration with the damage that misinformed bibliography is causing, have here generated an eminently constructive and disarmingly justified response. After the method has been explained and demonstrated, a second section (pp. 251–301) lists works of bibliographical reference currently available, along with brief notes on their pros and cons. It is surely in the interests of medievalists who use these works to read this. Indeed, it would benefit many medievalists – and non-medievalists – to read *Titulus* right through, for it is of itself a model of argumentative cogency (as a work whose justification resides in scholarly ambiguity and error is bound to be). This is certainly not an implied criticism of scholarship at large, but rather a recommendation of this book's potential exemplary value.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

JULIAN LUXFORD

*Die Inszenierung religiöser Konfrontationen. Theorie und Praxis der Missionspredigt im frühen Mittelalter.* By Lutz E. von Padberg. (Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, 51.) Pp. xii + 528. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2003. €184. 3 7772 0324 6  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905363287

The subtitle of this substantial volume gives an indication of its scope and content: 'The theory and practice of the missionary sermon in the early Middle Ages'. Lutz von Padberg's text makes it clear, however, that more is at stake than a consideration of the sermons recorded or implied in the primary literature. Sections with titles such as 'Sermons without words' indicate a much broader approach to the subject, and the word *Predigt* can be seen to stand for the whole range of missionary activity. The main title ('The *mise-en-scène* of religious confrontation') captures the dramatic nature of the conversion process – one is reminded of similarly strident titles, such as *The clash of the gods* – but the overtones of the word 'confrontation' over-emphasise the

degree of hostility on the part of the recipients of the Word. For every Radbod there is an Æthelbert or an Edwin, and a concentration on events such as the master-stroke of St Boniface in felling Thor's oak, a dramatic confrontation if ever there was one, obscures the long hours of patient persuasion that must lie behind outcomes such as Coifi's address to the Northumbrian court. Indeed, many of the examples of confrontation in the pejorative sense belong to the post-conversion stage, as priests and bishops berated kings for their neglect of Christian ethics and morality, and especially for their sexual *mores*. The leaders of Germanic society may have been willing to abandon the pagan gods, whose impotence could be demonstrated, but would realise only later that there would be conflict between the Christian concept of monogamy and their traditional marital practices.

The book is arranged in sections, six of which are text; three of these, amounting to just over 350 pages, carry the bulk of the presentation of evidence and its discussion. Section II deals with the background to missionary work, from the missionaries' motivation to practical matters such as the provision of books, relics and diplomatic gifts. Section III, 'The practice and content of the missionary sermon', not only identifies different types of sermon – the 'confrontational' sermon is only one of seven – but discusses the obstacles to preaching and forms of non-verbal witness, such as church building and the exemplary lives of the missionaries themselves. In section IV, 'Theory and practice of the missionary sermon' reviews the philosophy and strategic thinking of mission from Gregory to Liudger and Alcuin, while the part on preaching and politics examines the relationship between missionary work and military conquest, especially in the context of the expansion of the Carolingian empire. The distribution of the archaeological evidence for church building in Frisia in the early eighth century coincides neatly with the then limits of Frankish expansion; to the east of this line Radbod's rejection of Christianity was simultaneously a rejection of Frankish overlordship. Half a century later at Marklô the continental ('Old') Saxons made short work of Lebuin/Liafwine's missionary efforts for similar reasons.

Chronologically, the book begins with Augustine's conversion of the Kentish Kingdom in the 590s and concludes with the final establishment of Christianity in Scandinavia and amongst the north-eastern Slavs in the twelfth century. It excludes the work of the early Frankish missionaries and of the Irish *peregrini*, whose motivation was rather different to that of later missionaries, while the activities of the Irish bring into sharper focus the problems of language faced by missionaries in foreign and non-literate parts, as David Dumville has shown. The author refers to these problems, though not at length. There is little direct evidence for the way in which they were overcome by the missionary preachers. Augustine is known to have picked up interpreters in Frankish Gaul, whose existence was the result of the long-established trade and diplomatic links between the Franks and Kent, though one wonders about the effectiveness of a sermon delivered through a translator. Augustine's need, as a proto-Italian speaker, for interpreters is clear, but perhaps less acute for speakers in the same linguistic group as the recipients. Could the Northumbrian Willibrord, for instance, communicate directly with his Old Frisian-speaking audience in the Low Countries, given the close relationship between the two languages/dialects and the extent of a common vocabulary around the North Sea littoral? At court linguistic barriers may have been less significant, but for the instruction of the population at large the use of their vernacular was essential.

Interestingly, some of the earliest survivals of the Old High and Old Low German languages take the form of baptismal oaths and catechisms, while a vernacular sermon survives from Bavaria.

Whatever the original language of the sermons, and however delivered, they were of course recorded in Latin and usually after a considerable passage of time, mainly in saints' *Lives*. Von Padberg suggests that these literary compositions were retrospective *résumés* based on memory, oral tradition or surviving drafts, perhaps themselves written in Latin with a view to translation into the local vernacular for delivery. But, given the nature and purpose of hagiography, how reliable a witness are they to the actual transaction on the mission field? A *Life* was intended to extol its subject's virtues in order to enhance his/her claim to sainthood, and to this end included instances of exemplary behaviour and of the performance of miracles. The latter in particular were often culled from earlier *Lives* and should not be taken as a literal account of actual events. The same is likely to be true of the sermons, interlarded as they are with biblical quotations and references to the writings of the early church Fathers – in short, a record of what the saint ought to have said rather than what he did say.

The same objection cannot be made of the non-verbal forms of communication, for example the carved stone monuments of northern Europe. The author discusses those in Scandinavia, and some – notably the Gosforth cross – in the British Isles. However, the extensive references to the English-language secondary literature do not include the work of Richard Bailey and the late James Lang, who have written so illuminatingly on the *interpretatio christiana* of the subject matter of Viking stone sculpture (the old Germanic heroes as types of Christ). The carvings present the Christian message in a way that could be understood by those steeped in the stories of the pagan gods of the Norse sagas. These monuments are the very antithesis of confrontation and a living example of the 'softly, softly' approach advocated by Gregory the Great.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

DAVID PARSONS

*The miracles of St Æbbe of Coldingham and St Margaret of Scotland*. Edited and translated by Robert Bartlett. (Oxford Medieval Texts.) Pp. liv + 154. Oxford: Clarendon, 2003. £45. 0 19 925922 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905373283

This volume contains two works which bear witness to the cult of saints as it existed in the medieval kingdom of the Scots. The first, labelled *vita et miracula* in its only manuscript (Bodleian Library, Oxford, MS Fairfax 6, fos 164r–173r), contains the full range of narrative forms typically associated with the cult of saints: a *vita* (pp. 4–21), a *translatio* (pp. 20–31) and a collection of forty-three miracle stories (pp. 30–67). Its subject is the cult of St Æbbe, abbess of the double monastery of Coldingham (d. 681 × 684), and it was evidently composed soon after the cult emerged in the late twelfth century. The relics were rediscovered among the ruins of her monastery in 1188, some five decades or more after a Benedictine priory (a dependency of Durham) had been founded close by and it was at this priory that the dossier was compiled. The other text comprises a mid thirteenth-century collection of the miracles of St Margaret, queen of the Scots (d. 1093), whose cult was centred upon



her tomb in Dunfermline Abbey. Hitherto this miracle collection has remained largely unknown because it is preserved in a single fifteenth-century manuscript which travelled to Spain in the seventeenth century (today, Biblioteca del Palacio Real, Madrid, II.2097, fos 26–41v). Bartlett's judicious introduction includes an excellent discussion of this manuscript (pp. xxxi–xxxiv).

Though Margaret's miracles have been written up with more colour and elaboration than those attributed to St Æbbe, both collections emphasise stories involving visions and apparitions. As the editor points out, the saint, demons, witches or other preternatural beings appear to the recipients of miracles in these texts to a far greater extent than is the norm in the miracle collections that historians have studied thus far. In the case of Æbbe, this emphasis can be put down to a need to establish the authenticity of the recently revived cult as no evidence confirming the identity of the alleged relics had been found during their discovery and translation. The author of her dossier almost admits as much when he notes that 'she who wished to heal wished also to be seen manifestly and recognized by her whom she healed' (p. 49). But the pattern cannot be so easily explained away as a textual phenomenon in Margaret's case. Indeed, her collection has some rather disturbing stories involving visions of bodily chastisement and of penetration of the body by magical objects. In one such story the apparition of a deceased father bashes a girl about the head to the extent that it becomes a shapeless mass devoid of eyes, ears, nose and chin. Since, however, the corpus of miracle collections produced in the British Isles is not well-represented by the range of material that is currently available in print or in digital form, it is difficult to make the comparisons that would allow us to confirm that this theme is a function of the Scottish or the northern milieu or of the period in which these texts were produced.

This is far from being the only aspect of these works which students of the cult of saints will want to investigate further. Given, for example, the story of how Æbbe's double monastery was destroyed, her dossier also provides much material for gender analysis, not least concerning the issue of whether male and female religious should share the same monastic precinct – a question which was as controversial in the twelfth century as it had been in the age of Bede. For its part, the collection of Margaret's miracles reveals that the saint's relics were translated on at least two occasions, not one as had previously been thought – that is, in 1180 as well as in 1250. Both texts also bear witness to the influence of the cult of Thomas Becket in Scotland – a development that needs to be seen alongside William I's foundation in 1178 of an abbey dedicated to Becket at Arbroath.

This volume is, in short, an important addition to Oxford's invaluable series of medieval texts. Its only shortcoming is that the editor (or perhaps the editors of the series) have chosen not to include a new edition of Turgot's *Life of St Margaret*. Its inclusion would have allowed readers to explore for themselves the reasons for the rather disordered state in which the collection of Margaret's miracles has been transmitted. As Bartlett points out, the chapters are no longer in their original order and it seems likely that this is not the only way in which this text's contents have been re-worked. Since a much-interpolated but as yet unprinted text of the *Vita* precedes the miracle collection in the Madrid manuscript (fos 1v–17v), the opportunity to compare its variants with those found in the two much better known copies – that is, with that found in the British Library, London, MS Cotton Tiberius D.III (a late twelfth-century passion) and with that printed in *Acta sanctorum* (which is based on

an early manuscript now lost) – would have permitted the reader to investigate the textual strategies that have affected the transmission of Margaret’s hagiography. The inclusion of Turgot’s *Vita* would, furthermore, have brought greater balance to what is a relatively slim volume, since three-sevenths of the ‘Miracles of St Æbbe’ in fact comprise a *vita* and a *translatio*. It is, however, a measure of this book’s many virtues that one is left asking not for less but for more.

UNIVERSITY OF LANCASTER

PAUL HAYWARD

*La Bible au moyen âge*. By Guy Lobrichon. (Les Médiévistes français, 3.) Pp. 247 incl. 6 ills. Paris: Picard, 2003. €34 (paper). 2 7084 0700 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690538328X

In the preface to the 1982 third edition of her *Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages* Beryl Smalley, when surveying new work undertaken since the first edition, spoke of Guy Lobrichon ‘heroically’ shouldering ‘the task of making a survey of the early history of the *Gloss* for the new French *Dictionary of the Bible*’, and expressed the hope that this would result in questions still outstanding being answered. This reprint of fourteen papers first published between 1980 and 2000 shows that this hope has been in part realised, and that Lobrichon’s heroism has not been limited to a detailed survey of the history of the *Gloss*, but has extended to considering the central place of the Bible in medieval society and culture. Underpinned by an extensive knowledge of the manuscript evidence, and also aware of its limitations and of as yet unsatisfied *desiderata*, he considers the context and purpose of biblical studies in the Middle Ages, and the ways in which these were used and communicated, moving easily from the coalface of manuscripts and texts to the means by which they met the needs of society. One starting point was his doctoral thesis (1979) on twelfth-century commentaries on the Apocalypse, and his appreciation of the efforts of Anselm of Laon (H1117) and the following generation in the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries at producing a complete commentary on the Bible, and of how these both reflected and influenced their social and economic background. The need to place biblical studies and their commentaries in their context is a constantly recurring theme here, and this involves not merely the percolation of these studies through preaching, the appointment of students from the schools to the highest ecclesiastical and lay offices, but also their response to the needs and demands of society. Not long ago Southern instanced one telling example of the penetration of scholastic teaching into the secular sphere in the consoling observations offered Henry II on the trials and tribulations of Job by his chancellor, Peter of Blois, a former Paris theology student, when the king was recovering from the rebellion of all his sons. Many more studies like the pioneering work of John Baldwin on the social views of Peter the Chanter and his circle are needed, and while these pages touch on the connections between biblical commentary and society, their further examination must take place elsewhere.

The Bible changed its guises during this period, and these changes from the large single-volume pandects of the early Middle Ages to the small pocket Bibles of the thirteenth century and later, from the voluminous commentaries of the period up to the twelfth century to the carefully articulated and organised glossed Bibles of the twelfth century and later are often referred to here. Particularly illuminating is the section on biblical ‘paraphrases’ and translations by writers like Macé de la Charité

and Herman de Valenciennes in the Romance area in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. They echo scholastic teaching, cater for a lay elite, and are replaced in the thirteenth century by *Bibles historiales*. In the chapters on the giant books made in Italy, and on the *Biblia pauperum* made for Germany in the later Middle Ages new ground was broken. If the recent work of John Lowden on the *Bibles moralisées* came too late for Lobrichon's references to these princely products, some consideration of the role in the early Middle Ages of the 'part-Bibles' distinguished by Bonifatius Fischer would have been helpful.

The two papers on the Apocalypse remain as valuable today as when first printed. The first, an outcome of the doctoral work on Anselm of Laon, looks at interpretations of the Apocalypse from the ninth to the twelfth centuries, and finds that, with the limited appeal of the millenarist views of Beatus of Liébana, they are mostly 'domesticated' in favour of moral and allegorical readings. The second focuses on the changing relations between commentaries on the Apocalypse and society at the same period, from the rather passive ninth- and tenth-century emphasis on the weakness of earthly power and the need to strengthen the links between the living with the dead, particularly with the saints, to a more radical critique of the new social order in the eleventh century.

Lobrichon's engagement with his subject is total: he takes up the twin challenges of rigorous scholarship and popularisation 'avec jubilation'. The writing is ardent and sparkles with arresting phrases: thus Greek and Roman culture is transmitted to the schools and monasteries of the fifth century 'en vue d'une phagocytose efficace', and Anselm of Laon is described as shaking 'les oripeaux jetés sur l'exégèse par les maîtres des X<sup>e</sup>-XI<sup>e</sup> siècles'. If some repetition cannot be avoided in a collection of occasional papers, there is learning and passion enough.

WOODFORD GREEN

PATRICK MCGURK

*Pratique juridique de la paix et trêve de Dieu à partir du concile de Charroux (989–1250).*  
*Juristische Praxis der Pax und Treuga Dei ausgehend vom Konzil von Charroux (989–1250).*  
 By Thomas Gergen. (Rechtshistorische Reihe, 285.) Pp. 279 incl. 3 figs.  
 Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2003. £30 (paper). 3 631 52265 7; 0344 290X  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905393286

Three canons of the Council of Charroux (989) pronounced anathema against anyone who attacked churches, violently seized the property of peasants, or used force against members of the clergy. These canons, which numerous subsequent councils copied and enlarged, laid the legislative foundation for what is now called the medieval peace movement. The juristic aspects of the body of law that sprang from these canons have been little studied and Gergen devoted his dissertation (University of Saarbrücken 2003), on which this book is based, to exploring the matter. He argues that the Charroux canons resulted from a reaction against the anarchy that prevailed in the county of La Marche and nearby regions during the late ninth century. As other church councils – in which laymen as well as clergy often participated – adapted and expanded the Charroux canons, peace tribunals sprang up to implement the prohibitions against unrestrained violence. The Peace and Truce of God slowly came to be accepted as basic elements of public order in many regions outside of what we now think of as France. East of the Rhine, for example, provisions for the peace appeared

in *Sachsenspiegel* 2.66, and as they also did south of the Pyrenees in the *Usatges* of Barcelona §§74, 78, and 124. The peace movement thus became an institution of customary as well as of canon law by the middle of the thirteenth century.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

*Der mittelalterliche Kreuzgang. The medieval cloister. Le cloître au moyen âge. Architektur, Funktion und Programm.* Edited by Peter K. Klein. Pp. 408 incl. 320 ill. Regensburg: Schnell & Steiner, 2004. €66. 3 7954 1545 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905403280

This polyglot volume is the outcome of a symposium held in Tübingen in 1999, largely concerned with monastic and cathedral cloisters in France, Spain and Germany, with a marked emphasis on the twelfth century. Its twenty-one papers are primarily by French and German scholars with a sprinkling of Spaniards and Americans. British scholars are notably absent, as are British cloisters, which is disappointing in view of the vitality of the subject in this country, demonstrated by John McNeill's successful conference in Oxford in April 2004. The volume opens with eight papers on the function of the monastic cloister and its architectural development in the west, working towards a wide-ranging synthesis, although E. C. Santamaria's paper on León and Galicia demonstrates that, as ever, Spain was different. The bulk of the volume is given over to iconographic studies of artistic programmes, and these necessarily tend to be site-specific. The major French Romanesque monuments are covered, with papers on Moissac, Saint-Aubin d'Angers, Saint-Etienne de Toulouse and Saint-Trophime d'Arles. Peter Klein's own contribution to this section is more ambitious. His concern is the cloister-walk adjacent to the church, which he contends is architecturally, iconographically and functionally distinct from the other three walks, in a survey largely covering examples in France (Cluny, Moissac, Arles, Aix-en-Provence) and Spain (San Pedro de la Rúa, Silos, Gerona, Sant Cugat, Estany), but occasionally straying into the empire. This is an important paper, honed in the course of subsequent conferences at Moissac (2000) and Saint-Michel-de-Cuxa (2002). Of the remaining papers in this section, the study of narrative at Moissac by Leah Rutchick; that of later medieval Cistercian cloisters by Markus Hörsch; and the archaeological detective work in Toulouse by Quitterie Cazes perhaps stand out, but the standard is uniformly high. The final paper in the volume, Géraldine Mallet's study of cloister restoration and reuse in Roussillon, provides an appropriate and fascinating close to a worthwhile volume. The book is lavishly illustrated with black-and-white photographs and line drawings, and benefits from an excellent bibliography compiled by Clemens Kosch.

COURTAULD INSTITUTE OF ART

RON BAXTER

*The liturgy of the canons regular of the Holy Sepulchre of Jerusalem. A study and a catalogue of the manuscript sources.* By Christina Dondi. (Bibliotheca Victorina, 16.) Pp. 343 + 17 plates. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €75. 2 503 51422 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905413287

The subject of Christina Dondi's research is of major importance to historians of the crusades and the Latin East, of liturgy and of, for want of a better term, European

colonial movements. She establishes the following:

1. The Latin liturgy of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre drew on practices at Évreux and Bayeux, which must have been contained in the manuscripts that the first Latin patriarch, Arnulf of Chocques, had brought with him on the First Crusade; at Paris (known today through the medieval liturgies of Sées and York), which Dondi associates with Ansellus, the cantor of the Holy Sepulchre from 1108 to 1138; and at Chartres, which she believes were introduced either by the historian Fulcher of Chartres or by the Patriarch Stephen of La Ferté (1128–30).
2. There are some signs that an English – or rather Anglo-Norman – influence was also being brought to bear.
3. The Hospitallers of St John and the Carmelites, who were members of orders founded within the Latin patriarchate, also employed the liturgy of the Holy Sepulchre wherever their houses were established, but the Templars, representing another order of similar origins, did not. While the Templars in Palestine used the liturgy of the Holy Sepulchre their houses in Europe adopted the liturgies of the dioceses in which they were located.
4. Liturgies in Latin Cyprus, including that of the Premonstratensians at Bellapais, used the Holy Sepulchre liturgy.
5. The patriarchal church in Antioch used the liturgy of Chartres, which possibly came to it by way of Norman south Italy.

Of even more importance than her conclusions are Dondi's detailed analysis and catalogue of the manuscripts, which provide a starting point for the hunt for more liturgical manuscripts from the Latin East, which will certainly ensue, and a means of identifying their provenance. Coincidentally, the work of another pioneer in the field, Professor Amnon Linder, has recently been published. *Raising arms: liturgy in the struggle to liberate Jerusalem in the late Middle Ages* (2003) treats what Linder calls 'outer circle rites': liturgies in the west that in one way or another supported the needs of the Holy Land and crusades through the power of intercessory prayer, and at the same time publicised their needs and encouraged recruitment. I do not think it is possible to exaggerate the importance of the studies by Dondi and Linder. They reveal a new body of source material and they will have the same galvanising effect on crusade history as had the publication a few years ago of Johannes Baptist Schneyer's *Repertorium der lateinischen Sermones des Mittelalters*, which provided the basic materials for a thorough study of sermons.

EMMANUEL COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JONATHAN RILEY-SMITH

*Charters of the vicars choral of York Minster, II: County of Yorkshire and appropriated churches to 1538.* Edited by Nigel J. Tringham. (Yorkshire Archaeological Society Record Ser., 156.) Pp. xxix + 159 incl. map. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Yorkshire Archaeological Society), 2002. £40. 0 90212 292 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905423283

The best known clergy at our medieval cathedrals were the canons or prebendaries, but the daily services were mainly performed by deputies, usually styled vicars

choral. From about the thirteenth century until the 1930s, they formed colleges which, as semi-autonomous subcorporations of the dean and chapter, kept their own records. Nowhere have these survived as extensively as at York Minster. Apart from the usual damage from damp and accidental loss, some have strayed to Canterbury, perhaps after the Civil War; more recently deeds and lease books were removed when the properties to which they relate were taken over by the Ecclesiastical Commissioners; some have since been returned to the Minster archive, some to the Borthwick Institute in York, others, possibly transferred to individual purchasers of the properties, are not now known to survive. B. E. Metcalfe, vicar choral 1852–70, made transcripts of many of the property deeds, some of them since lost. Frederick Harrison, vicar choral 1918–27, later a canon of the Minster 1932–57 and chancellor 1935–57, rediscovered the college's wealth of records and, recognising their importance, transferred them to safe-keeping in the Minster library, sorted and listed them, and transcribed the greater part of the archive with a view to publication by the Surtees Society, but this never happened. He was a popular lecturer, and from the texts of lectures given from 1920 to 1951, he wrote *Life in a medieval college: the story of the vicars choral of York Minster* (1952). His list of the documents and his alphabetical list of vicars choral remain in use in the Minster library. While the archive has been drawn on for a number of special topics, its sheer bulk is at the same time fundamental to its importance and inimical to its publication. Kathleen Edwards, whose *The English secular cathedrals in the Middle Ages* (1949, 2nd edn 1967), gives perhaps the best general account of vicars choral, suggested the archive to a research student as a subject worthy of study, and based on his resulting thesis, Nigel Tringham in 1993 produced an initial volume of the charters relating to the city of York (reviewed in *EHR* cxi [1996], 1253–4 and *Northern History* xxxii [1996], 228–9). He has now followed with a second volume relating to properties and appropriated churches outside the city, all in Yorkshire except for one, Nether Wallop in Hampshire. In this volume, as in the first, the documents, mostly individual deeds, but in some instances entries in registers, provide valuable historical information in that in most cases they are not isolated deeds but a series, sometimes from before the acquisition of the property, whether by gift or bequest, mostly in the thirteenth century, they give topographical details of the property concerned and particulars of landholders and neighbours. Tringham gives full and accurate transcripts of documents earlier than *c.* 1230, otherwise English summaries. Each document is fully described and helpfully annotated, and the introduction usefully draws together the evidence of the individual items to constitute a coherent whole. Tringham's work thus extends our knowledge of the life of the York college of vicars choral both in general and in many details, and so of the medieval English Church. His work admirably complements the detailed account of the excavated remains of the vicars' Bedern College by David Stocker published by the York Archaeological Trust in two volumes in 1999–2001, and the brief account of 'Bedern Hall and the vicars choral of York Minster' by Richard Hall (2004). It is to be hoped that further sections of the archive will be published in the future with equal accuracy, thoroughness and helpfulness.

*The Mozarabic cardinal. The life and times of Gonzalo Pérez Gudiel.* By Francisco J. Hernández and Peter Linehan. (Millennio Medievale, 44. Strumenti e studi, 5.) Pp. xxv + 645 + 17 plates. Firenze: SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2004. €75. 88 8450 042 7

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690543328X

The authors of *The Mozarabic cardinal* are well known to medievalists, Francisco J. Hernández especially for his massive editions of *Los cartularios de Toledo* (revised edition, 1996) and *Las rentas del rey* (1993), Peter Linehan for many earlier publications, notably *History and the historians of medieval Spain* (1993). The introduction indicates that the use made here of the very rich archives of Toledo is mainly due to Hernández while the text is principally Linehan's. Those familiar with Linehan's style, noted, as it is, for his brilliant, if, at times, malicious wit, could have divined this for themselves. The 'epilogue' indicates that the book's title is somewhat deceptive. The cardinal's name was simply Gonzalo Pérez. 'Gudiel' was 'nothing other than a chimera ... an invention of the lively collective imagination of early modern Toledo'. Gudiel (c. 1238–99), as he has long been known and as, for convenience, one may still call him, was an extremely accomplished careerist who rose with great speed from the see of Cuenca (in 1273) to that of Burgos (1275) and then, in 1280, to be primate of Spain. 'Equivocation incarnate', his skill in manoeuvring between opposing ecclesiastics and rivals for the Castilian throne made him the first member of the ancient Mozarabic (Arabic-speaking) community of Toledo to attain the rank of cardinal. The curious thing is that despite the many letters included here, Gudiel 'resists biography'. We learn that he owned many books but not that he made much use of them. While he apparently directed the revision of Alfonso X's *Estoria de España* he wrote nothing comparable to the works of his predecessor, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. For much of his life Gudiel remains 'resolutely invisible' as a person. That he was not, to quote Linehan, 'even a closet Grosseteste', need not be held against him. There were few, if any, Grossetestes in medieval Spain. The question, however, has to be asked, whether Gudiel made any mark on his time. His attempts to complete his cathedral, to found a university in Alcalá and to introduce reforms among his clergy either proved beyond his resources or were made too late to be effective. In fact 'he failed to make any significant impression on the system that had facilitated his own advancement'. For us, this may not greatly matter. If the book cannot show us Gudiel as a person, it shows us Toledo in Gudiel's time, with 'purveyors of Parisian polyphony working alongside German Arabists in a mosque marked down for reconstruction as a Gothic cathedral'. The book gives us Gudiel's age. It extends far beyond Toledo, even beyond his ever expanding debts – incurred in Italy, Spain and Avignon – to the whole of Europe in the later thirteenth century. It draws not only on Toledan materials but on comparative evidence from other Spanish archives, from Barcelona to Zamora. This is a great achievement which has enriched all students of the Middle Ages.

LONDON

J. N. HILLGARTH

*Die St. Georgener Predigten. Untersuchungen zur Überlieferungs- und Textgeschichte.* By Kurt Otto Seidel. Pp. x+374 incl. 4 ills. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2003. €46. 3 484 89121 1; 0580 1362  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905443286

This study examines the complicated transmission history of the so-called ‘St Georgener Predigten’, a body of Middle High German sermons and devotional texts which were brought together as a collection in the second quarter of the thirteenth century, most likely in the Upper Rhineland. The earlier theory that many of the sermons were composed by the prominent Franciscan Berthold von Regensburg has now largely been abandoned. It is thought that the collection in its primary form was intended to contribute to the *cura monialium*; that most of the texts were planned to be read in convents, either privately or communally; and that such ‘Lesepredigten’ should not be regarded as written versions of any sermons which had actually been delivered. Seidel provides detailed descriptions of all the manuscripts transmitting the collection in whole or in part, and produces a *stemma* reflecting the relationship of these manuscripts to each other. He then analyses the geographical dissemination of the collection (including discussion of a Middle Dutch redaction), and the processes of adaptation which affect the collection up until the fifteenth century. In particular, he examines the techniques of *compilatio* and gives detailed examples concerning the reworkings of individual texts. Written primarily for specialists, this is a valuable contribution to Middle High German sermon studies.

ORIEL COLLEGE,  
 OXFORD

ANNETTE VOLPING

*Inquisition et pouvoir.* Edited by Gabriel Audisio. (Collection le temps de l’histoire.) Pp. 375. Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l’Université de Provence, 2004. €29.50 (paper). 2 85399 560 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905453282

This collection of papers from a conference hosted in 2002 by the Maison Méditerranéenne des Sciences de l’Homme in Aix-en-Provence bears witness to the durability of inquisition studies. Twenty-one scholars from nine different countries contributed essays, which are arranged into the following parts: (1) overview; (2) the inquisition and civil power; (3) the inquisition and ecclesiastic power; (4) the inquisition and social control; (5) the inquisition and ideological control; and (6) France and the inquisition (sixteenth through twentieth century). All the papers have been translated into French, although abstracts in English are available. Their sweep is giddy both in terms of chronology and geography, with papers on the medieval inquisition in France and Francophone Switzerland, and the modern inquisition in the Luso-Brazilian world, Spain, Italy and France. As it is impossible to summarise all of the articles, I will focus on those which contribute the most to new approaches in understanding the nature of the inquisition’s power.

In a well-outlined paper, James B. Given reviews what was new about the medieval inquisition’s power as a court, and then asks what constraints within Languedoc’s society operated on the institution. Among the new techniques of power at the court’s disposal were the use of lengthy periods of incarceration, written



records and novel forms of punishment designed to marginalise the guilty. However, technique had to be matched to a specific social milieu. In Languedoc, the inquisitors would look for fissures within society (resentments between rich and poor, parish clergy and the bishop) and exploit them. The court had to depend on local officials in order to police its large district.

While Given's article suggests an institution capable of dominating local society, other papers suggest just the opposite. Jörg Feuchter examines one of the first mass punishments in the inquisition's history with the goal of understanding what impact the imposed sanctions actually had on a local community, in this case thirteenth-century Montauban. In 1241 the inquisitors handed out an astounding total of 741 penances to 256 individuals in a community of two or three thousand souls. In Montauban, the inquisition's goal was to stigmatise members of the town's elite families, who were seen as a dangerous reservoir of heresy. But, as Feuchter sifted through the surviving papers, he discovered that the community seems to have shrugged off the penances. Few of the harshest sentences seem to have been fulfilled, and no one was forced to wear humiliating penitential garb. In the end, the inquisition did not achieve its goal of marginalising its victims in order to inspire fear and respect for its authority.

Where there was no centralised state to support the inquisition's activities, dependence on local officials clearly could prove to be a weakness. Kathrin Utz Tremp and Georg Modestin find that the success of all of the medieval inquisition's forays into fifteenth-century French-speaking Switzerland depended on the cooperation of the bishop of Lausanne, which mostly was denied. If we move into the modern era, other examples of an inquisition unable to impose its will come forth. In the case of Casale Monferrato, Albrecht Burkardt shows how compromises with local authorities could lead the inquisition to lose all ability to act independently. In Casale Monferrato, a town belonging to the Gonzaga family, the inquisition was despised by all elements of society. The local inquisitor experienced constant harassment, was ostracised within his own conventual community, and depended entirely on civic authorities to arrest and punish suspects. Eventually he was removed and replaced with a more effective judge.

Of the many other papers in the collection, two more warrant special mention. In a sophisticated piece, Marina Caffiero traces the evolution of relations between the Roman inquisition, the papacy and Rome's Jewish population in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Originally, the Roman inquisition did not concern itself with Judaising and ignored the Jews, who technically fell outside its jurisdiction. Over the course of the seventeenth century, the inquisition became increasingly interested in prosecuting Jews for a wide variety of crimes. However, its interest blew hot and cold, and the Jews often would fight back. The turning point came during the papacy of the rabidly antisemitic Benedict XIV, who used the inquisition to enforce his policy of forced baptisms and conversions that would remain in effect throughout the nineteenth century (and ultimately led to the *cause célèbre* of Edgardo Mortara). In another arena entirely, Ignasi Fernández Terricabras lobbies for the need to place questions about the inquisition within a larger political perspective and search for new, non-inquisitorial sources that can shed light on the institution's history. He takes as an example the third session of the Council of Trent, which despite its debates on the exercise of power within the Church, and with other powers, failed to issue any decree on the inquisition and handed the responsibility

for an index of prohibited books over to the papacy. The reason for this omission will not be found in the inquisition's archives but in the diplomatic correspondence between Philip II, his representatives and the Spanish bishops at Trent. Understandably, Philip was determined to protect the unique status of the Spanish inquisition, and succeeded in exempting the Holy Office from the council's reforms.

It is now over twenty-five years since the 'boom' in inquisition studies in the late 1970s. Few names from that pioneering generation will be found in this collection, a tribute to the field's ability to attract new scholars. And, in a French conference dedicated to the examination of power, social control and the history of an institution, it was quite remarkable how focused the authors were on presenting empirical results, and how thoroughly they ignored the fashionable theoreticians.

WILLIAM PATERSON UNIVERSITY

SARA T. NALLE

*Texts and the repression of medieval heresy.* Edited by Caterina Bruschi and Peter Biller. (York Studies in Medieval Theology, 4.) Pp. xvii + 258. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2003. £50. 1 903153 10 7; 1366 9656  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905463289

The scrupulous, creative scholarship on display in these essays more than compensates for their occasionally wearisome methodological *longueurs*. An introduction by the joint editors offers a good brief overview of post-medieval scholarship on medieval heresy and highlights the book's main theme – a shift from texts as sources to texts as an integral part of the 'mind-sets which produced them'. The 2000 York Quodlibet Lecture, delivered by Alexander Patchovsky, rightly assumes pride of place. Concerned with the social and political function of heresy in the medieval world, Patchovsky poses fundamental questions and makes fundamental points, allowing us to grasp 'heresy' as a social, political and rhetorical construct. Jessalynn Bird sets out a strong case that before the coming of the friars, Peter the Chanter's disciples were already shoring up orthodoxy and combating heresy. Once John Arnold bids *adieu* to Foucault, his own learning and insights acquire enough space to breathe. Inquisitors 'shape' the responses of deponents; 'beliefs' are an unstable category of analysis. Caterina Bruschi's essay on the Doat collection of thirteenth-century Toulouse heresy trial depositions demonstrates that understanding inquisitorial procedures and the 'filtration' of the accused heretics' testimony are prerequisites to assessing the evidential value of the material. Clearly, and with impressive erudition, Mark Pegg underscores the fact that the 1245–6 inquisitors recorded in Toulouse MS 609 were concerned above all with suspicious actions and observances, not thoughts or doctrines. This is often overlooked in general studies of medieval heresy. Peter Biller pays close attention to Bernard Gui's language and set questions in Gui's construction of the Waldensians. Gui, according to Biller, was a 'less inquisitive' inquisitor than Jacques Fournier. James Given also writes about Gui, but concentrates on the punishments he imposed, especially upon the beguins. These Franciscan tertiaries were perceived as a threat to papal authority, and so treated severely. Peter Biller returns with an illuminating forensic investigation of an important anonymous description of the Waldensians. By-products of Biller's scholarly sleuthing are what the Waldensians called themselves; how the Waldensians prayed; and Waldensian sisterhoods. Bruschi's second

contribution is a highly focused study of an official enquiry into a dodgy inquisitorial dossier in which procedural irregularities found therein were questioned. Anne Hudson's 'Which Wyche?' – a characteristically accomplished piece of work – closes the volume. As well as giving us a neat paradox about Richard Wyche as Lollard heretic and/or saint (p. 26), she draws attention to Wyche's role in the diffusion of Wycliffite ideas in Hus's Bohemia. If proof were needed, this book confirms that historians do their best work when they do it; and not when they talk about how it should be done.

EDINBURGH

GARY DICKSON

*The mystical thought of Meister Eckhart. The man from whom God hid nothing.* By Bernard McGinn. (The Edward Cadbury Lectures 2000–1.) Pp. xiii + 305. New York: Crossroad Publishing/Herder & Herder, 2001. \$45. 0 8245 1914 0

*Gabriel Biel und die Mystik.* By Detlef Metz. (Contubernium, 55.) Pp. xii + 460. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 2001. DM 164. 3 515 07824 X

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905473285

In *The mystical thought of Meister Eckhart* Bernard McGinn synthesises recent Eckhart research and provides a wonderful introduction to Eckhart's thought. After an account of Eckhart's life that incorporates important evidence about the dating of his extant works (ch. i), McGinn outlines some of the major debates within Eckhart studies (ch. ii). One of these controversies concerns whether Eckhart is best understood as a 'mystic' or as a 'philosopher-theologian' (p. 21). McGinn sides firmly with those who read Eckhart as a mystic, but he finds the available characterisations of Eckhart's mysticism unsatisfying. 'German mysticism', 'Rhineland mysticism', 'Dominican mysticism' and 'speculative mysticism' are all, McGinn argues, historically or conceptually inadequate. Rather than eschewing general characterisation, in chapter iii McGinn proposes that 'mysticism of the ground' (MHG *grunt/grund*) can provide a helpful prism for understanding the special character of the mysticism of Eckhart and those influenced by him, Dominican and non-Dominican (p. 37).

Following a methodological insight provided by Hans Blumenberg and Susanne Köbele, McGinn argues that '*Grunt* can be described as an "explosive metaphor" in the sense that it breaks through previous categories of mystical speech to create new ways of presenting a direct encounter with God. When Eckhart says, as he frequently does, "God's ground and my ground is the same ground", he announces a new form of mysticism' (p. 38). In earlier studies, McGinn emphasises Eckhart's call for a 'union without distinction' between the soul and God (language that remains in *The mystical thought*). This characterisation of Eckhart's mysticism highlights its close ties to the so-called woman's religious movement of the thirteenth-century, given that the beguine mystics, Hadewijch, Mechthild of Magdeburg and Marguerite Porete, all make similar claims. McGinn's new focus on the 'master metaphor' of the ground tends to minimise the commonalities between Eckhart's thought and that of the beguines, thereby accentuating Eckhart's originality.

Although I am dubious about McGinn's suggestion that Eckhart single-handedly 'announces a new form of mysticism' with his 'mysticism of the ground', analysis

of this 'explosive metaphor' does demonstrate beautifully the complex nature of Eckhart's thought and of the relationship between his Latin and German works. As McGinn demonstrates, 'although there are equivalents for *aspects* of *grunt* in Latin ... there is no single Latin word that "means" *grunt*; that is, the vernacular word has a richer range of significations, offers more possibilities for use, and presents us with a more adequate way to study Eckhart's new teaching about mystical union than any word in the learned but less flexible language of the schools' (p. 40).

McGinn follows his analysis of the metaphor of the 'ground' with chapters devoted to key concepts in Eckhart's mystical theology – the birth of the word in the soul (ch. iv) and the neoPlatonic metaphor of flow or emanation (ch. v) and return (ch. vi). Throughout these chapters, McGinn moves deftly between Eckhart the *lebemeister* (preacher and spiritual guide) and Eckhart the *lesemeister* (Paris schoolman and teacher), demonstrating their essential unity. A concluding appendix broaches the vexed question of Eckhart's sources, summarising recent research, suggesting where questions still remain and wisely insisting that knowledge of Eckhart's sources can only ever give us a 'partial grasp' of his genius.

McGinn defines mysticism as the 'consciousness of God's immediate presence' (p. 132), eschewing narrower definitions that focus on 'personal ecstatic experience' (p. 21). In *Gabriel Biel und die Mystik*, Detlef Metz defines mysticism in terms of experience. Following Kurt Ruh and Peter Dinzelbacher, Metz insists that 'mystical experience must be distinguished from mystical texts' and 'the unmediated level of experience' from 'the level of reflection on that experience' (p. 14). Moreover, since 'mystical texts are seldom identical to genuine mysticism ... the preliminary steps toward and the goals of mysticism are to be taken into consideration in a history of mysticism' (p. 12). For Ruh, and so also for Metz, 'the relation to genuine mysticism – in the form of preliminary steps or of goals – is the material criterion for the definition of the corpus of mystical texts' (p. 12).

The issue of definition is an important one for Metz because Biel, unlike Eckhart, is not generally considered a mystic. Moreover, Metz's interest in Biel stems from a broader question about the compatibility of nominalism and mysticism. Within the Christian tradition, claims to mystical experience and union with God often rest on Platonic philosophical foundations; nominalism, with its assault on Platonic metaphysics, would thus seem to be inimical to mysticism (p. 418). Through a careful analysis of Biel's discussion of mystical experience, that which leads to mystical experience and the goals of mystical experience, Metz demonstrates that Biel brings together nominalist metaphysics and a theology influenced by mysticism. Thus, after introductory discussions of the nature of mysticism and overviews of the scholarship on Biel and mysticism and Biel's place within the *devotio moderna* movement (ch. ii), Metz exhaustively lays out Biel's allusions to and discussions of key mystical terms, among them prayer, meditation and contemplation, rapture and illumination, union and transformation (ch. iv). Metz then provides detailed analyses of Biel's understanding of the site of union between God and the soul (ch. v), the role of mystical experience in the Christian life (ch. vi) and the importance of Passion mysticism for eliciting feelings of contrition and love (ch. vii).

Despite ample evidence for the importance of mystical language and concepts to Biel's theology, Metz insists that 'Biel is certainly not a fervent advocate of mysticism' (p. 429). He believed mystical experience was possible and he may have had such experiences himself (p. 352), but, according to Metz, for Biel 'salvation

does not depend on [mystical experience], but much more on love, which God sends him and through which God leads him to union. This love ... is the true Christian existence – even when it is not subjectively experienced’ (p. 430). This can probably be said of every Christian mystic, rendering suspect the definition of mysticism as subjective experience with which Metz frames his otherwise valuable study.

DIVINITY SCHOOL,  
UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

AMY HOLLYWOOD

*The Catalan rule of the Templars. A critical edition and English translation from Barcelona, Archivo de la Corona de Aragón, cartas reales, MS 3344.* By Judi Upton-Ward. (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 19.) Pp. xxviii + 116. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2003, £45. 0 85115 9109  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905483281

What remains of the ‘Catalan’ fragment of the Templars’ rule contains some 205 clauses, less than a third of the 658 clauses in the French version. Some of those 205 are not in the French text. Of the additions to the French version, some were published in 1889 by Joseph Delaville le Roulx, but it useful to have the complete Barcelona text with an English translation, concordance and bibliography. The book’s title is misleading, the correct reference being: Cancellaría Real, cartas reales diplomáticas de Jaime II, no. 3344 (*olim* Códices Varias IX). The author notes very briefly that the text is in a mixture of languages; the principal language is Catalan but it is not a real Catalan. The book’s small format was perhaps handy for chapter meetings or receptions of brethren. The jumbled way in which the French original was presented, and the numerous omissions from it, may help to explain why some Templars were confused about their own regulations at their trials after 1307. Of those clauses not in the French text, some referred to the east as ‘deça mer’ or its equivalent or to the west as ‘outremer’ (§§43–5, 126, 138, 146?, 176), but one of the new clauses seems to have the west as ‘autremer’ (§174). The manuscript dates later than 1268 or perhaps 1273, and the hand might suggest a date *c.* 1300/1307; the manuscript probably passed to the crown on the Temple’s dissolution after 1307. The transcription seems satisfactory. The language and hand do present a few difficulties and some readings are doubtful, partly perhaps because the edition was made from a microfilm. It is evidently difficult to expand contractions in a text written in a miscellany of languages. Some guesswork is unavoidable and a few queries remain. Why is ‘[tot]’ introduced at §17 but then not translated? At §1 ‘san’ looks like ‘seran’; at §70 ‘his’ rather than ‘her’ feet seems preferable. A photograph of one or more folios would have been helpful. A number of passages such as ‘si primerament ne fayt la prie <re>’, are obscure in the original (§3), and to give an equally obscure ‘unless he first says the prayer’ without further explanation seems unsatisfactory. The map of commanderies is seriously deficient; ‘Bouiñeni’ should be ‘Boquiñeni’ (p. xviii). The index lacks many place and personal names. The edition provides an important addition to available Templar materials but many points require further elucidation, especially through comparisons with the French text.

BATH

ANTHONY LUTTRELL

*The Templar of Tyre. Part III of the Deeds of the Cypriots.* By Paul Crawford. (Crusade Texts in Translation, 6.) Pp. xiv + 199 incl. 2 maps. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. £37.50. 1 84014 618 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905493288

The account of the ‘Templar of Tyre’ is the most important narrative source for the last period of the Latin occupation of Palestine. The author was not a Templar, but a Latin settler knight, possibly born in Cyprus. He lived for at least fourteen years in Tyre, before passing into the service of William of Beaujeu, the Templar grand master, for whom he acted as secretary. He was in Acre when it fell in 1291. He wrote in a lively way, with an eye for detail, and he could be very moving, as in his description of William of Beaujeu’s death at Acre, which he witnessed. The publication of this text will be of great benefit to university teachers who now have at their disposal a large number of interesting sources in translation. The editors of the series in which this book appears are making a major contribution in this respect.

The translation is on the whole accurate. The Templar of Tyre wrote in a French which is not hard to understand, although it is not always straightforward. The translators of texts relating to the crusades have particular problems in this regard, because their subject covers many different topics and they cannot be expert in all of them or recognise all the technicalities which have to be guarded against. Two examples, both relating to the military orders, illustrate the pitfalls. The word *auberge* was used by the Hospitallers of St John to denote a large building in Acre where the marshal and the brothers-at-arms resided. As it happens, the Templar of Tyre provided the best known description of it. But the word *auberge* was also used by the Hospitallers, and by the Templars as well, to mean any lodging or encampment, a fact that Crawford does not seem to appreciate. And he has difficulties with the word *covent*, when used with reference to the brothers with the Templar master, translating it on one occasion as a collective noun – ‘a great convent of brethren’ – and on another omitting it entirely and replacing it with the word ‘men’. *Covent* was a term used in both the Temple and the Hospital to mean a community of professed brothers and specifically to refer to those who at any given time were residing with, or in the company of, the master. References to the master and *covent* in the Temple had great institutional and constitutional significance, because all legislative authority continued to reside in them until 1307.

More important, Crawford does not seem to have made full use of the new edition of the source, published by Laura Minervini in 2000, the first to use the only surviving fourteenth-century manuscript of the text. Crawford writes that since it only became available as his translation was nearing completion, ‘it was used as much as time constraints permitted’. I would have been happier to have been assured that he had checked his final text word for word against it, although on a more positive note I am delighted that this wonderful source is now available to students.

EMMANUEL COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JONATHAN RILEY-SMITH

*Les Moines de l'abbaye de Moissac de 1295 à 1334. Entre coutumes clunisiennes et nécessités économiques.* By Nicole de Peña. (Cahiers Mabillon, 1.) Pp. 137 incl. 12 ills. Turnhout: Brepols, 2002 (first publ. 2001). €30. 2 503 51201 1  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905503282

Solidly researched with as much statistical information as the archives permit, this clearly written, well-constructed monograph amounts to a thorough physical examination of the institutional health of the once illustrious Cluniac house of Moissac. Nor are the social and economic dimensions of Moissac's later medieval history ignored. Roughly half the book consists of historical analysis aided by graphs, while the remainder reproduces Moissac's statutes and customs, 1305–1453, together with useful, prosopographical appendices. The financial crisis facing the monks, for which poor management was ultimately responsible, dominates the exposition. Moissac's crisis, according to the author, was not the consequence of excessive expenditure due to a rising population of monks (curbed by 1333); nor did it stem from the desire of the abbots to enrich their own noble families. Instead, it was triggered in 1319, when the French crown demanded payment of royal taxes, long overdue, on monastic property acquired during the past thirty years. Moissac's crippling debt burden led eventually to administrative restructuring as well as the imposition of external constraints. So as Moissac's ties with Cluny weakened, the influence over its affairs of both the Avignon papacy (especially pertaining to appointments) and the French crown grew stronger. Not without some resistance, however. A royal official who allegedly abused his office was beaten up by two priors and their monks before being thrown off a bridge into the Tarn. Monastic education is touched upon. Half the monks were literate enough to become priests. An unquantifiable proportion went to the University of Toulouse and subsequently advanced their ecclesiastical careers. But from the monastic statutes we learn nothing about Moissac's devotional or spiritual life. Does this indicate that all was well? The question remains unexplored: this is a purely physical examination. Would library catalogues, if they survive, or an inventory of books traceable to Moissac's scriptorium perhaps provide a clue to the monastery's inner religious life? Although De Peña concludes that the abbey's fourteenth-century crisis appears 'more material than spiritual', her assurances of the vigour of monastic life in this period must be taken on trust. Certainly, recruitment, especially from noble families, held up; but what part careerism played in this is problematic. De Peña concedes that Moissac's abbots and priors seemed more intent on pursuing self-advantage than on promoting communitarian ideals. All of which means that determining the spiritual health of Moissac's enfeebled institutional body requires other diagnostic techniques.

EDINBURGH

GARY DICKSON

*A history of music at Christ Church Cathedral, Dublin.* By Barra Boydell. Pp. xvii + 218 incl. 10 plates and 16 musical examples. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2004. £45. 1 84383 044 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905513289

The reviewer ought first to echo the author's disclaimer to the effect that there is no connection between himself and the publisher. This is a conscientious and thorough account of the music at Christ Church, drawing both on the author's own extensive

documentary researches and on work that was to bear fruit in Kenneth Milne (ed.), *Christ Church Cathedral: a history* (Dublin 2000) and a number of other recent publications. The story of the medieval cathedral, served by Augustinian canons, and its relationship to St Patrick's, a collegiate church raised to the status of a cathedral in the thirteenth century, is well told, and the subsequent interaction between the two allows many a glimpse into the history of St Patrick's also. A lack of documentation prior to the Reformation necessitates a degree of speculation, but thereafter there is if anything a superabundance of material, including an important seventeenth-century scorebook and a large number of partbooks from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Sometimes this abundance leads to a narrative of forbidding density, particularly in the descriptions of the music composed and performed at the cathedral, illustrated inevitably by only a small selection of musical examples; but the daily lives of the cathedral organists and choristers (boys and men), and their working conditions, are well told. There is light relief available in a cast of characters that includes one Faithful Tadpole as well as Jonathan Swift, dean of St Patrick's, who objected to the 'disobedience, rebellion, perfidy, and ingratitude' of those singers, members of both choirs, who had 'presumed to sing and fiddle at a Club of Fiddlers in Fishamble-street'. For much of the period between the Reformation and the later nineteenth century most of the singers were able to draw a generous salary from both cathedrals, their timetables so arranged as to make this possible, with the result that Dublin was able to attract some of the best musicians in the British Isles. The measures that led to the emancipation of Catholics in the nineteenth century, and the eventual disestablishment of the Church of Ireland, contributed to a slow decline that led ultimately to the closure of the 500-year-old choir school in 1972. The highly interventionist restoration of the fabric under G. E. Street in 1872–8 had already created a rather different type of building, while a renewed commitment to musical excellence since 1980, together with the installation of a magnificent new organ by Kenneth Jones, has given Christ Church a distinction that had been lacking for the previous hundred years. In the eighteenth century, because of its strong financial position, Christ Church compared favourably with most other cathedrals in the British Isles; latterly it has had to compete in a very different market, doing so by enlarging the scope of its activities and establishing a choir of both sexes. Both it, and the author of this book, deserve congratulations on their achievement.

FACULTY OF MUSIC,  
OXFORD

JOHN CALDWELL

*Kindheit und Mystik im Mittelalter*. By Ralph Frenken. (Beihefte zur Mediaevistik. Monographien, Editionen, Sammelbände, 2.) Pp. 347. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2002. £27 (paper). 3 631 38467 X; 1617 657X  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690523285

The title of Frenken's monograph gives grounds for supposing that its main focus would be on childhood, mysticism and the Middle Ages. This, however, is misleading. As far as the first key word, 'childhood', is concerned, a topic which came to prominence in the 1960s and is still highly controversial, there is not a single reference to Philippe Ariès, the initiator of the *History of Childhood* project. For



'mysticism' the whole of the standard literature is missing: Frenken does mention Kurt Ruh's magnificent work in his bibliography, but this is surely insignificant for his investigation. For the third key term, 'the Middle Ages', the essential literature is again absent, as well as any specific outline of the chronology and characteristic features of the period. As the book lacks a subtitle, one wonders what the nature of the investigation really is.

Frenken, who studied psychology, has dedicated himself to the history of that subject – a new research area which is currently establishing itself as an element in medieval interdisciplinary studies. Even Jean Leclercq, who has been working on a Latin edition of the works of Bernard of Clairvaux for decades, and who has proved himself the *doyen* of this field by publishing hundreds of essays and books, has composed, in his old age, a scholarly treatise on Bernard which constitutes a contribution to the history of psychology. In so doing, he was able to bring modern medieval studies into contact with psychological theories in a fruitful and productive way.

When one looks at Frenken's work, however, it becomes evident that no real dialogue between medieval studies – especially medieval mysticism – and psychology took place. The title's final key term, 'the Middle Ages', merely indicates that the author selected a few remarkable male and female mystics of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, without providing any reasons for his choice; his aim is to make them appear in a new light with the help of psychological categories. Among others, the mystical triumvirate of Mechtild of Magdeburg († 1290), Mechtild of Hackeborn († 1299) and Gertrude of Helfta († 1302) are discussed, together with Agnes Blannbekin († 1315), Christina of Retters († 1292), Henry Suso († 1366), Adelheid Langmann of Engelthal († 1375) and Dorothy of Montau († 1394). It is not clear whether Frenken used the complete works of each of his mystically-endowed personalities or whether he focused only upon extracts; what is striking is that when deciding which editions and translations to use, he seems to have based his choice simply upon practical accessibility; he disregarded editions and translations which are generally accepted by experts (for instance, Frenken draws upon Johanna Lanczkowski's translation of the 'Legatus' of Gertrude of Helfta, which researchers have rejected).

Methodologically, Frenken distances himself from a dominant field of research in German philology which considers the texts of medieval mysticism based on personal experience solely as literary fiction. He also dissociates himself from a theologically-orientated approach which starts from a 'God as the explanation hypothesis' when interpreting mystical texts; he definitely rejects the notion of 'transcendental beings', simply calling it 'epistemologically naive' (p. 13). Subsequently, he accepts the experiences that mystical personalities have had, but characterises them as products of imagination, i.e. as an 'admiration of illusions' and as 'hallucinations'. As Frenken explains, 'The way of interpretation here preferred is, according to my understanding, a kind of "critical-realistic" one which cannot accept the existence of transcendental beings because of the choice of a conception of the world, but can, without any problem, approve of the mystics describing hallucinatory experiences' (p. 14). In order to emphasise his point, one can add that he takes as a basis the following model for his psychological explanation of the mysticism, based on personal experience, which occurs in the high Middle Ages: to his mind, male and female mystics are 'split personalities', insofar as 'on the one

hand quite logical and on the other hand quite contradictory contents of consciousness, as far as their action is concerned, simultaneously exist in the mystic's consciousness' (p. 16); with the example of male and female mystics he tries to prove the symptom of a 'borderline syndrome', to be precise, a 'seriously damaged psychological profile on the frontier between neurosis and psychosis' (p. 17).

As the consequence of his investigations Frenken unsurprisingly states that male and female mystics went through 'most unpleasant traumas' during their childhoods (p. 21), that they were concerned with an idealisation of paternal objects in order to keep themselves away from disapproving or tormenting motherly objects (pp. 22–3), that they demonstrated split personalities (pp. 23–4) and finally that they 'never led a normal sex life with heterosexual partners' (p. 24). With the help of tabular material he demonstrates the kinds of biographical trauma that can create male and female mystics: strong hungry feelings during the time of early childhood, an early loss of parents, slaps, inappropriate handling and so on. An even more intense factor in the shaping of a mystic results from 'traumas which occur later': Frenken goes so far as to identify such traumas in almost every mystical personality as 'sexual abuse' (p. 309).

Seen from the perspective of interdisciplinary medieval studies, Franken's work, on this evidence, does not convince. He tries to analyse medieval personalities, using modern criteria, but without even demonstrating or taking into consideration any detailed knowledge of their social and religious backgrounds. Inasmuch as the traumas he describes (hunger, loss of parents, cold, etc) are an expression of an imperfect society – and the Middle Ages were to a large extent a rather imperfect society – almost everyone would have become a mystic – and this, of course, could naturally have happened even before the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Moreover, the current ideals of child and childhood, which serve as models for Frenken, do not go back further than the fifteenth century. Paradoxically, from the perspective of social history, there can be no doubt that the 'discovery of childhood' as a state of existence in its own right is largely rooted in the mystical adoration of the Infant Jesus which, according to Frenken, can be characterised as psychologically pathological. It is remarkable that while no respectable practising psychologist would dare to confront a patient with the diagnosis of 'sexual abuse' on the basis of a few select statements, and without extensive consideration of his or her social background, Frenken feels free to do exactly that when analysing medieval male and female mystics. Against this background the kind of history of psychology that Frenken has in mind can hardly be called scientific in its approach. We can also count ourselves lucky that there is no need for him to write his own psychological study of Bernard of Clairvaux – in his eyes much needed (p. 334). Frenken, 'the historian in psychology', had failed to notice that one already existed.

ESSEN UNIVERSITY

HUBERTUS LUTTERBACH

*Pope John XXII and his Franciscan cardinal. Bertrand de la Tour and the apostolic poverty controversy.* By Patrick Nold. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. xii + 212.

Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2003. £45. 0 19 926875 4

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905533281

A customary politeness when beginning a review, even one destined to contain reservations, is to note that the work will make somehow a 'contribution' to the field.

Such a commencement does not suit the present work. This book will make more than a contribution to its field. It will open new lines of thought. It will stimulate debate and suggest fresh interpretations of a well-worn subject. Under his unassuming title, Nold proposes a complete reassessment of the final controversy over apostolic poverty. His protagonist, the Franciscan Cardinal Bertrand de la Tour, seemingly acted an ambiguous part, 'caught', as Nold says, 'dead centre in the cross-wires of allegiance'. As a Franciscan he defended the principles of his order; as a prince of the Church he subscribed to the pope's decisions. Possibly he concluded that discretion was the better part of valour. This is not Nold's conclusion. He shows that Cardinal Bertrand played a far more vital, perhaps a decisive role in the affair. And in so doing he suggests a new appreciation of the controversy itself, one that compels us to rethink some venerable notions implanted in the perception of history. The heart of Nold's argument – and it is here that he makes his boldest assertions – is that that perception has been warped, as by the effect of propaganda, by its reliance on one source, the *Chronicle* of Nicholas the Minorite. But this source, as Nold demonstrates, pursues a partisan agenda, creates a picture crafted by one side, that of the deposed minister-general, Michael of Cesena. Weighing this source against others, Nold challenges our preconceptions. Neither was the Franciscan order united in its defence of poverty nor was Pope John XXII an uncompromising figure bent on dismissing all but his preordained decisions. One is led almost to sympathise with the unsympathetic pope. He emerged victorious in the battle. But his enemies, in defeat, defeated him on the battlefield of historical opinion. Michael, in his refuge at the court of Munich (like Napoleon in his exile on St Helena) employed the pen, and turned the perception of history to his side. The Michaelists' posthumous triumph obscured the achievements of the curial Franciscans, particularly Bertrand de la Tour. If Nold is correct that the treatise on poverty ascribed to Bérenger Frédol is really by Bertrand, then Bertrand must be seen as a pivotal player in the dispute. If his assessment of Pope John's pronouncements is correct, we must re-evaluate John's contribution (heretofore enshrined in the work of Brian Tierney) to the evolution of papal infallibility. If one were to offer a mild criticism of Nold's book it might be the diffidence with which he proposes his conclusions. A work that offers such distinctive ideas deserves a more vigorous recapitulation. The attentive reader, nevertheless, will reap many rewards from this, let us use the word, contribution to the field of Franciscan history.

SOUTHERN CONNECTICUT STATE UNIVERSITY

ALAN FRIEDLANDER

*Machaut's music. New interpretations.* Edited by Elizabeth Eva Leach. (Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, 1.) Pp. xviii + 296 incl. 108 figs. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003. £65. 1 84383 016 7

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905543288

By 1330 Guillaume de Machaut already held a perpetual chaplaincy at the Hôpital of Sainte-Marie-de-Houdain. A series of papal bulls issued by John XXII in 1330, 1332 and 1333 granted him expectative canonicates and prebends at Verdun, Arras and Reims, and he obtained similar privileges at St-Quentin in Vermandois around this time. The reform of the benefice system undertaken by Benedict XII in 1335 required that Machaut cede all but his expectations at Reims and St-Quentin, the latter having

been obtained without papal intervention. Even so, his later life was comfortably endowed. He was collated to the prebend at Reims in 1337 and took possession of his canonicate there – to an annual value of 60 *livres* – in 1340. After this time, he increasingly withdrew from the political service of his early career – initially to John of Luxembourg, king of Bohemia, and later to his daughter, Bonne, duchess of Normandy – and, enjoying his canonicate, devoted himself to the composition of music and poetry. Contemporaneous documents attest to his celebrity in these activities during his lifetime. Despite his close connection with the institutions of the Church throughout his life, sacred music did not figure prominently in his voluminous output; no doubt the papal bull of 1324 restricting the liturgical use of composed polyphony was significantly to blame. There are two early motets written for Reims (*Bone pastor*) and St-Quentin (*Martyrum/Diligenter*); and a brace of later ones address respectively Christ (*Christe/Veni*) and the Virgin Mary (*Felix/Inviolata*). Two of the *lais* also address the Virgin Mary, and the famous *Mass*, the earliest complete polyphonic setting of the mass ordinary by a named composer, is thought to be dedicated to her. Beyond these few pieces, the work is firmly rooted in the secular domain. Chance survival of musical sources has ensured that Machaut is now the pre-eminent composer of that curious historical construction, the Middle Ages; but his music has yet to penetrate our general musical culture as fully as its great historical interest and aesthetic merit warrant. The present collection of eighteen essays by as many scholars is a welcome contribution to the considerable body of writings on Machaut's work; and the broadening of scholarly scope that it marks may be a step towards that wider appreciation. None the less, it is aimed more at the specialist than at the general reader, and much that it contains addresses rather arcane musicological concerns. Two essays (by Kevin Moll and Margaret Bent) touch on the *Mass*, but from the abstruse perspective of polyphonic technique. The most interesting contribution from an ecclesiological viewpoint is by Owen Rees, who proposes that the construction of certain sections of the *Mass* in proportions of the numbers 7 and 12 has a symbolical association with themes of sin, forgiveness and propagation of the faith. For those wishing to learn more about Machaut's secular compositions, essays by Jacques Boogaart, Elizabeth Leach, Anne Stone, Jennifer Bain, William Mahrt and Yolanda Plumley dealing with issues of meaning in the musical settings will be of interest.

ORIEL COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

DAVID MAW

*Spirituality renewed. Studies on significant representatives of the Modern Devotion.* Edited by Hein Blommestijn, Charles Caspers and Rijcklof Hofman. (Studies in Spirituality Supplements, 10.) Pp. v + 275 incl. 12 ill. Leuven: Peeters, 2003. €40 (paper). 90 429 1327 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905553284

This is a collection of nine essays, several of which have appeared elsewhere, in honour of the work of Rudolf van Dijk at the Titus Brandsma Institute in Nijmegen. The essays are loosely bound together thematically. Several of them examine the attitude of the *devotio moderna* to images and their use in contemplation. Two look at different aspects of the work of the movement's founder, Geert Grote, two others

discuss the work of Gerard Zerbolt of Zutphen, one of the earliest members of the movement. Three essays, by Wybren Scheepsma, Charles Caspers and Frank van der Pol, discuss some of the notable women associated with the movement: Alijt Bake, Liduina of Schiedam and the Sisters of St Agnes in Kampen. A further essay, by Gerrit Gerrits, analyses the spirituality of Johannes Brinckerinck through his sermons to the Sisters of the Common Life in Deventer and to the Augustinian Canonesses Regular in Diepenveen. The first essay in the collection is by van Dijk himself and explores the attitude of Gerard Zerbolt to the use of images and imagination in contemplation. A second essay, by Hein Blommestijn, also concerns Gerard Zerbolt. Blommestijn examines the relevance for today of Zerbolt's treatise *De spiritualibus ascensionibus*. The attitude of the Modern Devout to images, specifically the function of the pious imagination in the spiritual process, is discussed in an article by Kees Waaijman on Geert Grote's *De quatuor generibus meditabilium* (*Sermo de nativitate domini*). Geert Grote's polemic against the building of the Dom tower in Utrecht is the subject of the essay by Rijklof Hofman. Hofman places the treatise *Contra turrim traiectensem* in its historical context and uses it to argue that Grote's conversion was much more gradual than has been suggested by his biographers hitherto. The final essay is, appropriately enough, on Luther's *ars moriendi*, *Ein Sermon von der Bereitung zum Sterben*. In this essay Dick Ackerboom compares Luther's sermon, with its woodcut illustrations, with earlier late medieval texts, many of them by leading members of the *devotio moderna* movement. The essays are all in English, though the quality of the English is variable – at times the subject matter is obscured by faulty grammar and vocabulary. This defect could have been avoided by better subediting by a native speaker of English.

ROBINSON COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

SASKIA MURK-JANSEN

*Sanctifying signs. Making Christian tradition in late medieval England.* By David Aers. Pp. xiii + 281. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004. \$55 (cloth), \$25 (paper). 0 268 02021 3; 0 268 02022 1  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905563280

With this volume, David Aers extends his investigations of the interconnections of theology and literature (the latter broadly defined) in late fourteenth- and early fifteenth-century England in a series of complex but rewarding examinations of some of the main doctrinal and theological debating points of the period. His first few chapters (perhaps 'essays' is a better word) suggest that the book's focus will be on the eucharist, in particular the contest over transubstantiation which was greatly stimulated by the emergence of Wycliffism. That is indeed the central concern of the first chapter, dealing with 'The sacrament of the altar in the making of orthodox Christianity or "traditional religion"'. Here the debated and fluid interpretation of the eucharist in the late fourteenth century is highlighted, before homing in on Nicholas Love's *Mirror of the blessed life of Jesus Christ* as an assertion of what became the exclusively acceptable version. The next three chapters (two of them reworkings of material previously published, one of them 'significantly different' [p. xiii] from its earlier manifestation) remain on the eucharistic theme, looking in turn at 'The sacrament of the altar in Piers Plowman', 'John Wyclif: *De eucharistia* (*Tractatus*

*maior*'), and 'Early Wycliffite theology of the sacrament of the altar: Walter Brut and William Thorpe'. These, as might be expected, are solid discussions, although to some extent pushing a line. With the next two chapters there is a marked change of direction. Chapter v, the longest in the volume, shifts from the sanctifying sign of the eucharist to 'The sign of poverty: *Piers Plowman* (the C version)'. The main contention here is that Langland is not an advocate of Franciscan poverty. Chapter vi takes another change of direction, to discuss 'Home, homelessness, and sanctity: conflicting models'. This expands Aers's earlier work on the theme by investigating the ideas in additional texts, including *Dives and pauper* and witness statements in the Norwich heresy trials of 1428–31. The volume has no conclusion, but some sense of the circle being completed comes from the inclusion of Nicholas Love's *Mirror* among the works analysed in the final chapter. As ever, Aers argues closely, and is thought provoking. His ideas may not convince everyone, but his central theme, that core elements of central themes of Catholic theology – even something as central as the eucharist – were still in the process of definition in the late 1300s, and were still contestable, is one which certainly merits serious consideration.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

R. N. SWANSON

*Alabaster images of medieval England*. By Francis Cheetham. Pp. xvii + 218 incl. 18 figs + 21 colour and 91 black-and-white plates. Woodbridge: Boydell (with the Association for Cultural Exchange), 2003. £90. 1 84383 028 0  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905573287

From the second half of the fourteenth century until the Reformation large numbers of religious images were carved in England from alabaster (hydrous calcium sulphate, also known as gypsum) which was extracted 'principally from a comparatively small area of south Derbyshire and the adjoining corner of Staffordshire'. Most commonly these carvings, of which nearly 2,500 survive, take the form of rectangular panels, either mounted together to form altarpieces or used individually for private devotion. However, single standing figures of saints also occur and in a few cases religious images, similar to those found on the panels, were incorporated into alabaster tombs, which were obviously being made by the same people and the production of which continued beyond the Reformation.

Francis Cheetham has been studying English alabaster images for more than forty years and his earlier book, a catalogue *raisonné* of the collection in the Victoria and Albert Museum (*English medieval alabasters ...*, Oxford 1984), has become a standard reference work on the subject. The main body of his new book is a listing of all the examples known to him (in England and abroad), arranged by iconographic subject (divided into sections on saints, the life of the Virgin, the life of Christ, and other single subjects such as the last judgement and those depicting the head of St John the Baptist) with a geographical index, bibliography and short introduction. There is also a summary of the numbers of each subject surviving, and a section on those now or formerly forming altarpieces, for which by far the most common subjects were the life of the Virgin and the Passion of Christ. The illustrations have been sensibly chosen to concentrate upon those examples that are less well known or which have not previously been published, including many abroad and several in private collections.

The preface briefly reviews recent literature and identifies possible areas for future research. One area not explored by Cheetham is the question of how individual alabaster images (and those in other materials) were actually used: a subject tackled in a recent study by Richard Marks (*Image and devotion in late medieval England*, Stroud 2004). As Cheetham points out, much of the historical material in the introduction is covered in more detail in his 1984 study but his new text does include Claude Blair's important revised later dating of the alabaster memorial effigy at Hanbury (Staffs). Inevitably some works appeared too late for inclusion in the bibliography (which ends part way through 2001) and, in addition to Marks's book, mention should be made here of Trevor Cooper (ed.), *The journal of William Dowling* (Woodbridge 2001); Richard Deacon and Phillip Lindley, *Image and idol: medieval sculpture* (London 2001); Stacy Boldrick, David Park and Paul Williamson, *Wonder: painted sculpture from medieval England*, (Leeds 2002); and Richard Marks and Paul Williamson (eds), *Gothic: art for England, 1400–1547* (London 2003). Earlier works that might have been included are Jonathan Alexander and Paul Binski, *Age of chivalry: art in Plantagenet England, 1200–1400* (London 1987), and Nigel Ramsay, 'Alabaster', in J. Blair and N. Ramsay (eds), *English medieval industries* (London–Rio Grande 1991).

As Cheetham admits in his introduction to the catalogue, there are bound to be some omissions in any attempt to list such a large body of material; but this book provides a very useful listing which will become an essential reference tool for those interested in any aspect of the subject and will form a valuable companion to the author's 1984 study.

ROYAL ARMOURIES,  
LEEDS

PHILIP LANKESTER

*Introducing Nicholas of Cusa. A guide to a Renaissance man.* Edited by Christopher M. Bellitto, Thomas M. Izbicki and Gerald Christianson. Pp. xvi + 480. New York–Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2004. \$29.95 (paper). 0 8091 4139 6  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905583283

Though the Heidelberg edition of the works of Nicholas of Cusa (1401–64) is still unfinished, it is regrettable that no intellectual biography has appeared since the 1930s to process the considerable research carried out in Germany and elsewhere. So the book under review has taken on, very reasonably, the character of a compendium: a guide both to Cusanus and his modern bibliography. The volume opens with an 'appreciation' by the president of the American Cusanus Society, Morimichi Watanabe, who is also responsible for the chapter on Nicholas's political thought and theory of jurisprudence. An overview of 'life and works' provides the prologue for an essentially tripartite work: 'Church and society' (emphasising Cusanus' role as a – not especially effective – church reformer), 'Humanism and spirituality' (this includes an account of what can be called without excessive anachronism his contribution to 'inter-religious dialogue'); and 'Philosophy, theology, and science' (bringing out the polymathic character of his interests and competence). The writing shows a uniformly high level of intelligibility, suggesting a strong editorial hand. That makes the more surprising a degree of repetitiveness in the early chapters where the basic facts of Nicholas's biography are multiply retailed.

Given his *penchant* for unusual conceptual coinings, the idea of adding a ‘brief glossary of Cusan terms’ was a good one. The index is admirably done.

BLACKFRIARS,  
CAMBRIDGE

AIDAN NICHOLS

*Solovki. The story of Russia told through its most remarkable islands.* By Roy R. Robson.

Pp. xviii + 302 incl. 30 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004.

£20. 0 300 10270 4

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690559328X

This is another product of the recent revival of North American research on the Russian Orthodox Church, using sources many of which have become accessible only since the collapse of communism. Roy R. Robson, associate professor of history at the University of the Sciences in Philadelphia, has carried through a work of immense scholarship, but his distillation of the result makes his book easily accessible to the non-specialist. He has devised an unusual and effective formula. He views the remote island monastery of Solovki, in the Russian Arctic, as a microcosm of Russian church history and he recounts these almost six centuries through the eyes of the monks who lived there, following in the footsteps of SS Savvatii and German, who founded it in the early fifteenth century. The climax of the book comes near the end, with the appropriation by Lenin of this holy place, which had earlier become a fortress to guard Russia’s northern bastion against foreign intrusion. This is a story told also within the chapters of Alexander Solzhenitsyn’s *Gulag Archipelago*, but here there is a gain from the recounting of a long perspective of history. The book does not quite fulfil the promise of its subtitle. ‘The story of Russia told through its most remarkable islands’ begins, not with the conversion of St Vladimir of Kiev in 988, but with the rise of Muscovy over four hundred years later, though this is of little consequence for the book itself. More serious is the absence of a last chapter. The return to holiness of this unforgettable goal of pilgrimage in 1991, after over seventy years of desecration, is a story worthy of a book in itself, but Robson does not carry his story into this period, beyond a bare mention of the fact that this has taken place. One wishes that his researches had enabled him to represent what the modern pilgrim (and there are many during the summer months, when there is limited transport to the islands once again) might expect to find on completion of what is still a difficult journey. To compensate for this, the final page is a tribute to the late Academician Dmitrii Sergeevich Likhachev, who was a prisoner on Solovki as a young man, but survived to become a renowned historian, receiving at the age of 91 from President Boris Yeltsin the blue ribbon and X-shaped cross of the new Order of St Andrew (‘For Faith and Loyalty’). He was its first recipient.

KESTON INSTITUTE,  
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX



*Patterns of piety. Women, gender and religion in late medieval and Reformation England.*

By Christine Peters. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.)

Pp. xv + 393 incl. 50 ills and 10 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £45. 0 521 58062 5

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905603284

Gender and piety across ‘the great divide’ of medieval and early modern England is the important subject of this monograph by Christine Peters. Controversies over the causes and the impact of ‘the Reformation’ have a long history. Since the sixteenth century, rival Catholic and Protestant polemicists have disputed the effects of religious changes on women. Women, who were not themselves deemed actors in the drama, were said by the Protestants to have received great benefits from the changes, especially a new, positive attitude to marriage and family life; Catholic polemicists and historians, on the other hand, emphasised the loss of female influence on devotional life as Protestants rejected the cults of the Virgin and of the saints. Catholics deplored the closure of the monasteries which meant that women could no longer espouse the single life, but were forced into compulsory heterosexuality. Until recently, historians wrote within a periodisation which sharply demarcated the medieval from the early modern, and the story of the English Reformation was dominated by monarchs, theologians and politicians. Following the lead of Bob Scribner, whose work on the social history of the European Reformation challenged the top-down views of religious change, many scholars including Christopher Haigh, Eamon Duffy, Tessa Watt, Robert Whiting and Judith Maltby, have focused on the processes of religious change. Lyndal Roper’s work questioned the gender significance of the archetypal lay person, ‘the common man’, of the Reformation.

Peters’s book focuses on gender and piety through the late medieval and Reformation periods, analysing the gendered significance of theological beliefs. She argues that in England there were continuities because ‘the representative frail christian was a woman devoted to Christ’ (p. 347). By means of a careful discussion of regional religious practices in the fifteenth century, she demonstrates that there was no ‘traditional religion’ any more than there was a single ‘Reformation’. She questions the significance of the Virgin Mary and the female saints in the medieval Church, arguing that Christocentric devotion had lessened the feminine influence and that the appeal of female saints was not exclusive to women. The stories of Eve and the fall presented in sermons, parish churches and Corpus Christi plays reveal no single view of human nature, and the complex iconography suggests ambiguity about responsibility for sin and the fall. Analysis of the representations of Old Testament stories in ballads and embroidery suggest that even within the framework of patriarchy, images could subvert the gender order.

Peters’s interest is in gender rather than women, and she argues that in any religious situation, gender makes a difference. Men and women have a repertoire of gendered images and stereotypes to draw upon: the question remains, as Peters agrees, how much difference? As she rightly shows in her chapter on parish religion, practices of church seating were diverse, and generalisation consequently difficult. Local traditions, such as separate women’s groups, may have continued after the Reformation. She is aware that the meaning of evidence about religious change is difficult to determine, and that local and personal contours of piety were as important as gender (p. 169). Yet while Peters stresses the heterogeneous nature of

gendered religious experience, she resorts to generalised categories of woman: because 'Christocentric piety had reduced the significance of gendered patterns of devotion, whilst retaining the notion of the laywoman as the religious specialist, that allowed women to experience the Reformation not as an alien male environment, but as one in which ... they could feel at home' (p. 347). There is a tension here, for women were no monolithic group, and how actual women, as distinct from 'the laywoman', experienced religious changes is a more difficult issue. Although Peters is convinced that 'protestantism could not be a hostile environment for the weaker sex', the experiences of some seventeenth-century Protestant women such as Katharine Chidley, Dorothy Hazzard, Martha Simmonds and Anna Trapnel suggest otherwise. The responses of individual women to Christian theology have always differed enormously.

As a feminist historian, perhaps even one of those 'crusading feminist historians' from whom Peters distances herself on the first page of her book, I applaud her discussion of the ambiguities and subtleties of gendered experiences. *Patterns of piety* analyses trends in devotion and in models of conduct. Peters argues that Mary continued to have a significant role in Protestantism (p. 208), and shows that the examples of martyrdoms of Protestant and Catholic women such as Anne Askew and Margaret Clitheroe cannot be understood in parallel terms. John Mush's account of Margaret Clitheroe shows how the godly woman is transformed by her martyrdom, as her confessor becomes her supplicant, a transformation impossible in the Protestant tradition (pp. 288–9).

Peters demonstrates a vast knowledge of late medieval piety and a laudable determination to delineate the subtle complexities of theological discussion. Her text is enhanced with aptly chosen illustrations, and finely produced. (There is only the odd error: christian on p. 98 refers to an author.) With a few more concessions to a general reader, the book could have been made more widely accessible. While undergraduate classes in Britain may have sufficient knowledge to engage with this complex scholarly text, outside Britain its audience will be more limited. This is a pity, for Peters's subtle discussion of the gendered nature of piety and spiritual experience is a fascinating one.

UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA

PATRICIA CRAWFORD

*Savonarola als Apologet. Der Versuch einer empirischen Begründung des christlichen Glaubens in der Zeit der Renaissance.* By Joachim Weinhardt. (Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, 83.) Pp. xi + 296. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2003. €78.

3 11 017522 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905613280

Savonarola wrote two apologetic works: *Solatium itineris mei* (1484); and *Triumphus crucis de veritate dei* (1497). The few critics who have so far considered Savonarola's contribution to apologetics have ignored the first of these. Consequently they have not appreciated the development and significance of his apologetic thinking. Joachim Weinhardt has now subjected Savonarola's apologetic works to sustained critical analysis. His argument is basically in three stages. First, he explains Savonarola's decision to enter the cloister in 1475 in terms of 'a crisis of his Christian self-consciousness' that was precipitated by the state of affairs in the world and in

the Church. How could the success of vice and the failure of virtue be compatible with divine justice? One answer is that it could not: atheism, in the form of neo-Epicureanism was then fashionable, and may have tempted Savonarola. But his answer in fact was to withdraw to the cloister and there produce first the *Solatium*, and then the much more original *Triumphus* to show that Christian belief is true, in spite of appearances to the contrary. Apologetics in fact remained a major pre-occupation throughout Savonarola's career in the Dominican order. Secondly, Weinhardt compares the *Solatium* with the *Triumphus* to reveal a crucial difference: while in the earlier work the main argument for the divine origin of Christianity (and therefore for its truth) is located in history (the miraculous growth of the early Church), in the later work it is located in the present (the transforming power of Christianity in society, where 'the best argument for the truth of belief is the life of Christians, when it is wholly pure and simple'). Thirdly, Weinhardt claims that Savonarola's Dominican career is a consistent whole, for all the roles that he ever undertook in Florence (preacher, prophet, reformer, apologist) were the consequence of his attempt to manage the crisis of Christian self-consciousness that precipitated his withdrawal from the world. Particularly interesting in this study is the examination of Savonarola's assertion that, in the *Triumphus*, he had developed a 'nova philosophia' in which the truth of Christianity is a quasi-mathematical certainty. His 'nova philosophia' starts, like Aristotelian metaphysics, with objects, but here objects from the ecclesiastical universe (the various forms of Christian behaviour) that are perceptible by the senses. It is thus, in one way, empirical. But its place in the history of ideas is not alongside the work of Galileo and Bacon. His concept of experience is not instrumental, like theirs, but phenomenal, like Aristotle's. Therefore it is essentially backward-looking. Savonarola's quasi-mathematical and empirically based method of presenting his case is so far an isolated phenomenon in the discipline of apologetics. From the point of view of its historical effectiveness, it is a dead end. Nevertheless, there is a clear analogy between Savonarola's *Triumphus* and the work of later philosophers like Descartes and Spinoza: he shares their orientation to the 'mos geometricus' for the construction of a non-geometrical science.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
CHICHESTER

PATRICK PRESTON

*Johannes Bugenhagen Pomeranus – vom Reformator zum Reformatoren. Studien zur Biographie.* By Hans-Günter Leder, edited by Volker Gummelt. (Greifswalder theologische Forschungen, 4.) Pp. 440. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2002. £30. 3 631 39080 7; 1439 1708  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905623287

The volume contains a collection of twelve studies – four of them previously unpublished, eight dating from the last twenty years – on the reformer and close friend of Martin Luther, Johannes Bugenhagen. Hans-Günter Leder, former Professor of Church History at the University of Greifswald in Pomerania, has devoted many years of studies to Bugenhagen's formative years as a student in Greifswald, as a biblical humanist and as preacher and professor in Wittenberg. The second focus of the volume lies on Bugenhagen's work as author of church ordinances in northern

Germany – Brunswick, Hamburg, Pomerania – and in Denmark. Despite his eminent role as professor of theology and his importance for the Lutheran Reformation in northern Europe (Luther called him the ‘bishop of the Reformation’), Bugenhagen’s life and activities have been relatively neglected fields of research during the last decades. No modern critical edition beyond the reissue of a nineteenth-century collection of his letters is available, nor have his major exegetical works been edited. Only his church ordinances have been the focus of scholarly attention within the framework of the Sehling edition of German church ordinances. But a modern biography of Bugenhagen is still a *desideratum*. The present volume attempts some first steps towards it. The first study, dating from the Bugenhagen anniversary in 1985, provides a short biographical sketch as an outline. Unfortunately, this text is partisan and conciliatory in tone; moreover, it reflects the tendency of the other studies in this volume and of research in general to neglect the last years of Bugenhagen’s life, the years after Luther’s death. His role in the adiaphoristic controversies, which has darkened and negatively influenced his memory, is insufficiently addressed. On the other hand, Bugenhagen’s development from biblical humanist as a student and young teacher to adherent of Luther’s theology is given a thorough examination in the subsequent studies. The core of this volume consists of four new studies on Bugenhagen’s efforts to establish new church orders in Brunswick, Hamburg and Pomerania and on his work as a preacher and professor of theology in Wittenberg. Leder gives detailed information, describing the situation with a biographical rather than analytical approach. Generally speaking, this volume cannot replace the still much-needed biography, but it does open up perspectives for ongoing research on this underestimated reformer.

MAINZ

HENNING P. JÜRGENS

*Johannes a Lasco in Ostfriesland. Der Werdegang eines europäischen Reformators.* By Henning P. Jürgens. (Spätmittelalter und Reformation, New Ser., 18.) Pp. viii + 431. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2002. €69. 3 16 147754 5; 0937 5740  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905633283

Johannes a Lasco (1499–1560) was not a traditional figure among the reformers of northern Europe. Born into a Polish-Lithuanian noble family, his early life was one of privilege. His uncle, Jan Laski, was one of the highest ranking magnates in the realm – royal chancellor, archbishop of Gnesen and thus primate of Poland – and it was through his association with his uncle that Lasco was introduced to the world of European affairs. Educated in Italy (Rome, Bologna, Padua), he spent time in Hungary, Germany, France, Switzerland and the Netherlands, once lived in Basle at the household of Erasmus (ultimately inheriting his library) and served as an important link in the humanist networks once back in his homeland. On his return to Poland he began to scale the ecclesiastical ladder, but failed to secure the promotion to a bishopric he hoped for (due in part to the diplomatic manoeuvring of his brother in the conflict with Hungary). Ultimately Lasco left Poland altogether – abandoning a career in the Catholic Church for the office of superintendent in the Protestant territory of East Friesland, where he remained until 1549, when the Interim necessitated a move to England. Jürgens’s study examines the period of Lasco’s life to 1549 – his early career in Poland, followed by

his tenure as superintendent at Emden. Rooted in archival and printed sources (with a register of extant correspondence included), and thoroughly at home with the literature of both western and eastern Europe, Jürgens's investigation manages to look in depth at the twists and turns of Lasco's life without forcing the material into any one preconceived pattern. Lasco's conversion to Protestantism, for instance, has been explained with reference to his setbacks in the Polish Church (and this is mooted at p. 159), but there was a broader canvas as well, as Jürgens details, an interplay of political, ecclesiastical, familial and ideological forces that must be taken into account. The nature of Lasco's Protestant belief is another tricky area. A student of Erasmus, in the sense that he was much more concerned with the reform of religious life than the subtleties of abstract theology (he was generally averse to all confessions of faith), in his rigid approach to the organisation of the Church, especially his emphasis on discipline, clerical reform and the removal of altars and images, Lasco was clearly the heir of Zwingli and Calvin. And yet right up to the eve of his Protestant defection – indeed, even after his marriage in 1540 – he countenanced the possibility of remaining in the Catholic Church. *Johannes a Lasco in Ostfriesland* accommodates the complexities and seeming inconsistencies of Lasco's life while offering a precise study of his development as a Reformed clergyman, just as it bridges the literary and linguistic traditions that make up the body of thought on his life and career. Jürgens has written an excellent treatment of both the man and his world, one which sheds light on both the centre and the peripheries of Reformation history.

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY,  
BELFAST

C. SCOTT DIXON

*Deutsche evangelische Gemeinden im Ausland. Ihre Entstehungsgeschichte und die Entwicklung ihrer Rechtsbeziehungen zur Evangelischen Kirche in Deutschland.* By Britta Wellnitz. (Jus Ecclesiasticum, 71.) Pp. xxii + 563. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €99. 3 16 147976 9; 0449 4349  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690564328X

Britta Wellnitz aims to analyse and describe the way of life of German Protestant parishes in foreign countries. She concentrates on the development of legal relations between these parishes and their mother Church in Germany. In her analysis she takes into consideration the whole period between the age of the Reformation and the 'new' German Protestant Church (EKD) after the end of the Cold War; the contract between the EKD and the German Protestant parish in Antwerp from June 2000 is her last chronological reference. The book is the first investigation of this topic for the whole history of the German Protestant Churches. In spite of her focus on legal relations, the author seems to feel obliged to combine her 'canonical' view with a 'historical' view on the different periods, in which the life of the parishes and their relations with the mother Church were established and strengthened. With regard to this combination of both 'canonical' and historical or periodical focus, she divides her work into three main parts. The first concentrates on basic conditions for legal relations between the mother Church and her parishes abroad. This part contains an overview of the history and different types of today's parishes as well as a survey of the beginnings of support for them from the mother country. In the second

main part Wellnitz describes relations from the nineteenth century to the year 1945. This chapter is not structured around topics (for example the engagement of the Prussian Protestant Church or the engagement of other German Protestant Churches) but chronologically (for example the period from 1933 to 1945). In her third section Wellnitz focuses her attention on the years after the Second World War and includes a chapter on the re-establishment of relations between the western German Protestant Churches and their parishes abroad and one on the further development of this 'Auslandsarbeit'. For this she finds a systematic background, the 'Auslandsarbeit' of the EKD in an ecumenical context. Taken as a whole, this book is a virtual compendium of the contracts, laws and arrangements concerning this part of the German Protestant 'Auslandsarbeit', which are described, commented upon or quoted by the author for the whole period from the age of the Reformation until the mid-1990s.

MÜNSTER

HEIKO OVERMEYER

*Luther on women. A sourcebook.* Edited and translated by Susan C. Karant-Nunn and Merry E. Wiesner-Hanks. Pp. viii + 246. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £42.50 (cloth), £15.95 (paper). 0 521 65091 7; 0 521 65884 5  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905653286

This book brings together a broad selection of Luther's writings about women, drawn from a variety of sources including not only his theological treatises, but also sermons, pamphlets, letters and his 'table talk'. The texts are collected into ten sections, each of which is prefaced by a brief introduction. The editors note the surprising fact that despite Luther's undoubted influence on the lives of women within the Protestant Reformation, there has never been a book-length study on his views of women. German scholarship has frequently considered Luther as the rescuer of marriage in the face of Catholic praise of virginity; scholars from outside Germany, in particular social historians, have pointed out that Luther's elevation of marriage in fact restricted women's options (pp. 7–8). However, there is much more to be said. The editors intend this collection to begin the work of filling 'this odd gap in the scholarship on both Luther and women' (p. 2), by highlighting both Luther's theory of women – as biologically designed for child-bearing, confined to the domestic sphere under the authority of the *paterfamilias* – and the reality of his close relationship to and dependence upon his wife. They point to the difficulty of making a selection from Luther's vast range of writings, and caution the reader to be aware of Luther's complex shifts of mood and thought.

The first section includes texts considering the nature of women, focusing in particular on Eve, and drawn largely from Luther's sermons and commentaries on Genesis. Luther rejected any idea that women were not truly human, arguing that women, like men, had been created in the image of God, although made weaker and more inferior (p. 26). This is an important point in an intellectual culture which sometimes saw women as not human, and thus also not *imago Dei*; it is unfortunate that the editors do not make this background explicit. Luther's approach to Mary sees him giving new importance to her role as wife and mother as well as virgin. He criticises celebrations of her conception, birth or ascension as unscriptural, although in the early 1520s he was still preaching (critical) sermons on these feast days. Luther

emphasises Christ's humanity by allusions to contemporary understandings of conception and the development of the foetus: as an embryo Christ was nourished in the womb by drops of his mother's blood (p. 51).

The third section considers Luther's treatment of other biblical women. His exegesis of Joel seeks to explain why it has sometimes (exceptionally) been expedient for women to preach or to prophesy. Following New Testament injunctions that women should not preach or teach, Luther concludes that 'women, children and incompetent people' are excluded from the ministry of word and sacrament (p. 75).

The most substantial section of the book is that dedicated to marriage and family as found in Luther's exegesis of Genesis, treatises on marriage, wedding sermons and the table talk. Luther sees marriage as springing from the dual needs of perpetuating the species and channelling the sexual drive. It is an intimate, emotional bond between man and women (p. 88), and he notes the bitter pain of losing a good spouse or a beloved child (p. 123). Luther asserts that marriage of male and female is part of divine order, occurring throughout nature, amongst all creatures, trees and even gemstones (pp. 122, 124). A central theme is how this order is revealed within marriage: in the woman's subjection to the man and the delineation of roles within the relationship. Marriage thus serves as both model and foundation for the whole of society. Women keep the house in order; if this were to fail, so too would 'worldly governance, cities, and order' (p. 125). But as early as 1522, well before his own marriage and experience of fatherhood, Luther defends a father's right to wash diapers (nappies) or 'perform some other mean task for his child' without being ridiculed (p. 107). A 1530 treatise *On marriage matters* discusses the problem of secret marriages, seeking also to curtail parents' powers to prevent their children from marrying. His *Advice to pastors* (1529) gives a form for the marriage service, with the vows being exchanged outside the church and the couple only then being led by the pastor to the altar (p. 117). Women may be subordinate but they are human individuals: Luther lambasts Sebastian Franck for daring to suggest that '[in the dark] all women are the same' ('Or why are not all men, too, the same in the dark?' he asks: p. 122).

This leads into the consideration of Luther's understanding of sexuality. Luther sees her sexual nature as the core of a woman's being, suggest the editors, so that for both women and men the power of lust presents an enormous problem. Thus, women are designed for procreation and as 'a medicine against fornication' (p. 147). Only a very few are called to chastity, Luther writes to three nuns; if they are not, they should leave the convent and marry (without worrying about whether their parents will be angry or die, p. 141). As a result of the Fall, sex is no longer a 'noble delight' but to be compared to epilepsy or falling sickness (p. 147); nevertheless it is a gift of God and marriage therefore should be consummated; for Luther, impotence is a ground for divorce. Several extracts consider adultery, which Luther sees as resulting often from boredom in marriage and a failure to appreciate the spouse as a gift of God. Luther condemns both prostitution, pleading for town brothels to be closed, and 'Italian marriage' (sodomy) which, he asserts, was brought to Germany by the Carthusians.

For Luther, a woman's true calling is child-bearing. The section on childbirth further illustrates Luther's understanding of biology, including a discussion of the effects of the experiences of pregnant women on the foetus she carries. An important question is that of emergency baptism: at what stage of the birth can a baby be

baptised (not until it has been fully born, argues Luther: an arm or foot may not be baptised, p. 184).

Luther's view of marriage, sexuality and childbirth was shaped by his own marriage. A section on Katharina von Bora includes a number of his letters to and about her together with extracts from the table talks in which he speaks of her. The range of titles with which he addresses his 'Lord preacher, doctor Käthe' is intriguing; her voice is not heard. The volume closes with a selection of Luther's correspondence with women (mainly noblewomen and the wives of other reformers, some of whose letters have survived) and a brief section relating Luther's (fairly traditional) understanding of women's role in witchcraft and magic.

This is a wide-ranging collection which demonstrates the complexity of Luther's thinking about women. The chapter introductions are somewhat light on background information – for instance on the Aristotelian roots of Luther's understanding of sexuality and on Luther's theological concerns – and the list of further reading is of little help, since it includes only works relating to Luther and women. It would be useful also to have the Weimar edition references for all texts. None the less, the editors have produced a good aid to understanding Luther's views of women, both in theory and in practice, which goes some way to filling a notable research gap.

RUHR-UNIVERSITÄT BOCHUM

CHARLOTTE METHUEN

*Christian contradictions. The structures of Lutheran and Catholic thought.* By Daphne Hampson.

Pp. xi + 323. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £42 (cloth), £18.99 (paper). 0 521 45060 8

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905663282

There are two questions the reader may put to this systematically crafted book. The first, implicit in every review, is 'Why was this book written?' and can be answered by an imaginary anecdote. Suppose you overheard two people comparing notes about a dinner party they had attended together the night before. And suppose, as they spoke, it became clear to you (though not to them) that although they thought they were talking about the same event, in fact one was talking about the dinner itself while the other was talking about the party, i.e., the whole evening. It might frustrate you, the eavesdropper, to the point of exclaiming, 'But look, even though you both agree it was a smashing event, you're not really talking about the same thing.' Such seems to be Daphne Hampson's state of mind as she eavesdrops on ecumenical discussions between Lutherans and Catholics. They use similar-sounding words ('faith', 'grace', 'justification') but she is persuaded that one is talking about the meat loaf while the other is thinking of the conversation in the living room.

Hampson's recurring thesis is that words – even theological words – can only be understood in their context, and Lutheran words operate in a different context to that Catholics use or understand. She proposes to throw light upon that inscrutable Lutheran context. While Catholicism is concerned with a change brought about within the person, Lutheranism is concerned with living *extra se*, in God through Christ by alien righteousness. This difference is not one of emphasis, nor due to Luther's original personality, it is a structural difference, and as long as Catholics fail



to understand the radical quality of this different Lutheran structure, true understanding and true communication is not happening.

The first chapter, then, examines 'Luther's revolution' and tries to convey the structure of Lutheran thought. It was a nostalgic experience for this reviewer to read the chapter, since he once stood deep within this thought structure himself. Seminary lectures and past authors came flooding back to him as Hampson accurately explained that for Lutherans everything turns on extrinsic righteousness, including that baffling Lutheran shibboleth *simul justus et peccator*. This does not mean that a Christian is half just and half sinful, like a spiritual centaur; it means that our righteousness is outside ourselves (*extra se*), in Christ. Grace is not the help we receive to climb upward toward God, grace is God meeting us on the bottom rung of the ladder. Therefore, for Lutherans 'justification' is not one doctrine among others, it is the name for the Gospel's Copernican revolution which reverses who is moving when God and man draw near each other. Luther had moved to a new paradigm. All religion ascends, the Gospel descends, and there is too much religion in Catholicism.

Lacking insight into this Lutheran gnosis, misunderstandings will ensue. Hampson tests her hypothesis in chapters ii and iii which consider, respectively, the Catholic alternative and Catholic incomprehension. She portrays Trent's alternative as completely failing to notice Luther's paradigm shift, and she surveys uncomprehending Catholics today who continue to think within a Catholic universe when writing about Lutheranism, thereby missing the point. The Catholics have not seen what she has seen, and she chastens such as Rahner, von Balthasar and Dulles for displaying a 'depth of ignorance.' She munificently volunteers to indicate the breadth of Catholic misreading of Lutheranism in the next four chapters by a case study of the reception Nygren's *Agape and eros* received, a survey of modern ecumenical dialogists, a focused look at Bultmann's radical attempt to fit Lutheranism in the modern world and Kierkegaard's nearly successful attempt to reconcile divergent viewpoints.

The second question to ask of this book is vaguely like the first: 'why did this author write this book?' Hampson no longer believes it can be said of Jesus that 'he and he alone had a second and divine nature', believing instead 'that he was simply a very fine man, one who was deeply in tune with God'. Here she stands; she can do no other, having suffered this post-Enlightenment paradigm shift. No one can believe any longer in this particularity of revelation, and what we anthropomorphically called 'God' is better understood as a "dimension" of the total reality which exists'. An honest and polite person, Hampson acknowledges that this is hardly compatible with Christianity, so she chooses to describe herself as post-Christian (intimated by the title of her earlier work, *After Christianity*). So why does she write this book?

For one thing, there is the frustration of the eavesdropper. She offers her services as the little boy who shouted that the emperor has no clothes (her illustration), pointing out that affirmations have changed beyond recognition due to the paradigm shift. For another, the issues are still interesting (freedom, determinism, virtue ethics) even though the dogmatic framework must obviously be discarded. For a third, she does think that Catholics would find much to sympathise with if they could only grasp accurately what Lutherans mean when they speak of living *extra se* in Christ. Yet it did feel at times that the only satisfactory proof that *simul justus et peccator* has been accurately understood is if the disagreement continues. Catholic ecumenists who try to integrate what is right about Luther's phrase into the larger Catholic picture are

rebuffed for not fully understanding the idea; if they had understood it, they could not have accommodated it. Perhaps this is what happens when one is not an ecumenist oneself, but only taking a tour through ecumenism. Or perhaps it is the cost of constantly putting forward a phrase from the past. Catholicism can grow by its ecumenical encounter, but she (along with repristinators generally) seems to say the understanding must remain untouched in order to be truly Lutheran. But, then, this must be one of the disadvantages of a dead *magisterium* over a live one. I recognise her description of the Lutheranism I left; I don't recognise her description of my Catholicism, which is why I remain.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

DAVID W. FAGERBERG

*The evolution of the English Churches, 1500–2000.* By Doreen Rosman. Pp. xiv + 399 incl. 31 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £50 (cloth), £18.99 (paper). 0 521 64205 1; 0 521 64556 5  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905673289

This book tells the story of the English Churches over five hundred years, from the Reformation to the end of the second millennium. Dr Rosman pays particular attention to ordinary churchgoers and the clergy who ministered to them. Her audience is non-specialists, students and members of Churches; theological ideas are explained in everyday language, fulfilling the intention to explore the experience of past generations of churchgoers in a way accessible and interesting to their descendants today. In twelve chapters she recounts the development of institutional Christianity, including all the significant manifestations of Christian believing and belonging in England, at the level of the parish and the local congregation. The chapters more or less follow the conventional periodisation of English church history, but careful links are made so that there is a sense of linkage between periods, thus making the case for the claim of the title, 'The evolution of the English Churches'. Particular attention may be paid to the ordinary and local, but it is set within the broader European and international context. The style is simple, but conveys complex ideas with clarity and lucidity. The explanation of, for example, Calvinism on pp. 59–60, sheds showers of light. The book may be intended for the non-specialist, but, throughout, refreshing new connections, and shrewd comments are made, that help to make sense of things one ought to have thought of, but had not. It illustrates the much neglected value of simplifying and honing ideas, and their expression, to achieve profundity, as well as clarity. The book breaks new ground in chapters xi and xii, dealing with the English Churches in the twentieth century, giving sympathetic and shrewd attention to the development of new Churches, and the ecumenical movement, as well as the changed situation of the 'traditional' Churches. Specialists may wish to quibble about occasional judgements of balance, but these can only be quibbles, for Rosman judiciously takes into account and evaluates the current state of research and scholarship across this broad period, and reminds us of simple truths, such as 'People who are content tend not to leave records' (p. 67). The evidence of the extensive reading of which this book is the fruit is set out in an admirable 'bibliographical essay' which will be invaluable to anyone beginning teaching or research in a particular area. This is an ideal book to give people interested in ecclesiastical history, but it is much more than an introductory

textbook, and few even seasoned ecclesiastical historians would not learn something from it.

LONDON

WILLIAM M. JACOB

*Martin Bucer zwischen Luther und Zwingli*. Edited by Matthieu Arnold and Berndt Hamm. (Spätmittelalter und Reformation. Neue Reihe, 23.) Pp. viii + 170. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €59. 3 16 147763 4; 0937 5740 *JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905683285

The eight papers in this volume highlight the recently published volume of Martin Bucer's correspondence from 1529 to September 1530, a period that included both the Marburg Colloquy and the Diet of Augsburg. The papers by Berndt Hamm and Roland Liebenberg focus on Bucer's argument for toleration of religious differences expressed in his dedicatory letter to the Marburg Academy in the 1530 edition of his Gospels commentary. Andreas Puchta compares the Strasbourger's justification for the removal of images in his 1524 correspondence with Zwingli with the arguments of his 1530 treatise on the same topic. Reinhold Friedrich examines Bucer's position on the lord's supper as reflected in his correspondence of 1530, while Annie Noblesse-Rocher looks at that correspondence for the influence of medieval theologians on Bucer's eucharistic theology. Matthieu Arnold compares the views of Luther and Bucer on God's working at the Diet of Augsburg, and Nicole de Laharpe uses Luther's *Tischreden* about Bucer, the lord's supper, and the Sacramentarians to determine what the Wittenberger thought of Bucer. Volkmar Ortman's paper on Bucer's role at the religious colloquies of 1540/41 is included as evidence of the Strasbourger's later ecumenical efforts. The papers are of varying quality, but the best of them further our understanding of Bucer's position between Luther and Zwingli.

UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA—LINCOLN

AMY NELSON BURNETT

*God's last words. Reading the English Bible from the Reformation to fundamentalism*. By David S. Katz. Pp. xvi + 397. New Haven—London: Yale University Press, 2004. £25. 0 300 10115 5 *JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905693281

Building on the presupposition that 'everything connects', David Katz's latest book develops his established interest in the contours of intellectual history and centres on one of the most fundamental and widely disseminated Protestant maxims. *God's last words* follows Luther's identification of Scripture as 'the only Protestant source of authority' (p. x), and traces the development of *sola scriptura* through the early modern period, arguing that, despite the efforts of conservative theologians, the Bible could not conceal its own very human normality. *God's last words* elucidates the paradox that the unique authority of Scripture was undermined by well-meaning attempts to defend it.

Despite the title's reference to fundamentalism and brief concluding references to Hal Lindsey's *The late great planet earth* (1970), the book concentrates on the reception and deconstruction of *sola scriptura* in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Throughout the period, Protestant theology's obvious adherence to Luther's maxim was challenged by the rise of historical consciousness. Providentialism was an exotic

plant in the intellectual hothouse of the Enlightenment, and its eventual demise caused as many difficulties for the textual as for the theological study of Scripture. With the impact of copyright-consciousness, an increasing sense of the importance of interpretation and the rise of an interpreting class, with literary scholars replacing the priest, the Bible began to lose its gloss as the sole authority in questions of religious faith. But it was in the nineteenth century that the fall of *sola scriptura* reached its critical mass, when conservative scholars, adhering to the ideal of an infallible text, investigated its (fallible) details with such unflinching devotion that their discoveries decimated its divine status. In discussions of philology, chronology and quantification, Protestant orthodoxy's defence of *sola scriptura* pulled the rug from under the Reformation. A tenacious commitment to inerrancy was replaced by a frank admission of error, and *sola scriptura* was rescued from oblivion only by the sudden and unpredictable rise of American fundamentalism.

Reflecting recent trends in the area, *God's last words* emphasises the importance of textual reception in interpretive communities. The Bible provided 'the common code of the English-speaking world' (p. xi), and was 'the text that was read the most, heard the most, and discussed the most at all levels of society' (p. 41). But Katz's focus is much more specific than his title and these comments suggest. He concentrates on a selective range of generally elite readers, though the criteria of selection is not always clear. The individuals and groups isolated for discussion do have a preponderance for millennialism and the esoteric, but it is uncertain whether this reflects the general importance and pervasive nature of this kind of thinking, the illustrative value of the semiotics of intellectual extremity or Katz's own long-standing and well-informed interests in the area.

Perhaps the most significant weakness of the book's argument is its presupposition that *sola scriptura* is co-extensive with a commitment to biblical inerrancy. This inference may be related to the book's reluctance to engage with American habits of thought. Recent debate about the Princeton tradition, for example, has emphasised that Charles Hodge's *Systematic theology* (1871–3) was prepared to admit errors in the text of Scripture, but emphatically refused to concede that these in any way undermined biblical authority. Recent research has suggested that Hodge's successor, B. B. Warfield, was the first to displace the locus of Protestant authority from the extant to the authorial manuscripts. His location of inspiration in the obviously unidentifiable autograph texts meant that textual criticism, properly pursued, was something that would lead Christians to – rather than from – their true and inerrant authority. Warfield's paradigm offered a fundamental rethinking of the basis for *sola scriptura*, and provided twentieth-century evangelicalism with its most pervasive ideal. These contexts, had they been considered, would have qualified the book's representation of the sudden and unexpected appearance of Fundamentalism 'just at the moment when it seemed that Holy Writ would henceforth be read just like any other book' (p. xvi).

That said, *God's last words* offers little in the way of a description of fundamentalism, other than noting a propensity for 'Bible worship' (p. 52). Fundamentalism is represented by C. I. Scofield's *Reference Bible* (1909, 1917), *The Fundamentals* project (1910–15) and by Billy Graham, Jerry Falwell, Pat Robertson and Hal Lindsay – all strong millennialists – but the citation of these mainly dispensational writers and texts critically reduces the movement's intellectual range. Nor is it fair to identify their fundamentalism, a twentieth-century

phenomenon, with historic evangelicalism, which stretches at least to the eighteenth century (Katz makes this identification on p. 313). Indeed, evangelicalism's broader ambitions sit uneasily in the parameters established by *God's last words*. David Bebbington, in his monumental history of *Evangelicalism in modern Britain* (1989), argues that while 'biblicism' (the belief that the Bible is the source of all spiritual truth) is a founding characteristic of the movement, a belief in inerrancy is not. Historically, evangelicalism has insisted on the necessity of *sola scriptura* without requiring a commitment to the inerrancy Katz appears to understand as its definition.

*God's last words*, nevertheless, presents a rich, graceful and subtle argument, ranging from a consideration of the economic issues surrounding the publication of Scripture to the uses to which its manuscripts and narratives were put. Katz's latest work is an elaborate, enthusiastic and entertaining guide to the eclectic and often haphazard world of Protestant biblical scholarship.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

CRAWFORD GRIBBEN

*Scotland, England, and the Reformation, 1534–1561*. By Clare Kellar. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. xi + 257. Oxford: Clarendon, 2003. £45. 0 19 926670 0  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905703286

The fashion for applying the frame of 'British' history to the pre-1603 period appears to be fading. This invaluable monograph is a fine example of what can be achieved if the history of the British kingdoms is studied without imposing such an arbitrary framework on it. Rather than treating the islands as a natural unit, this study examines the religious relationship between two kingdoms on one island during the period between Henry VIII's break with Rome and Mary Stewart's acceptance that she would have to rule a Protestant kingdom. During these years of uncertainty, religious reformers and conservatives alike from both countries looked – and frequently fled – to the 'neighbour realm'. Kellar's achievement is to demonstrate how the English and Scottish Reformations became intertwined while retaining their distinctive flavours. The book is episodic in nature, as we drop in on the flashpoints of the international religious relationship. Inevitably, these tend to focus more on Scotland than England, but scholars with purely English interests will have a good deal to learn here too. Kellar points out the extent to which the English Catholic exiles whom James V harboured were a focus of concern for Henry VIII, and indeed a major cause of war in 1542; it is an important treatment of a long-neglected subject. Likewise, it is valuable to learn how much the Marian exile was an Anglo-Scottish affair, in which the Scots had distinct views on the questions which divided the exiles. The parallels she draws between the reforming efforts of Archbishops Cranmer and Hamilton are intriguing, although perhaps a little overplayed. All this is grounded in impressively thorough research on both countries' sources. In a book filled with sharp observations and provocative comments, there are a few false notes. I am not convinced that the 'assuring' was seen as an explicitly evangelical ceremony by the English agents attempting to recruit Scots to their cause in the 1540s, much less by the Scots themselves. And the focus on Anglo-Scottish relations can be distorting, as the relationship can be made to seem more important than it in fact was for either side. But this is in fact the book's greatest strength: as well as

showing that the two kingdoms did genuinely affect one another's destiny in this remarkable period, it allows us to see them both through one another's eyes.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALEC RYRIE

*The Italian reformers and the Zürich church, c. 1540–1620.* By Mark Taplin. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xiv + 368 incl. 2 maps. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. £49.99. 0 7546 0978 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905713282

This revised doctoral dissertation, written at St Andrews University under the supervision of Bruce Gordon, is an important study illuminating a hitherto unexplored international dimension to Zürich's contribution to the spread of the Reformation to Italian-speaking regions such as Locarno. After the reinstatement of the Roman inquisition in 1542, Italian evangelicals fled Italy and many found a home in Zürich. The central focus of this book is the threat to the orthodox establishment in Zürich posed by some of the more radical Italian exiles. In particular, Taplin does a marvellous job exploring the controversy with Bernardino Ochino, the Capuchin general who served as pastor of the Locarnese congregation in Zürich (1554–63) but was later expelled because of his heterodox views. While Italian immigrants did not flee from Italy in the same numbers as those in France or the Netherlands, still this work demonstrates that it was indeed a significant movement in Italy – so significant that many apostatised and found refuge in Zürich.

Taplin notes that Ochino began making questionable assertions as early as 1560, but was not expelled until 1563. The author does not make the assertion, but I have long suspected that part of the reason Ochino was tolerated in those last years by the Zürich divines was because of his long association with Peter Martyr Vermigli. I wonder if Vermigli protected his more radical fellow exile in so far as his conscience would allow. Taplin does make mention of Peter Martyr Vermigli and notes that his orthodoxy was never suspect despite his close association with Ochino. What about the other orthodox Italians – namely, the members of the Italian congregation who saw eye to eye with the Zürich reformers? It would appear that there was an interesting intra-Italian subplot that swirled within the larger debates between the Zürich clergy and heterodox Italians. This is not a criticism of the book – merely the curiosity of a specialist. One of the important historiographical issues Taplin does raise concerns the Zürich principle of scriptural sufficiency. We are reminded that some of the Radicals turned this principle on its head, arguing that the logical conclusion of this Reformation principle led to the anti-Trinitarian views of Biandrata, Stancarò and Gentile. Interestingly, the Zürich theologians, such as Josiah Simler were forced to acknowledge that the corrupt Roman Church still retained vestiges of true Christianity – an admission not often made.

Drawing heavily on unpublished archival sources, Taplin sheds new light on the inner workings of the Zürich church as well as the Ochino controversy. This work is a superior contribution to our knowledge not only of how Zürich functioned in its formative years, but also the limits of toleration. This volume pays rich dividends for those interested in Italian and Swiss reformation movements.

REFORMED THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,  
 ORLANDO

FRANK A. JAMES III

*William Cecil and episcopacy, 1559–1577*. By Brett Usher. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xix + 246. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. £47.50.  
 0 7546 0834 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905723289

This is the first ever study of William Cecil's relations with the earliest of Elizabeth I's bishops; it is also the first of what will be two volumes by Brett Usher on the Elizabethan episcopate from the settlement of religion in 1559 to Cecil's death, as Lord Burghley, in 1598. Usher's thesis, put simply, is that Cecil was a committed Protestant who wanted the Elizabethan bishops to look something like the superintendents of the reformed Churches of Europe. He wanted the bishops to be funded properly for their work; this work was to preach, not to exercise great power as temporal lords and governors. Cecil's beliefs could be summed up in a sentence he wrote to the Lords of the Congregation in Scotland: 'I like no spoil, but I allow to have good things put to good uses, as to ... the maintenance of the ministry of the Church ... and to relieve the poor members of Christ, being in body and limbs impotent.' So when Archbishop Parker of Canterbury wrote to Cecil that 'I doubt in these days neither bishops or ministers may be thought worthy to eat venison' he may not have been joking: Cecil had better things for bishops to do. *William Cecil and episcopacy* is an important book. For years Elizabethan historians have noticed an odd sort of disjunction between the beliefs of Elizabeth when it came to the Church and the rather different instincts and predilections of her councillors. If Elizabeth wanted to squash the people we describe by the shorthand of 'Puritan', men like Cecil and Robert Dudley, earl of Leicester, wanted to be their patrons. There were probably many reasons for this strange arrangement. The complicated nature of the Elizabethan settlement of religion was certainly one. Another reason, or at least a context, was the exile of the 1550s: many of the leading candidates for high offices in the Church in 1558 had left England in the reign of Mary. Some, perhaps more painfully for the queen, had stood for Lady Jane Dudley in 1553 and turned their backs on Elizabeth Tudor as well as Mary. Usher brings out very well these tensions in early Elizabethan Church and government. Usher's book is a monograph; it is built on detail. He uses the records of the exchequer to investigate the complicated financial transactions between government and bishops. These were often related to matters of patronage at court, and Usher does a good job of picking out some of the relationships, often productive but also often difficult, between courtiers and bishops. Here there are personalities as well as policies, and rightly so. Above all we learn from this book that William Cecil had formed ideas about the office of bishop and about the bishops as men. To call him an ideologue might be going too far, but though Usher shows him to have been a powerful politician it is clear that Cecil did not have the distaste for religion his biographer Conyers Read thought he had.

KING'S COLLEGE,  
 CAMBRIDGE

STEPHEN ALFORD

*Region, religion and patronage. Lancastrian Shakespeare.* Edited By Richard Dutton, Alison Findlay and Richard Wilson. Pp. xiii + 258 incl. 7 figs + 3 colour plates. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2003. £16.99 (paper). 0 7190 6368 X; 07190 6369 8

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905733285

‘Lancastrian Shakespeare’ may or may not have existed; it all depends on whether one is to identify the playwright with the ‘William Shakeshafte’, possibly a player, who is named in the 1581 will of the Lancashire Catholic nobleman Alexander Hoghton. First suggested by Oliver Baker in 1937, and elaborated by Peter Milward, Ernst Honigmann and others, this hypothesis has remained alive due to the discovery of several connections between Lancashire and Stratford-upon-Avon around the time of Shakespeare’s youth. It has recently benefited, too, from a high-profile relaunching. This volume is one of two simultaneously-issued collections of papers from a conference on the topic held at Lancaster University (the other, with the same team of editors, has also been published by Manchester University Press under the title *Theatre and religion: Lancastrian Shakespeare*). In aggregate they edge towards a disconcerting kind of scholarship, neither biographical nor exactly counterfactual. But the volume’s three editors are at pains all along to point out how the case stands, and many contributors fascinatingly succeed in proving that there would have been plenty to attract a stage-struck young man to north-west England. Like Siobhan Keenan’s recent *Travelling players in Shakespeare’s England*, some essays critique the metropolitan bias exhibited by previous historians of Shakespeare’s theatre, and point to the flourishing tradition of dramatic patronage outside London: David George provides a case study of the playhouse at Prescot in Lancashire and Sally-Beth Maclean discusses the itineraries of entertainers sponsored by the earls of Derby, while Phebe Jensen incisively revisits the famous Star Chamber case which preserves evidence of a recusant dramatic company in Yorkshire, the Simpson players. As this suggests, not all the essays are directly to do with Shakespeare. Of those that are, Philippa Berry makes a compelling case for a subtext to *Romeo and Juliet* which plays on the differences between the Julian and Gregorian calendar, postulating a Shakespeare who could build cryptic references to an issue associated with Catholicism into a play’s referential field – seemingly, though, for reasons of dramatic irony rather than confessionalism. Even if the Shakespeare/Shakeshafte hypothesis remains at stalemate, it will not have been futile if it encourages more literary scholars and historians to look seriously at provincial theatre and the Catholic contribution to post-Reformation English culture; and even if any project based around it runs the risk of being *Hamlet* without the prince, the current volume has, at least, plenty to tell us about player kings.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ALISON SHELL

*Visite pastorali in diocesi di Pavia nel cinquecento. Una documentazione guadagnata alla storia.* By Xenio Toscani. (Annali dell’Istituto storico italo-germanico in Trento. Quaderni, 61.) Pp. 319 + CD ROM. Bologna: il Mulino, 2003. €28 (paper). 88 15 08966 7

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905743281

This book contains three studies of sixteenth-century pastoral visitations in the diocese of Pavia, mainly between 1561 and 1567 and in 1592. It is part of a project



developed at the Istituto Storico Italo-Germanico in Trento, which seeks to build a comprehensive database of Italian visitation records since the Middle Ages (see Cecilia Nubola [ed.], *Per una banca dati delle visite pastorali italiane: le visite della diocesi di Trento [1537–1940]*, Bologna 1998). The main interest of the present volume lies in the reconstruction of the original configuration of Pavia's visitation records: long believed to be lost, many of these were in reality dispersed in a nineteenth-century archival reorganisation. In his contribution, Xenio Toscani explains the rationalistic criteria according to which the records were dismembered and assigned to new archival units; and he reassembles them (albeit only on paper) in their original order. Cesare Sora examines the first Tridentine visitations, conducted by Bishop Ippolito De' Rossi, and Mario Giorgio discusses the 1592 visitation undertaken by Bishop (and future saint) Alessandro Sauli. These studies richly document the visitors' objectives, procedures and findings; of lesser interest is the analysis of the religious conditions under inspection. The book features numerous tables and maps; it is accompanied by a useful CD-ROM containing an edition of the visitation texts, including those of the 1460 visitation by Amicus De' Fossulanis (studied previously by Toscani), and other ancillary materials.

MIAMI UNIVERSITY

WIETSE DE BOER

*Religion, politics, and society in sixteenth-century England*. Edited by Ian W. Archer (with Simon Adams, G. W. Bernard, Mark Greengrass, Paul E. J. Hammer and Fiona Kisby). (Camden 5th ser., 22.) Pp. xi + 282. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (for the Royal Historical Society), 2003. £45. 0 521 81867 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905753288

This is a rich feast of five miscellaneous off-cuts from Tudor primary sources, the sort of material published in huge quantities by Victorian editors, but in these cases more or less unknown and unused by historians until the end of the twentieth century. Fiona Kisby presents memoranda on protocol in the Chapel Royal of the early Tudors, compiled by John Norris, a gentleman usher of traditionalist disposition: it seems to have been written for the new Protestant monarch Elizabeth I and can be seen as a significant influence in preserving much royal religious ceremonial despite the coming of Protestantism. Next, a pair of manuscripts providing an insider's view on the infighting of mid-Tudor politics has already helped several historians enrich the story of the period, and it is a pleasure to see them available in print. The editors make out a good case for authorship by the idealistic Protestant civil servant John Hales, although they do not speak with one voice on this. An exotic from Geneva is the memorial produced by a Genevan envoy, Jean Malliet, who was sent abroad at the time of the city's major crisis of 1583 in order to get help and money from France and England against the threat of conquest from Catholic Savoy. This provides a fascinating glimpse of the international Reformed Protestant community in action, and also illuminates the uneasy relationship of its Calvinist component to the English Reformed Protestant polity: the envoy arrived in the last impotent days of Archbishop Grindal's tenure of Canterbury before the succession of John Whitgift, and not all the English and Welsh bishops were helpful (the promotion of Marmaduke Middleton and the see of St David's to archiepiscopal status in a footnote on p. 190 will not inconvenience readers overmuch). By contrast, Malliet

was put directly in touch with the East Anglian would-be presbyterian leadership of the English Classical Movement, who were predictably enthusiastic for the Genevan cause. Overall, England proved remarkably generous in its financial response to the appeal. Last, a valuable rediscovery of correspondence of 1590–1 between Sir Christopher Hatton and Sir Robert Cecil offers less to ecclesiastical than to political historians, but it does throw useful light on government reaction to the apocalyptic demonstration of William Hacket, modifying a suggestion by Alexandra Walsham that Archbishop Whitgift was particularly macchiavellian in exploiting the Hacket affair to discredit Puritanism. Altogether this is a smorgasbröd worth scouring for the last morsel.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

*Die päpstlichen Referendare, 1566–1809. Chronologie und Prosopographie.* Edited by Christoph Weber. (Päpste und Papsttum, 31.) Pp. xi + 379 incl. frontispiece. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2003. €130. 3 7772 0335 1; 3 7772 0337 8  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905763284

Weber's edition of the official lists of the papal *Referendarii utriusque signaturae* from Pius V to Pius VII is the first in a series of three volumes dealing with this group of papal officials. The office of papal *referendarius* was created in the first half of the thirteenth century and increased in importance until the college of twelve *referendarii* existing in 1513 exerted considerable influence as papal advisers and procurers of benefices, indulgences and licences. The Council of Trent responded to charges of abuse by depriving the *referendarii* of this status and turning them into officials of the papal courts of justice. Substantial wealth, noble birth and, ideally, membership of an aristocratic corporation like the Milanese *Nobile collegium jurisconsultorum* were essential for admission to a career which might be crowned with a papal governorship or even a cardinal's hat. Papal reforms in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries started a process of professionalisation by setting standards of legal and ecclesiastical training for candidates. This eventually entailed ending the practice of honorary conferral of this title on foreign prelates in the early seventeenth century. After 1624 the number of *referendarii* remained fairly constant at about 165. The planned sequel to Weber's study will supply the reader with detailed prosopographical information for this group of aristocratic officials.

UNIVERSITY OF BOCHUM

REGINA PÖRTNER

*Control of religious printing in early Stuart England.* By S. Mutchow Towers. (Studies in Modern British Religious History, 8.) Pp. viii + 304. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003. £45. 0 85115 939 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905773280

No topic has been more hotly debated within early modern studies than the philosophy and application of censorship within Tudor and Stuart England; and no aspect of it has been more controversial or more intensively studied than the success, or otherwise, of Archbishop Laud in imposing press control during his

period of ascendancy. S. Mutchow Towers argues that the conclusions of many previous scholars have been over-dependent on extrapolation from special cases, or are less than relevant to religious books, the most obvious candidates for censorship. Her own study undertakes a statistical analysis of religious books from one sample year in every decade between James I's accession and the outbreak of the Civil War, and argues for a 'change in the subject matter and nature of orthodoxy' during this time. Her findings reinforce the current consensus – associated especially with the work of Nicholas Tyacke, Kenneth Fincham and Peter Lake – that the reign of Charles I brought about a shift in the nature of the Church of England, with topics central to the discourse of the early Stuart Church, such as predestination and anti-Catholicism, radically de-emphasised, and attention given instead to sacramentalism, common prayer and the 'beauty of holiness'. Towers depicts the Laudian regime as making a powerfully interventionist use of licensing, and demonstrates how, towards the latter half of her period, new Calvinist books were conspicuous by their absence – though reprints remained a way of evading the censors until mid-1637. On this topic and others, Towers brings a weight of evidence to bear on earlier historians who have argued that press censorship at this date was ineffective. One chapter, for instance, takes up the gauntlet which Sheila Lambert threw down when she maintained, of the two divines Thomas Jackson and Thomas Taylor, that they 'were poles apart in doctrine, yet the publishing history of their works is very similar'. Towers convincingly argues that they were, in fact, very different: the Puritan Taylor's writings became increasingly unacceptable after the death of Archbishop Abbot, while Jackson came into his own under Laud, able at last to publish works he had composed much earlier. Meticulously argued, methodologically sane and – unlike some studies in the field of publishing history – giving one the feeling that the author has actually read and understood the books, this book will surely become an essential point of reference in future discussions of early modern print regulation – even if it gives commentators even more reasons to find the Laudian regime sinister.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ALISON SHELL

*John Donne and conformity in crisis in the late Jacobean pulpit.* By Jeanne Shami. (Studies in Renaissance Literature.) Pp. ix + 318. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2003. £50.

0 85991 789 4; 1465 6310

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905783287

Jeanne Shami has accomplished a rare feat: a scholar of literature, she has written a book for the *Studies in Renaissance Literature* series that historians can admire. Boasting a bibliography filled with manuscript sources, references to the PRO and an impressive number of printed primary sources, *Donne and conformity in crisis* is even structured like studies of high politics, with their narrowly penetrative, season-by-season look at pivotal periods in history. Shami is primarily concerned with those analyses of the impact of print and the public sphere with which historians of early Stuart religion have been grappling for several decades. Her conclusion, that James's reign was a period of religious 'crisis' complex enough to require the subtleties of Donne's religious thought (which also, of course, shaped the contemporary sense of the times as one of crisis) thus owes a powerful debt to recent work by Peter Lake and

Ken Fincham. Shami close-reads admirably. Her contribution here is to correct what she calls the ‘politics of quotation’, a set of methodological mistakes – most centring around styles of proof-texting and sloppy applications of biographical evidence – with which she charges many of her fellow literary critics (Debra Shuger being singled out for the most sustained negative attention). Shami’s punctilious study is persuasively argued, and so thoroughly fulfils the promise made in its introduction – that it will accurately resurrect the political meanings of Donne’s sermons – that this reviewer was immediately struck by a distinct irony (and, to be quite fair, she notes that her own monograph on the subject would hardly be immune to the following remarks). In her opening chapter, Shami repeats what every scholar working on the early modern sermon has written in introductions since the late 1990s: that sermons deserve more, and better, studies. Well, they’re getting them, and not only with this book. The work of Peter McCullough and Mary Morrissey has surely put concerns about the lack of proper attention paid to historical context by literary scholars to rest. But something vital is still missing from the study of the sermon. We need more full-length studies of sermons that understand, appreciate, and analyse their theologies, their homiletic structures, their immersion in the Christian tradition (something we do see in Morrissey’s work especially). Deeply interdependent they may have been, but early modern theology and politics were never interchangeable. Shami’s discussions of theology and church history are good insofar as they go, but they don’t go so very far. And why should they? They are not her brief. Still, having now thoroughly discovered the politics of religion, historians and literary scholars need to start wrestling again with the religion of religion. Until we grasp the importance of the doctrinal issues in themselves and hesitate to hitch them entirely to political crises to make them alluring, we will never fully comprehend or appreciate the meanings and the impacts of Donne’s pulpit oratory.

CLAREMONT GRADUATE UNIVERSITY  
CLAREMONT SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY

LORI ANNE FERRELL

*Die Jesuiten in Wien. Zur Kunst- und Kulturgeschichte der österreichischen Ordensprovinz der Gesellschaft Jesu im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert.* Edited by Herbert Karner and Werner Telesko. (Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für Kunstgeschichte, 5.) Pp. 282 incl. 114 ills + 16 colour plates. Vienna: Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2003. €92 (paper). 3 7001 3203 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905793283

Just as interest in the Catholic or Counter-Reformation has increased in the last years, so the movement’s ‘shock troops’ are now being reassessed from many angles. In particular, art and architectural historians have been concerned to consider the building and artistic activities of the Society of Jesus. There have been two volumes by Gauvin Alexander Bailey about Jesuit art in Rome, as well as a consideration of the didactic use to which the Jesuits put their art in Germany by Jeffrey Chips Smith; while Sybille Appuhn-Radtke, a contributor to the volume under review, has produced a creditable study of Johann Christoph Storer, one of the most important artists employed by the Society in southern Germany. The present volume of essays considers the Jesuits of the Austrian province of the order. Though naturally it

centres in the Society's headquarters in Vienna, there are reminders that this was a vast organisation with branches throughout the Habsburg empire. Thus, for example, there are essays on the theatrical work of the Jesuits of Passau, and on the connections of the Jesuits of Laibach/Ljubljana with neighbouring houses. It is understandable, however, that the main focus of the collection should be on Vienna itself, in particular the architectural glories of the university church, founded by Ferdinand II in thanksgiving for his victory over heresy at White Mountain. Indeed, most of the eighteen colour plates are devoted to this beautiful church. This volume is to be commended for its comprehensive and deep scholarship, and the beauty of its presentation.

ST MARY'S COLLEGE,  
STRAWBERRY HILL

MARIA DOWLING

*Oxford, I: The records; II: Editorial apparatus.* Edited By John R. Elliott, Jr, Alan H. Nelson, Alexandra F. Johnston and Diana Wyatt. (Records of Early English Drama.) Pp. x + 580; v + 583–1307 incl. 8 figs. London: The British Library/Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004. \$300. 0 8020 3905 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905803288

The latest in the excellent *Records of Early English Drama* series covers dramatic, musical and ceremonial events in the city and university of Oxford. In keeping with the REED conventions, the volumes provide a comprehensive and informative introduction and critical apparatus to accompany the numerous excerpts from civic, aristocratic, college and university records that they print. Thus in volume ii, brief accounts of the history of the city and its institutions, of its dramatic, musical and ceremonial customs, and a full list of the institutions and documents that provide the records are published along with copious appendices (providing, *inter alia*, a copy of the architectural drawing of Christ Church Theatre (1605), controversial verses provoked by the playing of Barten Holyday's play *Technogamia, or The marriages of the arts*, performed before James I at Woodstock by the students of Christ Church in 1621, a comprehensive bibliography of plays (both extant and lost) probably or possibly performed and/or written in Oxford, and a chronological list of college performance of plays, disguisings and other shows in the early modern period). Translations of all the Latin documents are provided, as are glossaries of the English and Latin terms encountered in the records, and a list of patrons and travelling companies that visited Oxford. Volume i prints the records themselves, ranging from the relatively bland ('Item to mr Nicolls for the kinges players' [p. 276]) to detailed accounts of the entertainments provided during visits by Elizabeth I, James VI and I and Charles I.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

GREG WALKER

*Le istruzioni generali di Paolo V ai diplomatici pontifici (1605–1621).* 3 vols. By Silvano Giordano. Pp. vii + 604; vii + 605–1250; vii + 1251–684. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2003. €246 (paper). 3 484 80163 8  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905813284

In 1605 Cardinal Camillo Borghese was elected pope, becoming Paul V. Thus opened a dramatic pontificate, one marked by the Venetian interdict (and by the opening

phase of the Thirty Years War). Since this was an age in which the papacy still played a major role in international diplomacy, the availability of the instructions given to papal diplomats is of great value. Silvano Giordano's painstakingly edited volumes – part of the larger *Instructiones pontificum romanorum* project of the Istituto Storico Germano of Rome – are thus to be welcomed. The core of these three volumes is a collection of both instructions given to papal diplomats and officials at the start of their missions abroad and the reports, *relazioni*, submitted at the conclusion of their mission, relating to the eighty ordinary and extraordinary missions which marked Paul v's reign. (Some missions are better documented than others; in some cases Giordano has not found the instructions.) These documents, most of them originating in the Vatican Archives, are preceded by a lengthy introduction (of nearly 300 pages) in which Giordano discusses Paul v, his family, his election, his foreign and ecclesiastical policy, the papal secretariat of state and the diplomats who either received or penned the documents which follow, and the essential features of the instructions. Giordano's editorial principles follow those applied by Klaus Jaitner in his editing of the instructions issued to the diplomats of Paul's predecessor, Clement VIII, and successor, Gregory XV, with minimal interference with the text – apart perhaps from the numbering of the paragraphs. For each of the missions Giordano identifies the location of the instruction (where one has been found), of the *facolta* (or title of ecclesiastical jurisdiction) and correspondence and summarises the content of the instruction or *relazioni* which follows. Thereafter, notes are largely restricted to indentifying individuals and places. The work is completed by an appendix of additional documents, an extensive bibliography (of 140 pages) and a very full index. It should be evident from the foregoing that these three volumes represent an impressive work of outstanding scholarship. They will not only be of great value to historians of the Church and of papal policy at a critical point in European history but also to those interested in the evolution of early modern diplomacy and its instruments.

UNIVERSITY OF DUNDEE

CHRISTOPHER STORRS

*The diary of Samuel Rogers, 1634–1638*. Edited by Tom Webster and Kenneth Shipps.

(Church of England Record Society, 11.) Pp. lxxxi + 186. £55. Woodbridge:

Boydell (for the Church of England Record Society), 2004. 1 84383 043 4;

1351 3087

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905823280

Samuel Rogers (1613–1643<sup>2</sup>) was a grandson of Richard Rogers (1550–1618), a famous minister of Wethersfield, Essex, from 1571 to his death. Richard was a formative figure in the East Anglian Puritan subculture and founder of a Puritan family dynasty whose story Tom Webster pieced together in *Godly clergy in early Stuart England* (1997). Now Webster, in collaboration with the late Kenneth Shipps, has prepared a scholarly edition of the spiritual diary which the grandson, a Puritan divine who died too early to make a mark, kept from 1634 to 1638. Fitted with a detailed introduction and notes based on fresh research, the text confirms and adds detail to the picture of the godly community and its spiritual praxis which has emerged from recent research by Patrick Collinson, Charles Hambrick-Stowe, Charles Cohen, Diane Willen, Peter Lake and others. Detailing a life of hungry

communion with the 'saints' and of discomfort among outsiders, it reflects the familiar siege mentality of dissenters in the Caroline years and their rage against the regime of William Laud. Silently perpetuating monastic moods and techniques, it exhibits familiar conventions of Puritan spirituality in the period: intense absorption in subjective states, ascetic concern for self-denial and self-control, and an exacting trek through 'exercises' (introspection, hearing sermons, the Sabbath, family devotions, meditation and many others). Hypersensitive to human weakness and sin, Rogers wavered between joy and despair as he struggled to live purely and please the deity, but spent most of his recorded days in finicky discontent.

UNIVERSITY OF IOWA

THEODORE DWIGHT BOZEMAN

*Johann Heinrich Horb (1645–1695). Leben und Werk bis zum Beginn der Hamburger pietistischen Streitigkeiten 1693.* By Frank Hartmann. (Hallesche Forschungen, 12.) Pp. xi + 389. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2004. €58 (paper). 3 484 84012 9; 3 931479 38 2; 0949 0086  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905833287

Johann Heinrich Horb is known largely as the pastor who was ejected from his clerical office at the height of the Pietist controversy in Hamburg in 1693. Most modern studies of that episode have been primarily concerned with the political-constitutional struggle between the senate and the *Bürgerschaft*. They generally mention the fact that Horb was a brother-in-law of Spener, but say little about his life before he arrived in Hamburg in 1680 or indeed about the development of Horb's theological inclinations and pastoral activities. Frank Hartmann has produced the first and what must surely be regarded as the definitive biography of Horb's first three and a half decades. He also sheds further light on Horb's work in Hamburg after 1685. Like the sections on Horb's early life, these are founded upon extensive archival study, which has revealed previously unused sources, such as a cache of 204 letters from Horb to Spener in the archive of the Moravian Brethren at Herrnhut. Hartmann traces Horb's development from his origins in Colmar, through study at Strassburg (where he first encountered Spener) followed by travel in the Netherlands, England and France, to his first permanent appointment in the bailiwick of Trarbach in the county of Sponheim 1671–8. Here he seems to have been an energetic reformer of an ecclesiastical structure that had been neglected in the muddle that accompanied the condominium of both a Protestant and a Catholic ruler, representatives of the Baden-Baden and Pfalz-Birkenfeld dynasties that held Sponheim in common. It was during this time that he embraced Spener's programme of renewal from below rather than through state reform. Ironically, however, it was Horb's establishment of a consistory in Trarbach rather than his Pietism that led to his dismissal after a series of attacks prompted by Count Christian II's councillors who feared losing control over the Trarbach church. His pastorate in the Franconian imperial city of Windsheim 1679–85 proved quieter, but the lure of appointment to one of the prestigious *Hauptpastorate* in Hamburg proved irresistible. Both Trarbach and Windsheim were backwaters. Hamburg provided pulpits with a view of the wider Lutheran world. For that reason appointments to them were sensitive and Horb himself was nearly thwarted by rumours of his Pietist activities in Trarbach. He soon found himself in alliance with Johann Winckler and attacked by the fanatically orthodox Johann Friedrich Mayer. In the end, however, Horb was

isolated. He argued with those, like Winckler, who were his natural allies in favour of Spener. He sided with the senate in its struggle with the *Bürgerschaft* and the guilds, though he naturally sympathised with the poor and the underdog. His refusal to express a clear view on the alleged radical Pietist conventicles led to him being denounced as a radical himself, though the radicals regarded him as virtually orthodox. Horb's tragedy was that he genuinely stood on middle ground. His life, now meticulously recorded by Frank Hartmann, thus sheds light on all the major tendencies of his age.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JOACHIM WHALEY

*Unquiet lives. Marriage and marriage breakdown in England, 1660–1800.* By Joanne Bailey. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xii + 248. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £40. 0 521 81058 2

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905843283

*Unquiet lives* presents a vivid analysis of the experience of marriage in the 'long eighteenth century', based upon detailed research among court records, alongside newspaper advertisements and other sources. Joanne Bailey challenges those historians who have been reluctant to use the records of matrimonial suits by presenting a persuasive and often original account of married life, and makes a compelling case for the importance of such materials in assessing national expectations of married life in this period. The matrimonial suits used are drawn from the consistory courts of Durham, York and Oxford, offering a broad chronological and geographical sweep that makes the conclusions all the more plausible. Bailey argues strongly for the need to distinguish between 'primary' accusations of adultery and desertion, and the 'secondary' complaints that were often spawned by this process. It is these issues, she suggests, that can offer the most valuable insights into eighteenth-century attitudes to marriage, household order, children and the domestic economy. The book opens with a clear summary of the process by which marital problems were heard and resolved in the courts, and a measured discussion of the nature of married life, and the role of men and women in the household. Bailey provides a detailed discussion of the potential for disputes over economic obligation, property and consumption to cause disruption to married life. Men, she suggests, were viewed not simply as providers, but as central to the domestic economy. Likewise, the influence of women extended beyond the domestic sphere and into local credit networks and economic activity. Despite their legal standing, she argues, women had a developed sense of property ownership, with the result that on occasion distinctions continued to be made between the possessions of husband and wife after marriage. The 'secondary' complaints made in matrimonial suits confirm just how divisive issues of property and possession could become. But there were many other reasons for marital breakdown, ranging from domestic violence to adultery and infidelity. Bailey places the children at centre stage in many of these disputes, and thereby reveals the degree to which parenting could shape the behaviour of spouses, and influence litigation by either party. The final chapter of the book offers one of the most detailed accounts of the consequences of marital breakdown, using the records of court cases to assess the support offered by men to



their former partners, and considers the degree to which such behaviour was influenced by a sense of continued responsibility. *Unquiet lives* makes an important contribution to debates over marriage and domestic life, but also raises some useful questions for further research and discussion.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

HELEN PARISH

*Calvinism, communion and the Baptists. A study of English Calvinistic Baptists from the late 1600s to the early 1800s.* By Peter Naylor. (Studies in Baptist History and Thought, 7.)

Pp. xix + 276. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2003. £19.99 (paper). 1 84227 142 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690585328X

Recent years have witnessed a welcome glut of publications relating to the so-called Strict Baptists who have hitherto suffered from too little study compared with those Baptists who would not so qualify their faith and practice. Naylor's volume reveals how dangerous such shorthands can be. The fuller description of this tradition would be the Strict and Particular Baptists, that is those Baptists who upheld Strict Communion and belief in Particular Redemption. The Lord's table should be open only to those who had been baptised by immersion as believers [and sometimes more narrowly only those who, so baptised, had joined a Strict Baptist Church] and redemption confined to those foreordained by God to salvation in his inscrutable wisdom. Naylor's main thesis is to show that there is no necessary connection in his period, unlike later years, between the ecclesiological practice and the soteriological doctrine sometimes labelled High Calvinist. Both the revisionist, Andrew Fuller, with his more moderate Evangelical Calvinism, and indeed the Arminian New Connexion of General Baptists in their early years, practised closed communion. Equally in the earlier period there were churches whose Calvinist credentials were impeccable which were quite happy to maintain an open table, and indeed sometimes to form fellowships where Baptists and Paedo-Baptists joined together in one church body. Whilst the main thesis is clear, accurately recorded and helpfully illustrated from the primary sources, more consideration needs to be given to a critical evaluation of some of the dated historiography deployed by the author. Debates like that at Salters Hall need more subtle explication: there was more at stake than the Trinitarian faith; there was also the issue of subscription to doctrinal deductions rather than to Scripture as providing all necessary truth. Thus we know exactly what the subscribers believed, but what the commitments of a man who did not subscribe were, on the evidence of subscription alone is hidden from us. Moreover, some of the contextual information is inaccurate or incomplete, for example it is not true to say (p. 25) that 'nonconformists paid church rates until 1886'. In the first place church rates were abolished in 1868, whilst in most urban areas, at a much earlier date, dissenters and their allies could pack the parish vestry preventing the church authorities levying a rate. But this is an issue both in date and subject peripheral to the author's principal concerns. Not always narrowly concerned with arguing his thesis Naylor in fact provides a more general account of early particular Baptist history from his own clearly articulated perspective of which the author is not uncritical.

REGENTS PARK COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JOHN BRIGGS

*Gestörte Formation. Erdbebenbewältigung in Benevent und Verwirklichung von Herrschaft im Kirchenstaat, 1680–1730.* By Beate Mehlin. Pp. xiii + 423. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 2003. €64. 3 484 82104 3; 0070 4156  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905863286

Pope Benedict XIII, elected in 1724, is famous as a pastoral paragon of Catholic reform, so devoted to his former archbishopric of Benevento that he retained responsibility for it even after that date. But he is also notorious, because his myopic trust in Cardinal Coscia and an associated Beneventan ‘lobby’ is judged to have allowed the recrudescence of a version of nepotism, something supposedly defeated by the ‘reform’ pontificates of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. Before his own election to the papacy, Cardinal Orsini achieved contemporary praise for the restorative care which, as archbishop, he took of the city, when the papal enclave of Benevento was severely damaged by earthquake in 1688. Such events were not exactly uncommon in southern Italy, and indeed one of the merits of the present book is to provide some comparison with the reactions, in and after the earthquake of that year, not only of the papal nuncio at the Spanish viceregal court at Naples but also of the archbishop of that latter city, Cardinal Pignatelli, who himself became pope, as Innocent XII, in 1691. Other quakes followed in the years after 1688 and another relatively major one destroyed in 1702 at least some of the previous restoration achieved at Benevento. The programmes of reconstruction and problems of funding it, or of providing charitable relief, at Benevento thus continued beyond the pontificate of Innocent XII, to be continued under Pope Benedict XIII himself, with repercussions still evident at the end of the century. A contemporary image of Orsini was of a holy man miraculously preserved in the destruction at Benevento by saintly protection. The Dominican cardinal certainly appears to have promoted the idea that he survived thanks to the intervention of the canonised Oratorian Philip Neri, though, as this book shows, the earlier patron of Benevento, St Bartholomew, was not forgotten. Debate of a less devout nature about such phenomena as earthquakes was not unrelated to ecclesiastical campaigns in late seventeenth-century Naples against so-called ‘atheists’. There is valuable discussion here of all these issues, but the ambitions of the research on which this book is based, while reflecting the virtuously thorough traditions of German scholarship, lead in the end to an uncertainty of focus. The larger and later parts of the volume attempt to relate the issues already mentioned to recent investigation of the nature and evolution of papal temporal government, in treatments of the ‘micro-politics’ of constituent areas within the papal states. Such treatments have often been of great value. Here there is elaborate analysis of the communal finances of Benevento over an extended period, though difficulties in the sources ultimately lead to a certain amount of admitted counter-factual argument. The idea that Orsini managed financial relief for Benevento in ways that ensured the reconstitution of traditional and political control within the enclave does not seem surprising or unlikely. But the further suggestion that this amounted to manipulation designed to secure his own identity as the holy ‘patron’ of his beloved city does not in the end seem convincingly substantiated.

*A court in exile. The Stuarts in France, 1689–1718.* By Edward Corp (with Edward Gregg, Howard Erskine-Hill and Geoffrey Scott.) Pp. xvi+386 incl. 25 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £55. 0 521 58462 0  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905873282

This beautifully produced book might seem at first sight one intended to grace a coffee table. A second glance could lead potential readers to view it as yet another product of the Jacobite industry. They would be right and wrong on both counts. Right because the lavish illustrations and expensive paper make it suitable for coffee tables, while Edward Corp is an established champion of the exiled Stuarts. Wrong because the text is scholarly rather than popular, sometimes to the point of dry-as-dust dullness, while the contributions of others, particularly of Edward Gregg, prevent it from becoming another exercise in Drambuie-induced nostalgia for a lost cause. For Gregg is no fan of James II, as Corp rightly calls him, eschewing ‘and James VII’, since he ruled as king of Great Britain. The coins he had struck in Edinburgh confirm this claim which will come as news to some historians. On the contrary Gregg sees him as a loser with scanty support in England and not much more in Scotland. Louis XIV’s ministers recognised this, even if the French king could not quite bring himself to acknowledge it. Corp is rather like Louis in this regard. In his discussion of James’s relations with the French court he acknowledges Gregg’s scepticism, but still bows in the direction of those historians who claim that Jacobitism was a significant force in Britain. Howard Erskine-Hill is the most formidable literary historian in their ranks, though even he can find little in the way of genuine Jacobite poetry to celebrate apart from Jane Barker’s, and she was a pessimist about the prospects for a second Stuart restoration. Geoffrey Scott, the abbot of Douai Abbey in Reading, contributes studies of James II’s undoubted piety and the education of his son. The whole work is in many ways an act of piety for an exiled court. When it deals with such matters as the standard of living which the courtiers enjoyed it is of general interest. Thus Corp provides a useful corrective to the Whig view that they lived in penury, while his treatment of the portrait painters and musicians whom they patronised is absorbing. But the lists of which courtier did what, and where they were housed, can make tedious reading. The *minutiae* which this involves at times made this reviewer want to ask – so what?

UNIVERSITY OF NORTHUMBRIA

W. A. SPECK

*The exotic plant. A history of the Moravian Church in Britain, 1742–2000.* By Geoffrey Stead and Margaret Stead. Pp. xvii+442. Peterborough: Epworth Press, 2003. £25 (paper). 0 7162 0573 4  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905883289

This book charts the process whereby a German community planted here in the 1740s became an English denomination, abandoning many of its distinguishing features. From the nineteenth- and twentieth-century provincial synod minutes and provincial periodicals the authors distil key themes. Autonomy was achieved in 1857, but tension continued between advocates of the English nonconformist style which ultimately triumphed and an Anglo-German ministerial elite which was progressively extinguished after 1860 by training of ministers in England rather than Germany. Loss of vitality was perpetually mourned. Shortage of money, only partly

offset by a network of fourteen commercial boarding schools (from the 1790s to the 1880s) and a property-owning trust, resulted in failure to grow: communicant membership peaked below 4,000 in 1916. Thereafter stagnation and decline set in, though active recruitment of Moravian immigrants from the Caribbean in the 1960s resulted in new congregations and societies and the revitalising of old ones. Inevitably, much detail remains to be filled in with archivally-based studies of individual settlements, congregations and institutions, but the nineteenth-century developments are analysed more fully than in the previous (1909) denominational history, twentieth-century history is presented for the first time and important nuggets of insight are offered. Treatment of the eighteenth-century, by contrast, is fundamentally flawed. My 1998 study argued that the Moravian Church was less an agent of revival than a refuge of the awoken; that Moravian settlements sucked members in from the societies the Moravians took over, thus reducing the number of societies rather than spawning them; that the evangelist John Cennick was an embarrassment to Zinzendorf and became disillusioned with the Moravians; that in 1749 the Moravians were effectively recognised as privileged dissenters; and that financial crisis and public opprobrium halted growth, leaving existing members chastened and unsettled. Each of these conclusions is not refuted but simply ignored; instead, older interpretations are presented as unchallenged fact. John Mason's 2001 monograph demonstrated how news of Moravian missions restored public esteem and the Moravians influenced the founding of the missionary societies; all of this is passed over in silence, as is Benjamin La Trobe's crucial leadership of British Moravianism in the post-Zinzendorf era. Other leaders are mentioned only in passing, if at all, their names sometimes misspelled. The authors recognise that 'real Moravianism was German' and that 'most [modern] British members could not speak German and did not fully appreciate the spirit behind the religious and historical events which had formed their church'. None the less, they have attempted to present Zinzendorf's Moravianism with hardly any reference to the voluminous twentieth-century German Moravian studies of it and none to the crucial recent work of younger continental, British and American scholars. The authors write of 'communication as a support system', but give no indication of having consulted any scholar currently writing on Moravianism. In consequence, errors and omissions abound. Precisely because the Moravian Church in England is an 'exotic plant', its history cannot be studied successfully in such an insular manner.

LONDON

C. J. PODMORE

*Franz Schubert. Music and belief.* By Leo Black. Pp. xvi + 209 + errata. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003. £45. 1 84383 023 X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905893285

In assessing a great composer, argues Leo Black, there is always room for another perspective; in Schubert's case a view of the religious aspect of his work is long overdue. Engaged by the sound of Schubert's music, as well as oriented to Schubert scholarship and the analysis of both scores and performances (his CV includes a period as BBC chief producer of music), Black evolves an approach to the full range of Schubert's music which complements all earlier hermeneutical patterns. The opportunity to hear and enable others to perform and hear little-known Schubert

has given the author an unrivalled experience of Schubert's music, and it is the experience of that music which, the author argues, can show the religious side of Schubert's nature, in the sense of his 'knowing a priori the essential experiences – awe, wonder, terror – codified by theology'. Furthermore, only someone immersed in a composer's musical sounds can do justice to the subtlety of technique and vocabulary by which a religious aspect of music becomes comprehensible; and only someone who has made a detailed examination of the history and dating of the Schubertian scores can plot the stages by which Schubert's extraordinary personality, intuition and power of expression – his 'complete voice' – emerged. Such a project involves a host of disciplines, and it is hardly surprising if some disciplines are given incomplete expression. If, alongside the literary resources of Schubert's own setting, the observation that Schubert valued the recapture and elaboration of the wonder of childhood could have been paralleled by the findings of recent research in English literary Romanticism (just hinted at pp. 9, 193), Black's case would have been even stronger. Little in the area of musicology has been missed, and much in the study of the aesthetics, philosophy and hermeneutics of music has been absorbed and built into the final picture. The harvest of such careful research is the recovery of the musical evocations by which the structure and symbols of a work such as the Great C major Symphony can be decoded, so that (partly-verifiable) analysis reveals not only the musical shape but the religious possibilities in the written text. To the question Black himself raises, 'Through what musical procedures does this vague thing, "wonder", make itself felt?', the author draws answers from, for example, his explorations into Schubert's setting of Mayrhofer's *Geheimnis* poem. But these answers take him beyond the theological and philosophical resources he summons to his aid, requiring a more resolute evaluation of the role of time in music than Otto's 'The idea of the holy' or even the conversations of Jernhake with Ricoeur allow. The musical context within which wonder, awe and terror are expressed and recognised is, as Black's work clearly demonstrates, a dynamic movement towards 'the complete voice', and that recognition makes fresh demands on the theological, philosophical and aesthetic study of temporality.

LINCOLN

IVOR H. JONES

*Léon Harmel. Entrepreneur as Catholic social reformer.* By Joan L. Coffey. (Catholic Social Tradition.) Pp. x + 341 + 7 figs. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003. \$48. 0 268 03360 9

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690590328X

Why is social Catholicism such a difficult subject to write about well? The question is raised again by this serviceable but ultimately unsatisfying study of Léon Harmel (1829–1915), an enthusiastic Catholic textile *patron* at Val des Bois near Rheims and the driving force in the French worker pilgrimages to Rome in the 1880s and 1890s. Harmel inherited the business from his father and set about transforming it into a Catholic social community while ensuring that he retained full control of the management of the enterprise. The worker pilgrimages were just one aspect of his indefatigable engagement in the social Catholic initiatives of the time and brought him briefly to prominence during the 1891 pilgrimage, held

shortly after the promulgation of *Rerum novarum* but cut short by an international diplomatic incident when three of the French pilgrims (none of whom turned out to be workers) wrote 'Vive le Pape' in the register at the tomb of King Victor Emmanuel. That incident apart, Harmel's life is a largely predictable tale of hard work, family values and virtuous initiative. Coffey's approach throughout is laudatory and verges on the hagiographical as in her repeated insistence that Harmel travelled third-class on the pilgrimages or in the arresting statement that he 'came as close as anyone in nineteenth-century France to establishing an earthly paradise for factory workers' (p. 99). What is absent from her study is any sense of the real significance of Harmel's life. Though she is at pains to present him as a pioneer, more 'advanced' in his social ideas than figures such as de Mun, his mixture of conservative paternalism and evangelical zeal was too rooted in the distinctive climate of the post-1870 era to have any real legacy for subsequent Catholic politics. Coffey suggests that Harmel's activities may have contributed to the content of *Rerum novarum*, but his ideas soon went out of favour both with the papacy and in France. Some dabbling in the antisemitic and Christian Democrat politics of the 1890s aside, his final years were relatively obscure. Rather therefore than a forerunner of twentieth-century Catholic social thinking, Harmel's life seems to demonstrate how social Catholicism in France remained overwhelmingly the affair of a mid nineteenth-century generation, for whom the formative experiences had been the rapid urbanisation and industrialisation of the era, the political upheavals of 1848 and the Commune, and the military defeat of 1870.

BALLIOL COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

MARTIN CONWAY

*Orestes Brownson and the problem of revelation. The Protestant years.* By Arie J. Griffioen. (American University Studies, Ser. 7. Theology and Religion, 223.) Pp. xii + 128. New York: Peter Lang, 2003. £32. 0 8204 5845 7; 0740 0446  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905913286

Arie Griffioen analyses changing conceptions of revelation in this study of Orestes Brownson's Protestant writings. He argues that Brownson developed a 'synthetic theology of revelation' in response to early nineteenth-century theological and philosophical challenges, particularly the shift from Enlightenment to Romantic epistemologies. Griffioen charts a new course in Brownson scholarship with his focus on previously unused works and his effort to interpret them without an eye toward Brownson's conversion to Catholicism. To track Brownson's development, Griffioen identifies four periods between 1826 and 1844. Within each, he examines Brownson's thought on reason, nature, history, Scripture and Jesus. In the first period, Brownson affirmed Enlightenment understandings of reason and revelation, subject and object. He then reacted with a Romantic affirmation of the subject's ability to receive revelation. In a third period, Brownson attempted a synthesis between subject and object. In the final two years before his conversion, Brownson refined this synthesis. Through Leroux's concept of 'life by communion,' Brownson affirmed that objects mediate divine reality, presaging his later claims about Jesus and the Church. In this study, Griffioen articulates a clear thesis and helpful focus on Brownson's early

thought. He supports his analysis with attention to Brownson's changing denominational affiliations and intellectual influences, including the Universalists, Unitarians, Transcendentalists and various French thinkers. At the same time, one wishes for a book as colourful as Brownson himself. A dynamic and self-taught figure, Brownson's thought ranged from the commonly assumed to the most radical. His interests spanned issues of social justice and abstract, philosophical questions. Griffioen's chapters, organised around strict periods and distinct theological issues, make Brownson accessible; but one wonders whether the format detracts from Brownson's forceful and erratic spirit.

DUKE UNIVERSITY

JENNIFER GRABER

*God's man for the gilded age. D. L. Moody and the rise of modern mass evangelism.* By Bruce J. Evensen. Pp. vii + 232 incl. 25 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.

£18.99. 0 19 516244 7

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905923282

The story of Dwight L. Moody is well-known. Born in Massachusetts in 1837, Moody worked as a boot salesman before being drawn to evangelistic work with the YMCA and to an association with the singer Ira Sankey that led to an astonishingly successful international career as a mass evangelist. Moody was a gifted folksy speaker with, vital in the days of sectarian competition, a knack for avoiding the contentious. Sankey's singing made their meetings attractive public entertainment and set the tone for a century of Protestant church music. But, apart from his personal charm, what really made Moody was his skill in planning and organisation. He pioneered the virtuous circle of winning over local church leaders, enrolling the press to advertise his meetings and later report their great success, and then using reports of success to persuade church leaders in the next city to support him. It is probably fair to say that while later mass evangelists such as Billy Graham (and the radio and television evangelists) innovated with new technologies to reach ever larger audiences, Moody had already shown how to organise a crusade. Like Graham later, Moody was accused of self-interest and charlatanry but his ability to draw the unchurched persuaded all but the most conservative Protestant churchmen to support his methods. There may be little new data in Evenson's book but it is painstakingly researched and beautifully written and produced: a joy to read for anyone interested in nineteenth-century religious history.

UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN

STEVE BRUCE

*The Catholic revival in English literature, 1845–1961. Newman, Hopkins, Belloc, Chesterton, Greene, Waugh.* By Ian Ker. Pp. xi + 231. Leominster: Gracewing, 2003. £14.99 (paper). 0 85244 625 X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905933289

This elegantly written and argued book is assembled around a carefully stated theme, suggested by way of a response to John Henry Newman's remark that English literature is essentially and inevitably Protestant, given the Protestantism of English culture. The work is not a history of English Catholic literature, which raises

issues of definition; lapsed Catholics might retain the mark of their Catholicism, while a convinced Catholic author might write little that is distinctively Catholic. Instead, it surveys six major Catholic writers, five of them converts, the sixth the son of one, to show that their Catholicism shaped and influenced how and what they wrote. Newman found in Catholicism an escape from the prison of the Romantic and Evangelical subjective self into an objective world of activity through the agency of priest and sacrament. For Newman's convert Gerard Manley Hopkins, the idiomatic, brief and monosyllabic rhythms of Catholic devotion, especially the litanies which Hopkins daily recited as a Jesuit priest, were radically different from the polysyllabic sonorities of the Anglican *Book of Common Prayer*, and lay behind the sprung rhythms of his poetry, themselves a revolutionary departure from nineteenth-century literary form, defining a new modern poetic language. Hopkins's work was also influenced by Newman's conception of the priest as a professional craftsman, a maker of sacraments more than a minister of the Word, and by the Catholic conception of the dead as in intimate contact with the living.

The third author, Hilaire Belloc, educated at Newman's Oratory School, had a horror of the isolation of the individual soul in Protestantism, for which the corrective was the corporate Church, a thing, whose reality was itself bound up with a thoroughly material sense of the concreteness of other ordinary things, as with the earthbound cultural and semi-sacramental dimensions of Catholicism in good food and wine. So too, Ker finds G. K. Chesterton's Catholicism implicit in Chesterton's study of Dickens and Dickens's celebration of the wonder and extraordinariness of the ordinary and mundane, which erupted into a love of caricature and into a delight in eating and drinking which was Catholic and medieval in fact, for all that Dickens himself loathed medievalism and Catholicism. Again, despite Dickens's cloudy theology, it was through his sense of the real that Chesterton came to understand the limits, complexity and common sense of Christian dogma as a key to life itself, received with an overwhelming sense of gratitude for that life, a gratitude which Chesterton also found in the holy poverty of St Francis and the sense-based rationalism of Aquinas. The chapter on Graham Greene takes an entirely different line, on the life lived in the knowledge of the Church and Christian morality, and the tension between a dogmatic faith and its practical realisation, which seem to me a little more remote from the main themes of the work. With the final author studied, Greene's friend Evelyn Waugh, Ker returns to the issue of craftsmanship, which makes order from chaos, and is supremely represented in the 'priestcraft' of the priest. A Catholic takes the supernatural for granted, as an everyday reality, to be treated with familiarity as a simple matter of fact, known with the precision of a timepiece and without the oversolemnity or pomposity which comes from an overspiritualised 'religion'.

This work itself is an expert piece of craftsmanship: Ian Ker has set out clearly what he wanted to do and has done it, and has written a model work on the influence of faith on literature, in a manner which makes for intensely enjoyable reading and is easily accessible to the general reader.



*Converting women. Gender and Protestant Christianity in colonial south India.* By Eliza F. Kent.

Pp. xiv + 315 incl. map and 16 figs. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. \$47.95. 0 19 516507 1

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905943285

An important recent trend in the historiography of Indian Christianity, and in particular Christian conversion among disadvantaged low-caste groups in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, has been an examination of the role of converts' local cultures, social conditions and aspirations in determining the path taken by new Christian communities. Eliza F. Kent's contribution to this emerging field is a study which focuses on the changing notion of femininity amongst Christian women in South India.

The first half of the book provides a competent outline of the South Indian social environment, a contextual history of female mission work and a survey of colonial, missionary and convert perceptions and constructions of local society. While this will be of great utility and interest to the uninitiated, it is in the second half of the book, 'The conversion of gender', that Kent's analysis fully emerges. A variety of sources are drawn upon, including Indian census reports, legal cases, Indian Christian autobiographies and mission archives, to build a perceptive account of the forces which altered Indian Christian women's lives and outlook in this period. The concept of female respectability takes centre stage as Protestant Christian, elite Indian and low-caste ideals of gender roles and relations are shown to have competed and combined to forge new, hybrid forms of femininity – at once ambitiously self-assertive yet retarded by harsh social and economic realities and conflicting local loyalties.

The problem for Kent, as for many writers on this subject, is that the potential for analysis is limited by the source material available. Convert-generated sources are notoriously thin on the ground, largely due to low levels of literacy and the strictly limited nature of missionary and government interest in low-caste lives and thought. Although this volume makes commendably measured and sensitive use of its sources some readers may be disappointed to find Indian Christian perspectives squeezed by coverage of missionary and colonial attitudes, together with contextual detours which, while not irrelevant, seem uncomfortably to punctuate and distract from important investigative passages. Kent's strongest suit is her illustration, using changing styles of dress amongst female Christian converts, of the ways in which mission-sponsored forms of behaviour were accepted or rejected according to converts' independent strategies for self-improvement. In a complex and often tense social world, foreign missionary notions of propriety in women's attire could easily be subsumed in more pressing local arguments about caste identity, socio-economic opportunity and sexual exploitation. While specialists may find *Converting women* slightly limited, therefore, those with a more general interest in missions, conversion or women's history will enjoy a reliable and engaging volume.

SOPHIA UNIVERSITY,  
TOKYO

CHRISTOPHER HARDING

*Archbishop A.-A. Taché of St Boniface. The good fight and the illusive vision.* By Raymond J. A. Huel. Pp. xxv + 430 incl. 20 ills. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2003. £21.99 (paper). o 88864 406 X  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905953281

Raymond Huel has undertaken the difficult task of writing a critical biography of the long-serving and complicated archbishop of St Boniface, Alexandre-Antonin Taché. He has created for the reader a fascinating story of a church person who was spiritually and politically involved in the formation of the Catholic community at the nexus of the Red and Assiniboine Rivers, now called Winnipeg, the capital of the province of Manitoba. Alexandre was born into one of the most prominent Quebec families and could have selected for himself a comfortable role in the Quebec church. 'Instead, his deep religious convictions made him choose the life of a missionary in the Canadian North West and the exile that it entailed' (p. 317). When Taché arrived as a young twenty-two-year-old subdeacon in 1845 at the Red River, Bishop Provencher complained that he had asked for priests, and they sent a boy. Nevertheless within a few months the bishop ordained him priest and sent him to winter at Baie St Paul and learn aboriginal languages. By 1851 the fragile health of Bishop Provencher demanded a coadjutor with right of succession be appointed. Looking over the lean field of *episcopabili*, the bishop chose Alexandre-Antonin Taché, and with the death of Provencher two years later, Taché at the age of twenty-nine became his successor. Taché's vision for the Canadian west was to bring French Canadians to Red River to recreate the Catholic culture of Quebec in a bilingual society. During the Red River Insurrection (1870), Bishop Taché was government emissary to the Métis and was blamed for the faulty amnesty and land claims. During the North-West Rebellion of 1885 and the abolition of Catholic schools in 1891, he communicated regularly with Prime Minister John A. MacDonal. Significantly, in the author's view, Archbishop Taché proved to be a micro-manager who had difficulty relating to his associates and animating their mission. Avoiding hagiography, Raymond Huel has composed a critical and definitive biography of a tragic player in the founding of the Roman Catholic Church in the Canadian north-west and a colourful person in Canadian religious and political life.

ST AUGUSTINE'S SEMINARY,  
 UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

TERENCE J. FAY SJ

*The Broad Church. A biography of a movement.* By Tod E. Jones. Pp. xi + 347. Lanham, MA—Oxford: Lexington Books, 2003. £65. o 7391 0611 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905963288

Anyone with occasion to teach the nineteenth-century Broad Church tradition of liberal Anglicanism would welcome an up-to-date and accessible introductory account. Once beyond the excitements of *Essays and Reviews* or the contribution to Christian Socialism student historians find both Broad Churchmen and much of the secondary literature 'difficult', even dull, in comparison with evangelical or Tractarian counterparts. This book aims to 'reveal the leaders of the Broad Church and their thought in sufficient detail to allow my readers to construct their own definition of the movement' (p. 2), and to do so on the basis of wide and close reading in both secondary literature and published sources (the fact that the author's

cast of characters was so comprehensively *Life and lettered* makes the neglect of manuscript sources less of a shortcoming than it might be elsewhere). The meat of the book consists of four extended chapters: one focusing on Samuel Taylor Coleridge, a second on Thomas Arnold and the noetics, a third on the Cambridge contingent associated with the Apostles (especially Hare, Kingsley, Maurice and Sterling) and a fourth returning to Oxford to follow Matthew Arnold's career and introducing Clough, Jowett, Stanley and Temple, with excursions north to take in Shairp and Tulloch. For the purposes of the volume the chronological span of the Broad Church movement is taken to be from Hare's 'Children of Light' sermon in 1828 to the enthronement of Temple as archbishop of Canterbury in 1897. Jones writes as a self-confessed fellow-traveller of the Broad Churchmen, but the work is not significantly partisan. Indeed, in leaving it to the reader to reach his own conclusions Jones has perhaps been overly self-denying, for the danger is that the reader will drown in the mass of detail (often fascinating). The approach adopted will also likely prove more useful and accessible to students of theology or literature than of history. Historians may wish they had brushed up their Schleiermacher and conned their Kierkegaard in advance, or wonder why Matthew Arnold so dominates the action in the final chapter. More seriously, they may question whether Jones has really produced a 'biography of a movement'. Jones prefers to probe the interior life of the 'leaders' rather than look beyond them to the rank and file, whose presence was surely of some significance to the 'biography' of the 'movement' – here W. J. Conybeare's important account of the 'Broad Church' (whom he numbered at 3,500 in 1853–5) might provide a starting-point. The relentless focus on 'great[ish] minds' not only gives an old-fashioned feel to the work as an exercise in intellectual history, but also unhelpfully marginalises public controversies and the philanthropic expression of liberal churchmanship which many of its adherents emphasised and were attracted by. None the less Jones's book is a useful addition to any Broad Church bibliography.

KING'S COLLEGE,  
LONDON

ARTHUR BURNS

*Contested Christianity. The political and social contexts of Victorian theology.* By Timothy Larsen.

Pp. viii + 234. Waco: Baylor University Press, 2004. \$39.95. 0 918954 93 2

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905973284

In this book Timothy Larsen has presented us with a collection of twelve essays on the background to the Victorian Church in Britain. He paints vivid pictures of the struggles for rights, the battle for faith and the fight by Nonconformists in regard to church polity. Some of these essays have been previously published, but that fact does not detract from this being an excellent book. Even those of us who are familiar with the history of British Churches in the nineteenth century will learn much from this work. Larsen, for example, gives a balanced account of the Baptist women of Mill Yard Church and their campaign to be recognised as a church, even though there were no men in the congregation and therefore no church officers. Likewise, there is a detailed account of the Methodist New Connexion and its crusade for greater lay representation in the Methodist Churches, which originated as an Anglican clerical movement. Larsen also deals sympathetically with the issues raised by the translation

of David Strauss's *Life of Jesus*, of biblical criticism and of secularism. These essays are interwoven with interesting comments and perceptive assessments, which together with the author's delightful style make this book a joy to read. Although Larsen is essentially dealing with side-lights on nineteenth-century ecclesiastical history, these side-lights serve to illuminate some of the major themes of the century and left me, for one, wanting to read more.

HARRIS MANCHESTER COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

RALPH WALLER

*Evangelicals embattled. Responses of evangelicals in the Church of England to ritualism, Darwinism and theological liberalism, 1890–1930.* By Martin Wellings (foreword John Walsh). (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xvii + 356. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2004. £24.99 (paper). 1 84227 049 4

*A fragile unity. Anti-ritualism and the division of Anglican evangelicalism in the nineteenth century.* By James C. Whisenant. (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xv + 534. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2003. £29.99 (paper). 1 84227 105 9  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905983280

These two volumes have been published in the series *Studies in Evangelical History and Thought*. They complement one another, Wellings effectively taking over from Whisenant in about 1890, and together they continue many of the themes explored in Peter Toon's *Evangelical theology, 1833–1856: a response to Tractarianism* (1979) and John Wolffe's *Protestant crusade in Great Britain, 1829–1860* (1991). That having been said the approach of the two volumes is very different, that by Wellings being a well-crafted monograph that builds on the latest research on the religious history of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Britain, whereas that by Whisenant suffers from showing all the signs of being a largely unrevised PhD thesis. Whisenant argues that as early as the 1850s Evangelicals were divided over how they should respond to ritualism, with some objecting to the frequent attacks on Bishop Wilberforce and Florence Nightingale in *The Record*. By the 1860s there were divisions over the tactics of the Church Association. Dean Close of Carlisle (once one of the leaders of the Evangelical Party) was being attacked by *The Record* for his conversion to the value of choral services, and there was a vigorous debate between J. C. Miller and J. C. Ryle over whether, in order not to undermine their attacks on ritualists, Evangelicals should themselves obey the rubrics of the Book of Common Prayer. Whisenant takes us in great detail through the Evangelical divisions of the 1870s and 1880s over the implementation of the Public Worship Regulation Act. This led to further divisions over whether it was possible for Evangelicals to co-operate with High Churchmen in common causes, such as opposition to theological liberalism, or whether High Churchmen were to be regarded as so tainted by their perceived tacit support for the ritualists that sharing platforms with them, even on matters in which they and Evangelicals were in agreement, was regarded as anathema. By the 1890s, Whisenant argues, Evangelicals were so divided, and there was frequently such personal antipathy between them, that their influence in the Church of England was so seriously weakened that they became marginalised for much of the twentieth century. The thesis is sound enough, and there is some useful detail not available in other recent books on ritualism, but it is weakened by the nature of its

presentation and a suspicion that important material, which might have served either to enhance or modify the arguments being put forward, has been overlooked. There is, surprisingly, no use of manuscript material, yet this clearly exists, both in the private papers of leading Evangelicals and in the surviving records of some of the Evangelical societies. Even the use of contemporary pamphlet and newspaper evidence has been highly selective; in the case of the latter this seems to be confined to *The Times* and only one of the Evangelical newspapers, *The Record*, when far more hostile anti-ritualist material was published in *The Rock*. The use of secondary material has also been very selective, with no work published later than 1997 being cited in the bibliography. The balance between text and notes is extraordinary. The latter comprise more than 50 per cent of the volume (271 pp. of notes compared to 216 pages of text, plus 34 pages of appendices comprising extracts from newspapers). The notes do not just provide references but include substantial discussion of matters which should either have been incorporated in the text or omitted altogether. This is a practice which even most PhD examiners would deprecate. Wellings also refers to the divisions among Evangelicals by the 1890s which Whisenant discusses but he sees them in a less negative light. Opposition to ritualism is only one aspect of his study. Here Wellings accepts that the divisions got worse after 1890, with even the Church Association being seen as too moderate, and the anti-ritualist fanatics finding a home in the Protestant Churchmen's Alliance. However, Wellings tries to set this aspect of Evangelicalism in a broader context, by examining three other areas in which Evangelicals began to take stances that eventually came to be defined as either 'conservative' or 'liberal'. These were their responses to the growth of biblical criticism, especially after the emergence of a 'liberal' High Church party following the publication of *Lux mundi*, to the theory of evolution and to other developments in liberal theology. Some Evangelicals maintained as consistent an opposition to these developments as they did to ritualism, but Wellings argues that there was a genuine intellectual strength in the group that came to be described as Liberal Evangelicals that had made a real contribution to the development not just of Evangelical, but of much broader Anglican, religious thought by the 1920s, and which in due course moved the main section of Anglican Evangelicals away from the narrow anti-ritualist agenda which had been their hallmark in the late nineteenth century. In doing so he seeks to disprove the allegation levelled against Evangelicals at the time, and accepted by others since, that they were 'an army of illiterates generalised by octogenarians'. In producing this important contribution to the study of Anglican Evangelicalism, Wellings has used a much wider range of sources than Whisenant, including much manuscript material and more up-to-date secondary literature. The notes are basically references and any temptation to be discursive has been wisely eschewed. The only slightly negative response, as far as this reviewer was concerned, was to the use of scriptural quotations under the chapter headings. Although Wellings's book has a polish that Whisenant's lacks, the latter is still a very useful contribution to Evangelical historiography and both books should be required reading for all those interested in the religious history of the period between 1850 and 1930.

*Ambassadors of Christ. Commemorating 150 years of theological education in Cuddesdon, 1854–2004.* By Mark D. Chapman. Pp. xiii + 229 incl. 20 ills. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £49.94 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). o 7546 3754 9; o 7546 3755 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905993287

Training ordination candidates for the Church of England has survived longer in Cuddesdon, a village a few miles out of Oxford, than anywhere else in England. The earliest tradition of training ordination candidates apart from the universities, in association with cathedrals, expired just after the earliest of such foundations reached their 150th anniversaries. Cuddesdon College was distinctive, founded as a diocesan seminary, safely away from the temptations of even a cathedral close, let alone a university, under the episcopal eye of Samuel Wilberforce, opposite his palace. This survival is commemorated by seven essays, and two appendices, reprinting sermons preached at college ‘festivals’ by distinguished former students, in 1958 by Archbishop Ramsey, and in 1966 by Owen Chadwick, who commemorated the centenary with his first publication, *The founding of Cuddesdon*, (Oxford 1954). The essays discuss the place of Cuddesdon in the history of English theological education; the foundation of Cuddesdon College in the context of two phases of the Anglican ritualist controversy; Samuel Wilberforce’s pastoral theology; the founding of Ripon Hall, with which Cuddesdon College was united at Cuddesdon in 1975, and the domination of the Hall for nearly fifty years by Henry Major, the key figure of ‘English liberal theology’ or Anglican modernism; the principalship of Archbishop Robert Runcie during the 1960s; and the period from the merger until the present.

Histories of institutions are difficult to write, especially for authors closely associated with them, and when volumes celebrate anniversaries. New light is shed on the curious character of Henry Major and Ripon Hall and Anglican modernism; and a little new light on Wilberforce’s foundation of the college and the hysterical evangelical attacks on Cuddesdon in the 1870s as a ‘chief nursery’ of an alleged conspiracy to subvert the principles of the Reformation; on attempts to reform the Church of England’s ordination training in the 1960s; and the recent history of the college. However, little sense is given of why this isolated, small and financially fragile institution was so significant in the history of the Church of England, training a significant proportion of its bishops, and why it was so revered by former students, including Archbishops Lang and Ramsey. Was it, as Chadwick pointed out in 1956, because the original teaching staff recognised in 1856 that the ‘success of a theological college would be moral and devotional rather than intellectual’? It was never distinguished for intellectual life. The biographer of Eric Graham (principal, 1929–42) noted that in 1942 he was using substantially the same lecture notes prepared in 1912 when he was vice-principal of Salisbury Theological College. What also of the influence of the local context: of Charles Gore, as vice-principal, founder of the Community of the Resurrection, and bishop of Oxford; of the proximity of the University of Oxford; of the Cowley motor works, and even Lady Ottoline Morrell, down the road at Garsington?

*The very rich hours of Jacques Maritain. A spiritual life.* By Ralph McInerny. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003. \$32. 0 268 04359 0

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905213295

Ralph McInerny is well placed to write this short intellectual biography of Maritain (1881–1973), being as he is director of the Jacques Maritain Centre at the University of Notre Dame – the institution to which Maritain left not only his connubial home in Princeton but also his heart (though despatch of the latter organ was impeded by the authorities of the Fifth French Republic). The book is simply written, not entering into sufficient conceptual complexity to satisfy an exigent student of Maritain’s thought. Nor does it have the biographical detail of Jean-Luc Barré’s 1995 *Life* of Jacques and Raïssa Maritain jointly. But if its aim is to reawaken interest in this now excessively neglected figure, it succeeds admirably. The author’s feeling not only for the man but for the work, and not only for the work but for its philosophical and cultural ambience, stimulates, informs, clarifies. McInerny does justice to all the chief aspects of Maritain’s many-sided achievement. That includes not only the attempt to write a fuller Thomistic aesthetics than any previous figure in that tradition. It embraces likewise the social and political writings, the moral philosophy, the metaphysics – controlled at first by a desire to go beyond Bergson and later to deflect attention from Sartre – and finally, at the end of Maritain’s life, the dogmatic theology produced under pressure of the crisis occasioned in the Roman Catholic Church by the Second Vatican Council (1962–5). McInerny’s familiarity with the considerable *corpus* (sixteen volumes in the posthumous Parisian *Oeuvres complètes*) enables him to offer the reader painlessly thumb-nail sketches of difficult books with great facility. The structure of his study is a Baroque conceit. Maritain’s life is divided up into seven segments, modelled on the Hours of the Roman liturgy (even the introduction is classed as an ‘invitatory’). Given the strongly liturgical temper of Maritain’s spirituality (despite his Thomist attachment to the Dominicans, he and his wife were Benedictine oblates), this is not so curious a procedure as it may sound. However, McInerny’s need to furnish occasional retrospects and anticipations somewhat mars the idea in its execution, and the early chapters contain occasional unnecessary doublets of material.

BLACKFRIARS,  
CAMBRIDGE

AIDAN NICHOLS

*Protestant Nonconformity in the twentieth century.* Edited by Alan P. F. Sell and Anthony R. Cross. Pp. x + 398 incl. 14 ills and 6 tables. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2003. £24.99 (paper). 1 84227 221 7

*Reformed ministry. Traditions of ministry and ordination in the United Reformed Church.* By Tony Tucker. Pp. viii + 206. London: United Reformed Church, 2003. £12.99 (paper). 0 85346 217 8

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905223291

*Protestant Nonconformity in the twentieth century* is a timely collection on a theme worthy of scholarly attention. Any edited volume with a chapter by either Clyde Binfield or David Bebbington is worth having, and one that has both is from editors who know how to assemble an all-star team. Indeed, one of the editors, Alan Sell, is himself a prolific, eminent scholar, and it is a real coup that he and Anthony Cross were able

to lure Keith Robbins, who has long had the whole of modern British history triumphantly at his command, back to the study of Nonconformity. Students of Welsh studies will know that D. Densil Morgan is an ideal scholar for an essay on the historiography of Nonconformity in twentieth-century Wales, and David Cornick, general secretary of the United Reformed Church, is as strong a contributor as one could imagine for the companion chapter on English historians. This still leaves six chapters whose contributors have not even been mentioned yet. Alan Ruston's piece on Nonconformist attitudes towards World War I, for example, is a compelling and insightful read.

This welcome volume's only flaw is a regrettable tendency to norm the conversation and categories by the Nonconformity of prior centuries. It is, to say the least, a missed opportunity that such a collection could endeavour to discuss the British Free Churches in the twentieth century while ignoring the Pentecostals, charismatic New Churches and the black Churches. Not a single chapter is given over to any branch of these growing and distinctively twentieth-century Churches, and Bebbington's essay is the only one that integrates them into a thematic discussion. Norman Wallwork's chapter on liturgy and worship, on the other hand, patiently documents Unitarian and Quaker developments while offering the reader no help in understanding the kind of hand-raising charismatic song worship that has influenced a significantly larger number of twentieth-century Nonconformists.

Thus nostalgia for Dissent as it once was seems to have undercut the full potential of this project. Two full chapters on historians arguably adds subtly to this impression: in previous centuries, Dissenters made things happen; in the twentieth, Nonconformists are reduced merely to chronicling that heritage. A chapter by Hugh R. Boudin on French-speaking Protestantism in Britain augments this tone. The fact that only a handful of small congregations are involved is not an argument against this subject deserving a chapter here. It is unfortunate, however, that what is said about them has so much to do with a world of Cartier commemorative badges and so little to do with one of Christian conversion. One story of effective Christian ministry to an ordinary person would have been more impressive than this procession of moments of official recognition from Anglican archbishops and Belgian royals.

The remarkable contribution that twentieth-century Nonconformists have made to biblical studies is put on display in a fine essay by John Tudno Williams. Here we can see the deep love of the Bible that has been a mark of Dissent paying real dividends in a galaxy of first-rate scholars including A. S. Peake, C. H. Dodd, T. W. Manson, James D. G. Dunn, H. Wheeler Robinson, F. F. Bruce and Morna Hooker. Likewise, Alan Sell reminds readers that Nonconformists need not be ashamed of a theological contribution that includes the likes of P. T. Forsyth, Lesslie Newbigin and Colin Gunton. Binfield offers astute observations on church architecture. Bebbington's piece on spirituality is a masterly survey of a vast terrain, bringing the whole history of the British Free Churches in the twentieth century within its compass. Ruston's sober lesson is that Nonconformists traded a moment of popularity for perpetual exile thereafter when they offered uncritical and enthusiastic support for the war effort in 1914.

A word must also be said in praise of Paternoster Press, the publisher of this volume. Paternoster has now fully emerged as a major publisher of superb, scholarly volumes of church history that are significantly cheaper than the standard prices set by university presses: long may it flourish.



The final essay in *Protestant Nonconformity in the twentieth century* is a solid treatment of the theme of ecumenism by John A. Newton. As the greatest success to report in that area is the unifying of three traditions (Presbyterian, Congregational and Churches of Christ) into the United Reformed Church, Newton's essay provides a fitting bridge to Tony Tucker's book. *Reformed ministry: traditions of ministry and ordination in the United Reformed Church* tells the story of an earnest, heartfelt and successful effort to take seriously Christ's prayer that 'they all may be one'. Tucker provides a clear account of that process and what was at stake in it, with special reference to the United Reformed Church's understanding of the nature of ordained Christian ministry.

Although ecumenism is the overt theme, it is clear that this is also a tale of the triumph of Presbyterianism. The United Reformed Church (URC) is not so much a merger as a friendly take over. The Congregationalists who joined the URC decided that Congregationalism was no longer a *raison d'être* worth maintaining. Likewise, the congregations from the Churches of Christ who threw their lot in with this venture were led by ministers who had abandoned their distinctive adoption of a discernible, specific New Testament pattern for church life. The polity of the URC is pure Presbyterianism, consisting of the standard tiers including the presbytery, the provincial synod and the general assembly. Reformed theology also set the standards for the new denomination's understanding of ministry. This theological and ecclesiological dominance by one of the three traditions is so blatant that Tucker, in an apparently desperate search for some compromise that the Presbyterians made, is reduced to crediting their willingness to put up with being members of an enlarged denomination.

The champions of unity were right to insist that Christians from diverse traditions had much to learn from each other. It was surely wrongheaded of Congregationalists, for example, to have been more anti-Catholic than biblical in their aversion to the laying on of hands in ordination. One does also wonder, however, if their Anabaptist strain really had nothing to teach Calvinists. The United Reformed Church may justly take pride in having sounded a credible, prophetic call for all Christians to work toward visible unity. A great URC minister, the late Lesslie Newbigin, reminded us in the title of his autobiography that there is still an 'Unfinished Agenda'.

WHEATON COLLEGE,  
ILLINOIS

TIMOTHY LARSEN

*William Sloane Coffin Jr. A holy impatience.* By Warren Goldstein. Pp. xv + 379 incl. 15 ills.

New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004. £20. 0 300 10221 6

*The history of the Riverside Church in the city of New York.* By Peter J. Paris, John W. Cook, James Hudnut-Beumler, Lawrence H. Mamiya, Leonora Tubbs Tisdale and Judith Weisenfeld. (foreword Martin E. Marty). (Religion, Race, and Ethnicity.)

Pp. xiv + 350 incl. 46 figs and 5 tables. New York–London: New York University Press, 2004. \$29.95. 0 8147 6713 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905233298

No subjects within American religious history have a greater reputation for hagiography than institutional histories of prominent congregations or the

biographies of well-known theologians. *The history of the Riverside Church in the city of New York* and *William Sloane Coffin Jr: a holy impatience* successfully demonstrate that both subjects can offer constructively critical appraisals of even the most prominent churches and revered figures in 'mainline' American Protestantism today. As the title suggests, the former volume explores the history of Riverside Church. In the first essay, James Hudnut-Beumler sets the context for the subsequent chapters by providing an overview of Riverside's history. He contends that Riverside Church not only reflected the story of twentieth-century American Protestantism but often had a leading hand in crafting the way that liberal American Protestants thought, worshipped and responded to their times. The following chapters go on to examine particular aspects of Riverside's history. Leonora Tubbs Tisdale explores the preaching of Harry Emerson Fosdick, and that of his four successors – Robert James McCracken, Ernest T. Campbell, William Sloane Coffin, Jr, and James A. Forbes, Jr. John Wesley Cook analyses the architectural history of the church. Peter Paris offers an ethical assessment of its public witness and Lawrence Mamiya dissects the spiritual life of the various groups within the congregation. While clearly appreciative of the mission and ministry of Riverside Church, each of these insightful essays offers a frank assessment of controversies within the church and ways in which the congregation sometimes failed to live up to its own stated goals and values.

Goldstein's biography of William Sloane Coffin, Jr, offers an equally candid evaluation of the life and ministry of one of American Protestantism's twentieth-century superstars. Drawing upon a wealth of published sources, and more than three dozen interviews with Coffin himself as well as a number of his friends and allies, Goldstein recounts Coffin's privileged childhood, early music education in Europe, college days at Yale, service in the infantry during World War II, dramatic decision to attend Union Theological Seminary in New York, equally dramatic decision to drop out and work as a CIA agent in Europe at the height of the Cold War, return to Yale Divinity School and early ministry at Andover and Williams College. Perhaps the most engaging section of the work are those chapters devoted to Coffin's participation in the Civil Rights movement and his anti-Vietnam war activities that nearly landed him in jail. To be sure, Goldstein is very attentive to the theological rationale that Coffin offered for his activities. Yet he does seem at times to accept uncritically Coffin's own conviction that his actions were based on 'fundamental, unimpeachable Christian principles' (p. 321) when in fact there was a great deal of debate in his own day over his interpretation of what were fundamental Christian principles and how they applied to a society divided by race, war and sexual orientation. None the less, Goldstein captures the spirit that moved Coffin so deeply. Like the *History of Riverside Church*, Goldstein does not quietly step by those less than unimpeachable aspects of Coffin's life, such as his tumultuous marriages or his sometimes unhappy ministry at Riverside. Coffin lived a remarkable and controversial life and Goldstein recounts it very well. Eschewing hagiography, these two engagingly-written studies examine the world's most prominent institutional expression of Protestant liberalism and one of twentieth-century liberal Protestantism's most passionate preachers. Together, they both make a substantial contribution to the history of Protestantism in twentieth-century America.

*A century of theological and religious studies in Britain.* Edited by Ernest Nicholson.

Pp. x + 306. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the British Academy), 2003.

£40. 0 19 726305 4

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905243294

This volume is one of a series published to mark the centenary of the British Academy. Its aim is to review the contribution of British scholars, especially Fellows of the British Academy, to theological and religious studies over the last hundred years. The editor contributes an introductory essay which sets the scene at the foundation of the British Academy and sketches developments since. This is followed by ten chapters, each covering a major area of study. The ten authors, nine of them Fellows themselves, have all made significant contributions in their own fields and are well placed to provide a critical overview. Although the focus of attention is British scholarship, it is impossible to divorce academic work in the United Kingdom from academic work elsewhere in Europe and in the United States, and several of the contributions provide brief reviews of significant developments and significant activity from elsewhere. Together they demonstrate clearly the international, interdisciplinary nature and complexity of current religious studies, noted in the editor's introduction, in contrast to the relative insularity and narrow specialisms of the early part of the twentieth century. The wide range of the volume encourages the reader to make interesting connections between currents of thought in apparently disparate areas, stimulating further interdisciplinary enquiry. It is perhaps a sign of the changes of recent decades that the chapters on philosophy of religion and world religions have least to say about British scholarship and most to say about wider currents of thought. Several of the essays voice concern about a steady decline in the flow of new British students into the fields reviewed, and their poor preparation for study at higher levels, while noting the presence in Britain of large numbers of overseas graduate students of high quality. This handsome volume celebrates what the editor sees as a century of work on new sources, new developments and new currents of thought, and demonstrates the significant contribution of British scholars to that work. One is left to wonder whether the same level of achievement in these disciplines will be celebrated after another hundred years.

DURHAM

CHRIS WILTHER

*Cinquant'anni di vita della Rivista di storia della chiesa in Italia. Atti del convegno di studio*

(Roma, 8–10 settembre 1999). By Pietro Zerbi. (Italia Sacra. Studi e Documenti di Storia Ecclesiastica, 71.) Pp. xi + 304. Rome: Herder, 2003. €45 (paper).

88 85876 74 9

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905253290

This volume celebrates the fiftieth anniversary of the *Rivista di storia della chiesa in Italia*, first published in 1947, the oldest Italian review specifically dedicated to ecclesiastical and religious history. It includes articles on other Italian reviews in this field. Although the quality of the contributions is mixed, by virtue of its coverage the volume gives a tolerable idea of developments in the aforementioned field in Italy since World War II. The Rome-based *RSCI*, from the beginning, had close connections with the Lateran Seminary and with the Vatican library and archive, enjoying the protection of the Vatican deputy secretary of state, Monsignor

Giovanni Montini. The journal, as the contributors to this volume generally admit, has been historiographically conservative. Initially its articles were predominantly on the institutional history of the Catholic Church, focused on fairly narrowly-defined topics and based on workmanlike archive studies or philological investigation. However, the scope of reviews was always wider, while the remarkable bibliographical section has always provided an ample panorama of international studies on the Church and on religion in Italy. Gradually, the thematic scope of articles in the journal became enlarged, but the lead in general historiographical discussion and broad syntheses, in studies of piety and religious practice, of lay movements and of religious literature has been taken by other reviews. Two of the most notable, among those dedicated to religious history, are examined here: the Torinese *Rivista di storia e letteratura religiosa* (1971–), founded by the progressive cleric Michele Pellegrino, subsequently archbishop of Turin, and a group of professors of the city's university, and *Cristianesimo nella storia* (1980–), the journal of the highly distinguished Bolognese Istituto per le Scienze Religiose.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

OLIVER LOGAN

*Die Glaubensgemeinschaft der Zeugen Jehovas während der SED-Diktatur. Unter besonderer Berücksichtigung ihrer Observierung und Unterdrückung durch das Ministerium für Staatssicherheit.* By Waldemar Hirsch. (Europäische Hochschulschriften, Ser. 3. Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften, 980.) Pp. 431. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2003. €45 (paper). 3 631 51620 7; 0531 7320  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905263297

Waldemar Hirsch presented this doctoral dissertation in 2003 to the Fernuniversität in Hagen. It is one of a number of works dealing with the activities of Jehovah's Witnesses in the German Democratic Republic which have appeared in recent years. In the first half of the book Hirsch discusses the German operations of the New York-based Watchtower Bible and Tract Society, which ran offices in West Berlin and Wiesbaden. In the second half he focuses on the newsletter *Christliche Verantwortung* (Christian Responsibility) which the East German State Security Police (the Stasi) created to sow seeds of discord and confusion among the ranks of the Witnesses. Hirsch shows how the Stasi sought to control the spread of anti-communist Watchtower literature, to infiltrate the organisation, to cut off East German groups from their headquarters in the west, to gain the support of Witnesses for the option of conscientious objection and, finally, to establish alternative organisations for disaffected Witnesses. According to his analysis the newsletter was a key to achieving these aims. Given the resources placed at their disposal it is surprising that the Stasi only partially achieved any of its goals. The number of adherents to the Watchtower organisation remained remarkably stable throughout the period of dictatorship. For Hirsch this is testimony to the power of the Witnesses' religious ideals and values. Statistically the Witnesses fared much better than the mainstream Churches. True to the ideology of the Witnesses, Hirsch considers the Churches to have been 'useful idiots' of an evil system. He maintains that the Churches actually shared common goals with the Stasi. On this point his argument is unconvincing. The dozens of typing mistakes, misprints and irritating gaps in the text, which disfigure every part of this book, together with a large amount of poorly organised material, make this

study a difficult read. The long list of abbreviations is nevertheless incomplete and, oddly, 'OV' is explained with another abbreviation – 'NSDAP'. Hirsch even manages to misspell the name of the American founder of the Watchtower society at least seven times. One is left with the distinct impression that the first draft of the dissertation has been published by mistake.

In spite of these blemishes Hirsch's study, which highlights the limits of the East German variant of totalitarianism, is a useful addition to the growing number of studies on religion in the GDR. Readers interested in the Jehovah's Witnesses may, however, wish first to consider Gerald Hacke's much more readable, concise and coherent study which the Hannah Arendt Institute published in 2000 (and which is listed twice in Hirsch's bibliography).

UNIVERSITY OF ULSTER

NICHOLAS M. RAILTON